

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Wednesday, December 4, 2019
7:00pm, Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christine Roberts, Chair
James Spencer, Vice Chair
John Sprinkle
Bill Conkey
Purvi Irwin

Members Absent: Lynn Neihardt
Robert Adams

Staff Present: Al Cox, Preservation Manager
Susan Hellman, Historic Preservation Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was called to order at 7:00 p.m. Ms. Neihardt and Mr. Adams were excused. All other members were present.

II. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes from the **November 20, 2019** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle and seconded by Mr. Spencer, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes from the November 20, 2019 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

III. CONSENT CALENDAR

3. BAR #2019-00452 OHAD

Request for alterations at 317 Prince Street
Applicant: Stephen King - Portfolio Manager

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted, 5-0

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Mr. Spencer, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2018-00452, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

Staff clarified that the proposed doors would be painted green to match the existing doors.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Eliminate the spiderweb muntins from the upper row of panels.

2. Make the visible portion of the rail at the head of the doors the same 5” width as the stiles at the perimeter and make all rectangular glass panels equal size, as shown on drawing 1/N-3.

IV. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED BY THE BOARD

4. BAR #2019-00241 OHAD

Request for new construction at 2901 Potomac Avenue (2405, 2501, 3701 Potomac Avenue, 3251 Potomac Avenue [Parcel ID 016.04-01-01], 700 Carpenter Road, 1702 and 1880 Potomac Greens Drive)

Applicants: City of Alexandria and Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority (WMATA)

BOARD ACTION: Approved Portions, Deferred Portions, as Submitted, 4-0

The Board of Architectural Review voted to approve portions and defer portions of BAR #2019-00241, as submitted. The motions, described individually below, carried on a vote of 4-0. Mr. Sprinkle recused himself.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Staff to follow the final light fixture details throughout the building permit process to ensure that they comply with the BAR’s design intent to minimize glare toward the George Washington memorial Parkway.
2. Restudy the shape and connection details of the downspouts.

REASON

The Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report regarding the items presented at this hearing.

SPEAKERS

Stephen Lasser spoke on behalf of the applicant and responded to questions. There were no public speakers.

DISCUSSION

The BAR discussed the locations of the downspouts as well as their design. Mr. Lasser indicated that they would present the final design at a later hearing but appreciated the BAR’s input. Mr. Lasser went into great detail to explain that there will be no direct light trespass from the proposed lighting to the Parkway or to the sky. The BAR felt that the proposed directed lighting nicely highlights the architecture and creates an elegant solution to the light escape problem.

On a motion by Ms. Irwin, seconded by Mr. Spencer, the Board approved the light trough in the ceiling of the pedestrian bridges and the overall lighting of the station by a vote of 4-0.

On a motion by Mr. Conkey, seconded by Mr. Spencer the handrail details and mesh wall in the pedestrian bridges were approved 4-0.

On a motion by Mr. Spencer, seconded by Ms. Irwin the downspout locations on the mezzanine and platform of the station were approved as submitted, with the applicant to return with additional details of the combined conductor head, a restudy of square or rectangular downspouts in lieu of round and with additional details of the cover plate at the notch in the stone base of the building. The motion passed 4-0.

V. NEW BUSINESS

5. BAR #2019-00454 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 121 South Henry Street

Applicant: Brendan Owens

6. BAR #2019-00455 OHAD

Request for addition & alterations at 121 South Henry Street

Applicant: Brendan Owens

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Amended, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Mr. Spencer, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00454 & BAR #2019-00455, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Work with staff to ensure that the new wood trim, door casings, and fence are historically appropriate.
2. Work with staff in the field to determine the most historically-appropriate window configuration and locations based on the number of historic and reasonably repairable windows remaining.
3. Windows on the south and west elevations may be Bewiso brand simulated double hung, painted wood tilt and turn, triple glazed windows.
4. Work with staff to select a more architecturally appropriate solid wood entry door on the South Henry Street (east) façade of this late Victorian Italianate style structure.
5. Fiber cement clapboard siding must have a smooth surface and not be simulated woodgrain.
6. No metal detection or other artifact collection may be conducted on the property unless authorized in writing by Alexandria Archaeology.
7. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703.746.4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
8. Eliminate the handrail applied to the wall at the closet at the second floor of the porch on the south elevation.

REASON

The BAR supported the proposed minor alterations to the exterior of this structure and found them to be in compliance with the Design Guidelines. The BAR felt that the proposed false porch railing appears too aesthetically elaborate and artificial.

SPEAKERS

Mr. Owens, the applicant, represented himself and answered questions.

DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the proposed window configuration in detail. They agreed with Mr. Owens assessment of the prior alterations and directed him to work with staff in the field to evaluate the most historically-appropriate option for preservation or replacement. Ms. Irwin questioned the railing on the south elevation on the second floor. This railing would be applied to the south wall

of a new closet on the second floor of the porch. The BAR believed that the false railing actually called attention to the closet, rather than disguising it, and that the appearance of the railing should be minimized. However, the BAR had no objection to the application of a molding to visually extend the top rail of the porch, similar to a chair rail applied to a wall.

7. BAR #2019-00456 OHAD

Request for alterations at 312 North Pitt Street

Applicants: Christopher & Tracey Silk

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted, 5-0

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Mr. Sprinkle, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00456, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to install a new front door surround, as submitted.
2. Replacement of the existing window sash on the front elevation with sash that comply with the BAR's window policy.

REASON

The Board found the style of the proposed door surround to be appropriate for this Colonial Revival townhouse and noted that it matched another surround in this same group of townhouses. The BAR found the existing vinyl insert windows with sandwich muntins on the east façade to be inappropriate and in violation of the BAR's policy for window replacement.

SPEAKERS

Ms. Silk, the owner, responded to questions and agreed to replace the windows installed by a prior owner but asked that they be able to install the door surround now and replace the windows within the next six months.

DISCUSSION

Chair explained that the BAR approval is valid for 12 months and that the applicant may install the door surround and coordinate window replacement with staff any time during that period.

8. BAR #2019-00478 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 204 South Pitt Street

Applicants: Patrick & Laurie Jennings

9. BAR #2019-00477 OHAD

Request for alterations at 204 South Pitt Street

Applicants: Patrick & Laurie Jennings

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00478 & BAR #2019-00477, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

None

REASON

The BAR found the alterations to the late 20th century addition on the rear of this townhouse to be minimally visible and appropriate according to the Design Guidelines.

SPEAKERS

Gretchen Brown, designer with Braswell Construction, represented the owner and offered to answer questions.

DISCUSSION

The BAR had no discussion.

10. BAR #2019-00480 PG

Request for addition & waiver of rooftop HVAC screening at 1310 Queen Street

Applicants: Ildar Abdullin & Anna Kachalova

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as Submitted, 4-0

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the applicant's request for deferral of BAR #2019-00480, with Mr. Conkey recusing himself.

REASON

The BAR felt that the proposed addition would overwhelm the house and detract from its historic character of the house and its environs. They also had specific concerns with some design details.

SPEAKERS

Karen Conkey, project architect, represented the applicants and answered questions.

Patricia Shea, 236 N. Payne Street, expressed frustration with a lack of information and communication about the project from the applicants, noting that the project thus far appeared to be poorly managed. She also expressed concern about the large scale of the addition and felt it would not be in keeping with the historic aesthetic of the community.

Kyle Gentry, 227 N. West Street, pointed out four issues/concerns he had regarding the project:

- The mass, size, and modern design of the addition, which will be clearly visible from Queen Street. It is not in keeping with the character of the neighborhood.
- HVAC screening – will it really be screened? Unable to tell from the drawings.
- The rooftop terrace – large and overwhelming, looming over the neighbors
- The addition is half again as large as the original house. Does it comply with open space and FAR regulations? Mr. Cox noted that it does.

DISCUSSION

The Board questioned the proposed cladding on the addition, which appeared to be a monolithic, synthetic stucco. They would like to see some seams to break up the large walls and give them a more human scale. Ms. Conkey explained that the owner preferred fewer seams.

The Board agreed with the speakers who felt that the addition was too large and appeared to be taking over the original house. They stated that the addition detracts from the historic character of the surrounding houses and the subject house itself. The addition should be subservient to the historic house but the BAR noted that the “Steamboat Pilot House” character of the stair penthouse was overwhelming and that the historic structure was visually lost. The BAR asked for renderings that did not obscure the house with trees. While several Board members liked the concept of a modern design, they felt that the design that was presented needed to be restudied. There was concern about the character of the joints and the odd window sizes that do not relate to the existing house and that there were too many siding types.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

1. Election of Officers

On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle, seconded by Ms. Irwin, the BAR voted 5-0 to reelect both the Chair and Vice-Chair to another one-year term.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 8:40 p.m.

VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following projects were administratively approved since the last BAR meeting:

BAR #2019-00488

Request for signage at 1110 King Street

Applicant: AK Health LLC dba CBD Wellness

BAR #2019-00501

Request for porch replacement at 620 South Saint Asaph Street

Applicant: Vanessa Veazie

BAR #2019-00504

Request for roof replacement at 414 North West Street

Applicant: Margaret Grimes

BAR #2019-00508

Request for door replacement at 540 Second Street

Applicant: Doris Lindsey

BAR #2019-00510

Request for antennas at 520 King Street

Applicant: Shae Beltran