

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review

Wednesday, April 21, 2021

7:00 p.m., Virtual Public Hearing

Zoom Webinar

Members Present: Christine Roberts, Chair
James Spencer, Vice Chair
Purvi Irwin
John Sprinkle
Lynn Neihardt

Members Absent: Christine Sennott
Robert Adams

Secretary: William Conkey, AIA, Historic Preservation Architect

Staff Present: Susan Hellman, Historic Preservation Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was called to order at 7:00 p.m. Ms. Sennott and Mr. Adams were absent. All other members were present at the meeting by video conference.

Ms. Roberts stated that Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic emergency, the April 21, 2021 meeting of the Board of Architectural Review (BAR) is being held electronically pursuant to Virginia Code Section 2.2 3708.2(A)(3), the Continuity of Government ordinance adopted by the City Council on June 20, 2020 or Section 4-0.01(g) in HB29 and HB30, enacted by the 2020 Virginia General Assembly (Virginia Acts of Assembly Ch. 1283 and 1289), to undertake essential business. BAR board members and staff are participating from remote locations through Zoom Webinar. The meeting can be accessed by the public through broadcasted live on the government channel 70, streaming on the City's website and can be accessed via Zoom hyperlink on the docket.

II. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the **April 7, 2021** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes from the April 7, 2021 meeting, as amended.

III. DEFERRED FROM THIS HEARING

3. **BAR #2021-00143 PG**

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 425 North Alfred Street.
Applicant: 425 North Alfred Street, LLC

4. BAR #2021-00142 PG

Request for alterations at 425 North Alfred Street.
Applicant: 425 North Alfred Street, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Deferred

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of BAR #2021-00142 and BAR #2021-00143.

5. BAR #2021-00139 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 24 Wolfe Street.
Applicant: 55 LLC

6. BAR #2021-00140 OHAD

Request for alterations at 24 Wolfe Street.
Applicant: 55 LLC

BOARD ACTION: Deferred

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of BAR #2021-00139 and BAR #2021-00140.

IV. ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

7. BAR #2021-00088 OHAD

Request for alterations at 720 South Alfred Street.
Applicants: Mary Ritley-White and TJ White

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00088, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Approved with the recommendation that when replacing the front door in the future, but before the property changes hands, the replacement be a six-panel door to match the original.

REASON

The Board felt that staff's recommendation was too broad and difficult to enforce. However, the Board found that the replacement door design is not too modern, nor does it conflict with the building's architecture, which otherwise would require immediate replacement.

SPEAKERS

Ms. Ritley-White, the property owner was available to answer questions.

Ms. R.L. Sheedy, 1311 Prince, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke against

staff's recommendation. She stated that allowing after-the-fact work to remain sets a bad precedent and discourages property owners to do the right thing. She also said that staff should send out more information more frequently about the Design Guidelines and BAR procedures to property owners in the historic districts, so they become familiar with the requirements and process.

DISCUSSION

The Board found it odd that they have been seen so many after-the-fact applications for properties in this block. In general, the Board found that the houses in this neighborhood have changed throughout the years, and it is difficult to enforce small changes such as doors or windows replaced several years ago.

Ms. Roberts acknowledged Ms. Sheedy's concerns and agreed that staff should do more outreach work.

Ms. Irwin stated that she walked around the block and noticed that only one house has its original windows, and that most houses have replacement doors and windows. She also said that the subject property door replacement is not too modern or incompatible with the building's architecture; therefore, she was fine with staff's recommendation.

Mr. Spencer agreed with Ms. Irwin but suggested a timeline for the door to be replaced since properties change hands often and it would be difficult to enforce the compliance of the recommendation. Mr. Spencer's suggestion was accepted as a motion amendment which was approved unanimously.

8. BAR #2021-00098 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ encapsulation at 119 South Fairfax Street.
Applicant: A.L. Freed Railroad Development, LLC

9. BAR #2021-00081 OHAD

Request for addition and alterations at 119 South Fairfax Street.
Applicant: A.L. Freed Railroad Development, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00081 and BAR #2021-00098, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Historic bricks may be used to construct the addition provided it has modern brick detailing and a date stone;
2. That the adjacent property owner at 117 S. Fairfax Street be permitted to repoint the south wall of their property and that it be completed in a timely manner, prior to the start of construction on the subject property;
3. That the gap created between 117 and 119 S. Fairfax Street be weather proofed;
4. Work with staff on the structural connection to the existing historic building;

5. Include the statements from Alexandria Archaeology, below, in the General Notes of all on all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board felt that the addition was stylistically appropriate but added conditions to ensure that the addition clearly reads as an early addition, allowing for the use of historic bricks but recommending modern brick detailing and a date stone. The Board felt that the amount of demolition was very minimal and allowed for a “light touch” on the historic building.

SPEAKERS

Bill Cromley, representing the applicant, described the project and spoke in support of the project.

Minturn Wright, 124 S. Royal Street, speaking on behalf of 117 S. Fairfax St., said that the south wall of 117 needs to be repaired before construction begins.

Gail Rothrock, HAF, spoke in opposition to the project because it did not meet the Demolition criteria and that the addition was not consistent with requirements for new construction.

