

**\*\*\*\*\*DRAFT MINUTES\*\*\*\*\***

Board of Architectural Review  
**Wednesday, January 8, 2020**  
7:00pm, Council Chambers, City Hall  
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christine Roberts, Chair  
James Spencer, Vice Chair  
John Sprinkle  
Purvi Irwin  
Lynn Neihardt  
Robert Adams  
Bill Conkey

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Al Cox, Preservation Manager  
Amirah Lane, Historic Preservation Planner

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was called to order at 7:03 p.m. All members were present.

**II. MINUTES**

Consideration of the minutes from the **December 18, 2019** public hearing.

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted, 7-0**

On a motion by Ms. Neihardt and seconded by Mr. Adams, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes from the December 18, 2019 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

**III. ITEMS DEFERRED FROM THIS HEARING**

**3. BAR #2019-00241 OHAD**

Request for new construction at 2901 Potomac Avenue (2405, 2501, 3701 Potomac Avenue, 3251 Potomac Avenue [Parcel ID 016.04-01-01], 700 Carpenter Road, 1702 and 1880 Potomac Greens Drive)

Applicants: City of Alexandria and Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority (WMATA)

**BOARD ACTION: Deferred**

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of BAR #2019-00241.

#### **IV. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED BY THE BOARD**

##### **4. BAR #2019-00509 OHAD**

Request for alterations to previously approved partial demolition/ capsulation at 430 North Union Street

Applicants: Kathy B. Hirsch & Jay Lawrence Hirsch

##### **5. BAR #2019-00502 OHAD**

Request for alterations to previously approved plans at 430 North Union Street

Applicants: Kathy B. Hirsch & Jay Lawrence Hirsch

#### **BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended, 5-2**

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00509 & BAR #2019-00502, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-2, with Mr. Sprinkle and Ms. Neihardt opposed.

#### **CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

1. Work with staff on the proportions of the windows on the fourth floor of the rear elevation to minimize the perception of their height relative to the windows below.
2. Make the elevator shaft the minimum height technically necessary.
3. Work with staff to study relocation of the front door to Oronoco Street, as previously approved.
4. This approval will render the prior approval void.

#### **REASON**

The BAR members found the revised design to be an improvement on the previous design and well designed for its context. The Board found the modern design to be appropriate in this context, as the site is located at the northeast corner of the historic district, there are no historic structures within several blocks and the future structures at Robinson Terminal North, which are not within the historic district, will be much larger and very likely contemporary designs.

#### **SPEAKERS**

Steve Kulinski, architect, represented the applicant and explained the reasons for the new design following additional discussion with neighbors.

Elizabeth Baldwin, 428 North Union Street, stated that the design was much improved but expressed concern with the size and height and that the building would block visibility of traffic at the Oronoco and North Union intersection.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Several BAR members were concerned about the height and setbacks relative to the roof form of the adjacent townhouse but agreed that a 24" difference was less than what occurred in many locations in Old Town. However, the height of the stone elevator shaft was visually increased because the revised guardrail at the roof deck was now transparent. The BAR also agreed that the windows at the fourth floor of the west elevation were larger than the windows below and that this was not a traditional hierarchy for fenestration on a dwelling in Alexandria.

## V. NEW BUSINESS

### 6. **BAR #2019-00517 PG**

Request for alterations at 819 Oronoco Street

Applicants: Jacob & Stefanie Schwartz

#### **BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended, 7-0**

On a motion by Ms. Neihardt and seconded by Mr. Spencer, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00517, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

#### **CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

1. Approval of a replacement six-panel entry door, three-light transom and frame with historically appropriate materials but **denial** of the fiberglass door and aluminum-clad frame
2. Removal or replacement of the existing noncomplying shutters with operable shutters constructed of wood or a solid through-the-core composite material in compliance with the BAR guidelines.

#### **REASON**

The Board, agreed with the analysis in the staff report, noting the age of the structure and the location abutting the public sidewalk and several options for protection of a wood door from the weather.

#### **SPEAKERS**

Stefanie Schwartz, the property owner, noted that the existing wood front door was installed in 1973 and that it was deteriorating, noted that there were other fiberglass doors on modern houses in the neighborhood and explained the reasons she would like a fiberglass front door.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Ms. Schwartz explained the practical reasons for having the existing wood door replaced with a fiberglass door but could not respond to the Chairs question as to what made this wood door any different than any other south facing wood door on any Early building in Old Town. Board members brought up wood door issues and experiences on their own historic homes, offering ideas on how to maintain and/or repair a south facing wood door. The Board noted that the subject property located is at the property line with no setback from the sidewalk, which makes the material of the door, even if painted, easily identified by a passerby and that the use of historic materials on an early house was a lengthy discussion when the Parker Gray guidelines were recently amended and that the community agreed that synthetic materials were not appropriate on street facing elevations of Early structures. The Board unanimously denied the application for replacement of the door with fiberglass. Ms. Irwin suggested amending staff's recommendation to replace the existing non-complying shutters with an appropriate material to include the option to remove the shutters without replacing them.

