

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review

Wednesday, July 7, 2021

7:00 p.m, Council Chambers, City Hall

301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Zoom Registration URL: https://zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_U9p4_PQ5S_OWGQ2iwfhUeA

Hybrid Meeting

Members Present: James Spencer, Vice Chair
Purvi Irwin
John Sprinkle
Lynn Neihardt
Christine Sennott

Members Absent: Christine Roberts, Chair
Robert Adams

Secretary: William Conkey, AIA, Historic Preservation Architect

Staff Present: Susan Hellman, Historic Preservation Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

The Board of Architectural Review hybrid hearing was called to order at 7:00 p.m. Ms. Roberts and Mr. Adams were absent. All other members were present in person.

II. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the **June 16, 2021** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Ms. Neihardt and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes from the June 16, 2021 meeting, as submitted.

III. CONSENT CALENDAR

3. BAR #2021-00310 OHAD

Request for alterations to previously approved plans at 1 Pioneer Mill Way (used and owned by 314 Strand Street, Parcel ID 075.03-04-39) (formerly 2 Duke Street), Robinson Terminal South
Applicant: RT Waterfront Associates LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Ms. Neihardt and seconded by Ms. Sennott, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00310, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

IV. ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

4. BAR #2021-00023 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 314 Commerce Street.

Applicants: John and Emily Galer

5. BAR #2021-00020 OHAD

Request for alterations at 314 Commerce Street.

Applicants: John and Emily Galer

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00020 and BAR #2021-00023, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 4-0. Ms. Sennott recused herself.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

None

REASON

The Board agreed with staff that the proposal adhered to the Design Guidelines and was appropriate for this property.

SPEAKERS

Nathan Moore, architect, gave a presentation and was available to answer questions.

John Galer, owner, also gave a presentation and was available to answer questions.

Ayana Close, 316 Commerce Street, spoke in support of the application.

Gail Rothrock, 209 Duke Street, spoke in support of the application and recommended that the BAR Design Guideline committee review guidelines for roof decks.

Steve Milone, 907 Prince Street, agreed with Ms. Rothrock's observation about the Design Guideline committee, and wondered if the design meets Code requirements.

Tim Foley, 310 Commerce Street, spoke in opposition to the project, claiming that the project will negatively affect him.

Mary Gardener, 211 South West Street, spoke in opposition to the project due to concerns about possible privacy issues.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Neihardt expressed no concerns with the application and agreed with Ms. Rothrock regarding the Design Guidelines committee.

Ms. Irwin thanked the applicant/architect for a thorough and helpful presentation. In response to

some of those opposed to the project, she noted that the parking lot of the Shiloh Baptist Church is far more detrimental to the church than this proposed deck. She also observed that the deck would present no more privacy issues than second-floor windows. She supported the application as submitted, stating that the deck on this non-historic building will be minimally visible.

Mr. Sprinkle agreed with Ms. Irwin, also indicating that the BAR has limited power to address privacy issues.

Mr. Spencer also agreed with Ms. Irwin, stating that second-floor windows are far more an invasion of privacy than this deck, and that the deck will be minimally visible from any public right of way.

Deferred From This Hearing.

6. BAR #2021-00236 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 413 North Washington Street.

Applicant: Anne Toth

7. BAR #2021-00261 OHAD

Request for alterations and Waiver of Rooftop HVAC Screening Requirement at 413 North Washington Street.

Applicant: Anne Toth

BOARD ACTION: Deferred

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of BAR #2021-00236 and BAR #2021-00261.

8. BAR #2020-00533 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 108 Gibbon Street.

Applicants: Benedict and Carol Capuco

9. BAR #2020-00532 OHAD

Request for alterations at 108 Gibbon Street.

Applicants: Benedict and Carol Capuco

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Ms. Sennott and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00532 and BAR #2021-00533, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The applicant submit updated window specifications with the building permit to confirm that the proposed windows meet the Alexandria New and Replacement Window Performance Specifications in the Historic District.
2. The fiber cement siding is to be painted, with a smooth finish.

REASON

The Board agreed with staff recommendations.

SPEAKERS

Benedict Capuco, owner, gave a brief presentation and was available to answer questions.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Sennott stated that she likes the modifications from the prior submission. It fits in with the architecture, is not very visible from public rights of way, and is more balanced.

Ms. Irwin agreed with Ms. Sennott. She found it odd that the dormer windows do not relate to the windows on the lower levels, but generally supports the application.

Ms. Neihardt said she appreciates the changes and supports the design.

Mr. Sprinkle said he supports the changes.

Mr. Spencer agreed with the other Board members' comments.

V. NEW BUSINESS

10. BAR #2021-00278 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 706 North Washington Street (Parcel Map ID: 054.04-08-15).

