

**\*\*\*\*\*DRAFT MINUTES\*\*\*\*\***  
Board of Architectural Review  
**Wednesday, February 5, 2020**  
7:00pm, Council Chambers, City Hall  
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: James Spencer, Vice Chair  
Lynn Neihardt  
Bill Conkey  
Robert Adams  
Purvi Irwin

Members Absent: John Sprinkle  
Christine Roberts, Chair

Staff Present: Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager  
Stephanie Sample, Historic Preservation Principal Planner

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was called to order at 7:00 p.m. Mr. Sprinkle & Ms. Roberts were excused. All other members were present.

**II. MINUTES**

2. Consideration of the minutes from the **January 8, 2020** public hearing.

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted, 5-0**

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes from the January 8, 2020, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

3. Consideration of the minutes from the **January 22, 2020** public hearing.

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted, 5-0**

On a motion by Ms. Neihardt and seconded by Mr. Conkey, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes from the January 22, 2020, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

**III. CONSENT CALENDAR**

4. **BAR #2019-00535 OHAD**

Request for alterations at 105 King Street

Applicant: Dewey Investment Associates

**BOARD ACTION: Deferred**

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of BAR #2019-0053 due to improper notice.

**IV. NEW BUSINESS**

**5. BAR #2020-00006 OHAD**

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 128 North Pitt Street  
Applicants: Martin O. Kamm & Eva M. Martorell Gil

**6. BAR #2020-00007 OHAD**

Request for addition and alterations at 128 North Pitt Street  
Applicants: Martin O. Kamm & Eva M. Martorell Gil

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended**

On a motion by Mr. Adams and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2020-00006 & BAR #2020-00007, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

1. Place the rooftop HVAC unit below the level of the stair penthouse roof, as presented at the hearing.
2. Retain/repair/replace the existing cast stone frame material around the new windows.
3. Work with staff to study a lighter color for the rooftop addition.

**REASON**

The BAR members found the design to be appropriate for this mid-century modern building approved by the BAR and constructed in **1948**, and noted that the structure is now over 70 years old and historic in its own right. They agreed with staff that the precast/stone window surrounds represent a character-defining feature of the building, and therefore recommended they be repaired and retained. The BAR agreed that shifting the HVAC units below the roof level of the stair penthouse and lightening/refining the color of the rooftop addition would further minimize the appearance of the scale and mass of the addition on this historic block-face.

**SPEAKERS**

Michael Winstanley, architect, represented the applicant by giving a short presentation and answering questions.

Philip Matyas, who lives nearby, stated that he agreed with staff that the stone window surrounds should be retained. He felt that the proposed new entry and awning on Cameron Street are not appropriate for a residence, and that the design should pay more attention to residential standards. Mr. Matyas noted that the existing downspouts should be moved around the corner. He also questioned whether the FAR and open space requirements had been reviewed.

Michael Hobbs, 419 Cameron, stated that while the proposed addition is compatible with the existing structure, it is not compatible with the neighboring properties. He felt that the existing building is not historic or architecturally significant and noted that the surrounding area contains several notable historic buildings, some individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places and/or the Virginia Landmarks Register. At the very least, the applicant should relocate the HVAC unit. Mr. Hobbs also provided written comments for the record.

Richard Klingenmaier, 505 Cameron Street, stated that the original construction of this building should not have been approved in 1948 and that the BAR should not repeat a mistake of history by approving the proposed addition. He stated that the scale and character do not fit into the Old and Historic Alexandria District. He felt that the form of the roof of the addition should conform with the adjacent townhouse, the height should not exceed its immediate neighbor, and the façade should not stand out with its modern color and modern materials.

Steve Milone, President of Old Town Civic Association, noted that the association discussed this project. His concerns were similar to those of Mr. Hobbs and Mr. Klingenmaier as to the originally proposed height of the addition, now reduced. He observed that the BAR kept this building low in 1948 and urged the architects to find other means to diminish the height of the addition. He felt that the raised parapet would make the third floor look too heavy. He appreciated that Mr. Winstanley explained that the applicant plans to relocate the HVAC units and eliminate the screening. Mr. Milone suggested that the BAR defer the case and restudy the height. He also suggested moving the addition further from the street and keeping the stone window surrounds.

## **DISCUSSION**

The BAR members noted that although this building is not as old as its neighbors, it is still historic and that the proposed alterations were modest and in keeping with the Mid-Century modern character of the building. They praised the modest design of the addition and noted that the existing buildings immediately to the south and east were urban renewal structures that were over 50' tall and that there were townhouses across the street and on this side of the block that were at least a story taller. They noted that to add a gable roof to try and make this clearly Modern building look Colonial would neither be appropriate architecturally or historically.

The BAR appreciated that the applicant will preserve the existing building and the mix of uses that will give life to this corner of the street. They thanked the architect for finding a way to move the HVAC units and to eliminate the mechanical screening and agreed that making the addition a slightly lighter color would help it fade into the background and visually reduce the mass. They agreed with staff that retaining the stone/precast window surrounds would better suit the Mid-Century character of the building and liked the projecting canopy over the door, noting that similar canopies were successfully added to the residential conversion of the historic building Portner's Landing (and 314 Queen). While they sincerely thanked the neighbors for their comments, the BAR members noted that Alexandria is a living, breathing, vibrant, and evolving City and is not a museum like Williamsburg.

## **V. OTHER BUSINESS**

### *Window Policy*

Stephanie Sample outlined the issues staff is having trying to explain and enforcing the window policy because of the complexity and obfuscation of manufacturer's literature. She noted that window technology is constantly changing and that it may be possible to simplify the Performance Specifications of the policy and combine everything into the Administrative Approval document.

The Vice Chair asked the members of the BAR's Design Guidelines committee to meet with staff as soon as possible to offer suggestions for simplification for owners, contractors and staff.

### *Small Cell Antennas*

Ms. Sample also alerted the BAR that numerous small cell antenna applications had been submitted that did not comply with the BAR's administrative approval policy and would require approval at a public hearing in the near future.

## **VI. ADJOURNMENT**

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 8:23 p.m.

## **VII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS**

The following projects were administratively approved since the last BAR meeting:

BAR #2020-00011

Request for window replacement at 624 South Columbus Street

Applicant: Tracy Giannuzzi

BAR #2020-00018

Request for window replacement at 801 South Pitt Street #327

Applicant: Tom Haug

BAR #2020-00021

Request for roof replacement at 342 North Pitt Street

Applicant: Karen Barker

BAR #2020-00024

Request for replace gas lamps at 420 North Washington Street

Applicant: Gregory Ricketts

BAR #2020-00033

Request for patio replacement at 421 Gibbon Street

Applicant: Christine Thout

BAR #2020-00036

Request for signage at 913 King Street  
Applicant: Justin Marino