Yvonne Callahan, 724 S. Lee Street, said that she had questions about the status of the private alley and believed it may instead be considered a public alley.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Cromley said that the owners of 117 S. Fairfax would be able to repoint/repair their wall before construction begins on the project and that he didn’t object to the alley becoming public in the future. Mr. Cromley said that it was his intent to use historic salvaged brick on the addition.

Mr. Sprinkle asked about visibility from the fire station because it was a publicly owned building and noted that the design of the addition responds to the context. He said that he liked the use of historic bricks but suggested some variation in mortar color or profile to distinguish the new addition.

Ms. Irwin said that the design is representative of a historic building but the use of historic brick may give the false impression that the new addition is actually historic. She said the building should read as a later, contemporary addition.

Ms. Sennot said that she appreciated the use of historic brick and suggested that a date stone be installed to identify the addition as new construction.

Ms. Neihardt said that she liked the addition and the minimal amount of demolition.

Mr. Spencer suggested using jack arches, not headers, to distinguish the new addition.

V. NEW BUSINESS

10. BAR #2021-00158 OHAD

Request for alterations at 714 South Alfred Street.

Applicant: Lauren Oliphant

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended

On a motion by Mr. Spencer and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2021-00158, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The applicant must either replace the first-floor window with an SDL tripartite window with vertical muntins or replace all windows with a configuration matching the original steel casement. If windows are replaced to replicate the original, they may be fiberglass or aluminum. The upper windows may remain as is until replaced or the property is sold. Any future replacement windows must comply with Board of Architectural Review *Design Guidelines*.

REASON

The Board heard a similar case at the previous hearing for the property next door and wanted to be consistent with that case. They therefore made the same recommendations.

SPEAKERS

The applicant was available to answer questions. She noted that when she purchased the property in October of 2020 the existing windows were in place. She contacted two previous owners who did not know when these windows were installed.

R.L. Sheedy, 1311 Prince, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, expressed frustration at the increase in after-the-fact applications and recommended that staff provide more frequent notification to property owners that they are in a historic district and must follow district guidelines.

DISCUSSION

Several Board members discussed Ms. Sheedy's opinion regarding historic district notification.

The Chair and Ms. Irwin noted that they had visited the neighborhood and found its variety interesting.

Ms. Neihardt felt that, to be equitable, this applicant should have to comply with the same conditions as the applicant for 712 South Alfred. Mr. Spencer agreed.

Ms. Irwin said she thought that the applicant should be permitted to return the windows to their original configuration. These windows could be aluminum or fiberglass – not necessarily steel.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

11. Review small cell policy.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 9:32 p.m.

VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following projects were administratively approved since the last BAR meeting:

BAR #2021-00082 OHAD
Request for fencing at 1005 Duke Street.
Applicant: Leo Metz

BAR #2021-00133 OHAD
Request for window replacement at 705 Ford's Landing Way.
Applicant: Leslie Beavers

BAR #2021-00149 PG
Request for alterations at 425 North Alfred Street.
Applicant: 425 N ALFRED ST LLC

BAR #2021-00153 OHAD
Request for gate replacement at 1011 Duke Street.
Applicants: Kristen Brady and Kumar Patel

BAR #2021-00155 OHAD
Request for window replacement at 805 Chetworth Place.
Applicant: Andrew Scott

BAR #2021-00157 PG
Request for window replacement at 602 North Columbus Street.
Applicant: M&M Building Investments

BAR #2021-00160 OHAD
Request for repointing at 229 South Payne Street.
Applicant: Alan Young

BAR #2021-00162 OHAD
Request for repointing at 313 Queen Street.
Applicant: Marti Kubik

BAR #2021-00163 PG
Request for siding replacement at 418 North Payne Street.
Applicant: Kevin Williamson

BAR #2021-00164 OHAD
Request for alterations at 736 Ford's Landing Way.
Applicant: Sara Chadason

BAR #2021-00169 PG
Request for roof replacement at 322 North Columbus Street.
Applicant: James Foggo

BAR #2021-00171 OHAD
Request for roof replacement at 605 South Lee Street.
Applicant: Mary Page Hickey

BAR #2021-00172 OHAD
Request for roof replacement at 222 South Alfred Street.
Applicant: John Weyrich

BAR #2021-00173 OHAD
Request for roof replacement at 827 South Royal Street.
Applicant: Michael Courtney

BAR #2021-00176 OHAD
Request for window replacement at 401 North Lee Street.
Applicant: Lisa Blumerman

BAR #2021-00181 OHAD
Request for alterations at 109 Duke Street.
Applicant: Martha Peterson

BAR #2021-00182 OHAD
Request for alterations at 127 North Washington Street.
Applicant: Lori Alexander

BAR #2021-00184 OHAD
Request for siding replacement at 404 Gibbon Street.
Applicant: Chris Kurowski

BAR #2021-00189 PG
Request for signage at 809 Cameron Street.
Applicant: Jessica Hill

BAR #2021-00190 OHAD
Request for shed installation at 116 South Payne Street.
Applicant: Barry Stauffer