Applicant: 700 N. Washington St. LLC

11. BAR #2021-00285 OHAD

Request for alterations 706 North Washington Street (Parcel Map ID: 054.04-08-15).

Applicant: 700 N. Washington St. LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve a portion of BAR #2021-00278 and BAR #2021-00285, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0. Mr. Sprinkle recused himself.

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of a portion of BAR #2021-00278 and BAR #2021-00285.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Defer modifications to the bay and move forward with enlarging the entry door.

REASON

The Board felt that the proposed design of the bay needed refinement.

SPEAKERS

Mike Ernst, architect, represented the applicant and was available to answer questions.

Rafat Mahmood, the applicant, was available to answer questions.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Irwin agreed with the staff that the proposed design disrupted the symmetry of the building.

Ms. Roberts agreed with Ms. Irwin.

Ms. Neihardt felt that the building does not need symmetry and that the proposed design is appropriate.

Mr. Spencer agreed that the bays on the building are symmetrical but noted that they are not very prominent features so symmetry may not matter.

Ms. Irwin suggested making the bay more pronounced and different so that the design looks intentional and not like a design error.

Mr. Spencer suggested removing the cast stone between the windows, but Mr. Ernst said that would not be possible for structural reasons.

Ms. Neihardt noted that the Board cannot consider financial considerations and that she supports Ms. Irwin's recommendation to make the design of the bay more prominent/intentional.

12. BAR #2021-00298 OHAD

Request for alterations at 601 South Washington Street.

Applicant: 601 South Washington LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00298, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 4-0. Mr. Sprinkle recused himself.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Replacement shutters must be wood, sized to fit the opening, and operable;
2. Prior to submitting for the building permit, the applicant should submit details of the tooth in of the building corner on the east elevation of 607 S. Washington for staff review; and,
3. The new and replacement windows must comply with the *Alexandria New and Replacement Window Performance Specifications in the Historic Districts*. The applicant must submit specifications with the building permit.

REASON

The Board agreed with staff recommendations.

SPEAKERS

Mike Ernst, Architect, available for questions

DISCUSSION

Ms. Irwin asked for clarification on the age of the garden wall and suggested that a portion of the wall remain.

Ms. Sennott supports keeping a section of the wall.

Ms. Neihardt supports the application.

13. BAR #2021-00303 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 607 South Washington Street.
Applicant: Stevens Companies LLC

14. BAR #2021-00299 OHAD

Request for alterations at 607 South Washington Street.
Applicant: Stevens Companies LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Sennott, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00299 and BAR #2021-00303, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 4-0. Mr. Sprinkle recused himself.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Replacement shutters must be wood, sized to fit the opening, and operable;
2. Prior to submitting for the building permit, the applicant should submit details of the tooth in of the building corner on the east elevation of 607 S. Washington for staff review; and,
3. The new and replacement windows must comply with the *Alexandria New and Replacement Window Performance Specifications in the Historic Districts*. The applicant must submit specifications with the building permit.

REASON

The Board agreed with staff recommendations.

SPEAKERS

Mike Ernst, Architect, available for questions

DISCUSSION

Ms. Irwin asked for clarification on the age of the garden wall and suggested that a portion of the wall remain.

Ms. Sennott supports keeping a section of the wall.

Ms. Neihardt supports the application.

15. BAR #2021-00284 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 620 South Saint Asaph Street.
Applicants: Todd and Vanessa Veazie

16. BAR #2021-00282 OHAD

Request for addition and alterations at 620 South Saint Asaph Street.
Applicants: Todd and Vanessa Veazie

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted

to approve BAR #2021-00282 and BAR #2021-00284, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Siding on the addition be the Boral shiplap siding specified in the application documents;
2. New windows be aluminum-clad wood.
3. Include the statements from Alexandria Archaeology, below, in the General Notes of all on all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board agreed with staff recommendations.

SPEAKERS

Robert Guynn and Georgette Diaz, project architects, were available to answer questions. They stated that they agreed with staff recommendations.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Sprinkle reminded the applicants to follow the recommendations of Alexandria Archaeology.

Ms. Neihardt observed that the proposed addition will be minimally visible from any public right of way.

Ms. Sennott praised the design and agreed that the proposed addition will be minimally visible.

Ms. Irwin also praised the design.

17. BAR #2021-00292 OHAD

Request for alterations at 1015 Duke Street.

Applicants: Patrick and Maryam Jansen

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Sennott, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00292, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That the applicant work with staff to repair the wall and to properly cleanup the mortar;
2. That the applicant clean up the mortar on the neighbor's property if access is granted; and,
3. That the gate is replaced per the staff recommendation.