### 7. **BAR #2019-00531 OHAD**

Request for capsulation at 1011 Duke Street

Applicant: Kumar Patel

### 8. **BAR #2019-00530 OHAD**

Request for alterations at 1011 Duke Street  
Applicant: Kumar Patel

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended, 7-0**

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Mr. Spencer, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00531 & BAR #2019-00530, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

1. Include the conditions below in the General Notes of all site plans and on all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheet piling and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
  - a. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
  - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

**REASON**

The BAR agreed with the analysis in the staff report and did not believe that the area to be encapsulated was significant or that the addition would be visible to the general public.

**SPEAKERS**

Pat Jansen, representing the property owner, was available to answer questions.

**DISCUSSION**

The Board agreed with staff recommendation condition #2 and deleted staff recommendation #1 since the applicant had already received BAR administrative approval for historically appropriate replacement windows (BAR Case #2019-00084).

There was no further Board discussion.

**9. BAR #2019-00533 OHAD**

Request for capsulation at 203 South Fairfax Street  
Applicants: Bruce & Thelma Macgregor

**10. BAR #2019-00532 OHAD**

Request for alterations at 203 South Fairfax Street  
Applicant: Bruce & Thelma Macgregor

**BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended, 7-0**

On a motion by Ms. Neihardt and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00533 & BAR #2019-00532, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

## **CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

1. Applicant work with staff to ensure that the third-floor windows on the original house comply with the BAR's window policy.
2. Work with staff to resolve any potential building code issues. If the windows must be moved further from the property line, the overall design of the south elevation will remain the same.

## **REASON**

The BAR agreed with staff recommendation.

## **SPEAKERS**

Michael Dechert, project architect, presented the project and answered questions.

Stephanie Dimond, architect representing the next-door neighbors at 205 South Lee Street, expressed concern for use of the shared alley easement between the two properties during construction, and felt that the proposed addition may be too close to the property line to have fenestration, according to the building code.

## **DISCUSSION**

Ms. Roberts noted that the neighbors' concern regarding the alley easement is important but is a private property issue not under BAR purview. She also explained that the windows could not be installed if the distance of the windows from the property line does not meet Code requirements and that Code Administration staff was aware of the issue.

## **11. BAR #2019-00528 PG**

Request for new construction at 1417 Princess Street

Applicant: Ala Awadallah

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended, 6-1**

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Ms. Niehardt the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve portions and defer portions for restudy BAR #2019-00528, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6-1, with Ms. Irwin opposed.

## **CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

1. Approval of the scale, height, footprint and modified setback of 19' from the front lot line; and
2. Deferral of the design of the south elevation for restudy.

## **REASON**

The Board supported the scale, height, footprint and modified setback of 19'. The Board recommended that the applicant restudy the south elevation to incorporate more modern architectural features that were still compatible with the structures on this unusual, single family detached dwelling portion of Parker-Gray.

## **SPEAKERS**

Ala Awadallah, property owner, was available to answer questions.

Minturn Wright, representing Allan Russell, spoke in opposition of setback.

Michael Stauber, owner of 1404 Princess St., spoke in opposition of setback.

## **DISCUSSION**

The Board found the proposal to be a missed opportunity to design a new structure that was contemporary yet compatible with the surrounding properties. The majority of the Board thought the south elevation could more distinguished in this location in the district, noting that some subtle differentiation between the design of this structure and similar historic mid-19<sup>th</sup> century vernacular townhouses was desirable in order not to dilute the significance of the historic structures that had been preserved. Mr. Adams disagreed and supported the existing, traditional design.

## **VI. ADJOURNMENT**

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 9:20 p.m.

## **VII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS**

The following projects were administratively approved since the last BAR meeting:

BAR #2019-00405

Request for gas lanterns at 110 South Pitt Street

Applicant: WS 110 Pitt LLC

BAR #2019-00521

Request for gate replacement at 212 South Fairfax Street

Applicant: Pamela Rodriguez

BAR #2019-00534

Request for gate replacement at 628 South Lee Street

Applicant: Michael & Iris Palmer

BAR #2019-00545

Request for door replacement at 1250 South Washington Street #406

Applicant: Russell Jones & Mary Streitwieser

BAR #2019-00547

Request for window replacement at 1250 South Washington Street #522

Applicant: Teresa Barry

BAR #2019-00548

Request for window and door replacement at 1250 South Washington Street #706

Applicant: Wendy Shaw

BAR #2019-00547

Request for window replacement at 1250 South Washington Street #522

Applicant: Teresa Barry