REASON

While the Board was displeased that the applicant installed the wall without BAR approval, had the applicant approached staff prior to its installation, the wall/gate could have been approved administratively.

SPEAKERS

Patrick Jansen, applicant, presented the application and answered questions. Mr. Jansen said that inspectors examined the construction of the wall.

William Karl, 1017 Duke, noted that the wall was touching his property and that there was a pending lawsuit with the City and that he didn't think the case should be at the BAR.

Helena Choi, 1017 Duke, noted that the previous gate was in good condition and that the wall was touching 1017 Duke Street.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Sprinkle noted that the previous wood gate was attached to the neighbor's property. Ms. Sennott and Ms. Neihardt both expressed dismay that the wall/gate was installed without approval. Ms. Irwin said that the pointing on the wall was poorly done and should be repaired. Vice-Chair Spencer said that the property line issue was not under the BAR purview.

Deferred From This Hearing.

18. BAR #2021-00235 PG

Request for new construction at 1117 Queen Street.

Applicants: Robert and Kathy Bunn

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of BAR #2021-00235.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

19. Review recommendations from the Board of Architectural Review (BAR) Bylaws Committee. The Board will vote on the following changes to the BAR bylaws:

Section 1, Officers, has been amended to include the following: Elected officers shall be limited to three consecutive, one-year terms.

Section 2, Duties of Officers, has been amended to allow the Chair to choose an interim Vice Chair in the event the Vice Chair shall for any reason be no longer able to perform the duties of the office.

Section 3, Committee and Representatives, has been amended to permit the Board to appoint temporary committees as the Board sees fit.

Article II, Section 5, Passage of Motions, has been amended to delete the requirement that the Board shall state its reasons in writing for denying any item or for taking any action that differs from the staff's recommendation. Staff prepares the written summary of the motions.

Article III, Order of Business. The word "Board" has been removed from sentences discussing the "Board Chair," as it is superfluous.

Article V, Hearing Procedure, is a new addition that summarizes how hearings on items for discussion shall occur.

Article VII, Continuing Education, is a new addition that explains the necessary continuing education or professional training required by the Virginia Department of Historic Resources for members of Architectural Review Boards of Certified Local Governments.

On a motion by Ms. Sennott and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the updated Bylaws, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following projects were administratively approved since the last BAR meeting:

BAR #2021-00204 OHAD

Request for window and door replacement at 1301 Prince Street.

Applicant: Michael Kidder

BAR #2021-00263 PG

Request for window replacement at 1118 Princess Street.

Applicant: Jorge Suarez

BAR #2021-00267 OHAD

Request for roof replacement at 2 Franklin Street.

Applicant: Sue Whalen

BAR #2021-00294 PG

Request for accessory structure at 237 North West Street.

Applicant: Sterling Munro

BAR #2021-00300 PG

Request for fencing installation at 1020 Queen Street.

Applicant: Adam Hernandez

BAR #2021-00311 OHAD
Request for roof replacement at 831 South Fairfax Street.
Applicants: John Anderson and Elaine Johnson

BAR #2021-00315 PG
Request for roof replacement at 1208 Princess Street.
Applicant: Samuel Moore

BAR #2021-00317 OHAD
Request for alterations at 212 North Pitt Street.
Applicant: Karen Thuermer

BAR #2021-00231 OHAD
Request for door replacement at 144 North Union Street.
Applicant: Lawrence Aitcheson

BAR #2021-00322 PG
Request for repointing at 128 North Fayette Street.
Applicant: Lois Delaney

BAR #2021-00323 PG
Request for siding replacement at 613 North Alfred Street.
Applicant: Nathanael Fye

BAR #2021-00325 PG
Request for roof replacement at 636 North Patrick Street.
Applicant: Felicia James

BAR #2021-00328 OHAD
Request for alterations at 1212 King Street.
Applicant: Leona Lemeschewsky

BAR #2021-00330 OHAD
Request for fencing installation at 614 Oronoco Street.
Applicant: Virginia Trust for Historic Preservation

BAR #2021-00333 PG
Request for roof replacement at 116 North Columbus Street.
Applicant: Edward Roden

BAR #2021-00338 OHAD
Request for alterations at 322 South Union Street.
Applicant: Jane Casey

BAR #2021-00339 OHAD
Request for masonry repair at 115 South Columbus Street.
Applicant: Patrick Camus

BAR #2021-00351 OHAD

Request for alterations at 214 Wilkes Street.

Applicant: Stewart Economou

BAR #2021-00358 PG

Request for fencing replacement at 613 North Alfred Street.

Applicant: Nathanael Fye

BAR #2021-00361 PG

Request for fencing installation at 611 North Alfred Street.

Applicant: Domestic Renovations, LLC