

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******
Board of Architectural Review
Wednesday, May 15, 2019
7:00pm, Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christine Roberts, Chair
James Spencer, Vice Chair
Purvi Irwin
John Sprinkle
Bill Conkey
Lynn Neihardt
Robert Adams

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Al Cox, Preservation Manager
Stephanie Sample, Historic Preservation Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Board of Architectural Review hearing was called to order at 7:02 p.m. All members were present.

II. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the **May 1, 2019** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review approved the minutes from the May 1, 2019 meeting, as submitted.

III. ITEMS DEFERRED FROM THIS HEARING

3. BAR #2019-00037 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 605 Prince Street
Applicant: Billy Klipstein, LLC

4. BAR #2019-00038 OHAD

Request for addition, alterations and rooftop HVAC waiver at 605 Prince Street
Applicant: Billy Klipstein, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Accepted Request for Deferral

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral

of BAR #2019-00037 & BAR #2019-00038.

5. BAR #2019-00143 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 615 South Royal Street

Applicant: Scott & Cornelia Turyn

6. BAR #2019-00144 OHAD

Request for addition at 615 South Royal Street

Applicant: Scott & Cornelia Turyn

BOARD ACTION: Accepted Request for Deferral

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of BAR #2019-00143 & BAR #2019-00144.

7. BAR #2019-00148 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 118 North Saint Asaph Street

Applicant: Saint Asaph Ventures, LLC

8. BAR #2019-00149 OHAD

Request for addition and alterations at 118 North Saint Asaph Street

Applicant: Saint Asaph Ventures, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Accepted Request for Deferral

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for deferral of BAR #2019-00148 & BAR #2019-00149.

9. *Applicant withdrew application*

BAR #2019-00151 OHAD

Request for alterations at 721 South Alfred Street

Applicant: Garret Reinhart & Jeffery Rohlmann

BOARD ACTION: Noted the Withdrawal

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review noted the withdrawal of BAR #2019-00151 and conversion of the scope of the project to administratively approved work.

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR

10. BAR #2019-00155 OHAD

Request for alterations at 703 South Lee Street

Applicant: Norma & Kevin Kuntz

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Mr. Adams, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00155, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

V. NEW BUSINESS

11. **BAR #2019-00146 PG**

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 328 North Patrick Street

Applicant: Metro Fine Properties, LLC

12. **BAR #2019-00147 PG**

Request for addition and alterations at 328 North Patrick Street

Applicant: Metro Fine Properties, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 7-0

On a motion by Ms. Neihardt and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00146 & BAR #2019-00147, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS

1. Denial of the request to demolish the historic woodburning fireplace chimney in the mid-section of the main block of the house;
2. The cladding material on the addition should be fiber cement siding to distinguish it from the historic sections;
3. The windows should be aluminum clad or fiberglass in a one-over-one configuration on the addition, and must comply with the Boards *Alexandria New and Replacement Window Performance Specifications in the Historic Districts*;
4. The one-story addition on the south elevation below the second floor of the historic ell should be set back at least 6 inches from the wall plane of the historic house to differentiate between the historic house and new construction and to reflect historic patterns of development for a service ell attached to the primary structure;
5. Work with staff, in the field, to evaluate the historic wood siding on the main block once the aluminum siding is removed. Historic siding must be retained, and/or repaired as needed, per the BAR's policy;
6. The roof of the main block must have historically appropriate wood shingles consistent with the original roof material, or a standing seam metal roof as an alternative historically appropriate material. The roof on the proposed addition may be standing seam metal as the applicant suggested; (Condition amended by the BAR)
7. The windows on the main historic building's street-facing façade must be made of wood and have a six-over-six light configuration and comply with the *Alexandria New and Replacement Window Performance Specifications in the Historic Districts* unless otherwise specifically stated at the hearing; ~~and,~~
8. The front door on the street-facing (east) elevation must be painted wood with six panels or be a historically appropriate mid-19th century vernacular design approved by staff; and
9. The windows on the ell's second floor shall be kept if staff finds they are original to the building. (Condition added by the BAR)

REASON

The Board generally supported the staff recommendation and complimented the applicant on rehabilitating the historic building.

SPEAKERS

Justin Powers, the applicant, spoke in support of the project and asked the Board to reconsider staff's recommendation that the addition be setback six inches from the main block to differentiate it from the historic building. Instead, he asked them to approve it as shown or with a vertical trim board to differentiate the addition from the historic main block. He also asked that the BAR approve the proposed window configuration on the addition that matched the window light configuration on the historic building. He suggested using a different window material on the addition to differentiate the windows. After the Board discussed the requests, Mr. Powers asked if he could use the same material, metal standing seam, on the entire roof (historic and addition).

Mr. Kevin Abbott, next door resident, spoke in favor of the project and brought up a drainage issue that currently affects his property. He also noted that even though the project said the addition was being constructed on the existing foundation, the drawings showed that the addition would go seven feet beyond the existing foundation.

DISCUSSION

The Board did not support the applicant's request make the ell addition flush with the main block instead of being recessed, for differentiation from the historic main body of the house and because of potential Code Administration requirements for fire separation of the windows from the property line. Ms. Neihardt moved to approve the application with staff recommendations, which Mr. Sprinkle seconded.

Ms. Irwin asked about the asphalt shingle roof that was administratively approved a couple of years ago for the subject property. Mr. Cox explained that zoning ordinance Section 10-209(A)(2) allows exterior materials in Parker-Gray to be replaced with the same material "in-kind in cases when the cost of the work would be materially increased by the use of another material" complying with the BAR's current policy and that this is what likely happened in the past. Ms. Irwin agreed with the applicant that the addition's roof could also be metal to be consistent with the metal roof the applicant proposed on the main block. She noted that if the existing windows on the ell were historic, based on staff examination in the field, that they should be retained.

Mr. Conkey said that he did not object to removing the chimney because he did not consider it character defining in this instance, although he said he understands that the Guidelines state that every woodburning fireplace chimney should be retained. He asked Mr. Cox to address the issue as part of the Design Guidelines update.

13. BAR #2019-00156 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 605 & 615 Slaters Lane

Applicant: The Salvation Army

14. BAR #2019-00157 OHAD

Request for addition at 605 & 615 Slaters Lane

Applicant: The Salvation Army

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Mr. Spencer and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00156 & BAR #2019-00157, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

REASON

The Board found the addition to be appropriate and agreed with staff recommendations.

SPEAKERS

Debbie Marshall, project architect, spoke in favor of the project and was available to answer questions.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Roberts asked Ms. Marshall to walk the Board through the project. Ms. Marshall said that the complex is composed of four buildings built in the 1980s and that the Salvation Army occupies two of the buildings. She explained that in the late 1980s the buildings were connected on the first and second floors and that the proposed project was to connect the buildings on the third floor using the same materials and design as the first and second floors hyphen. The Board had no questions.

15. BAR #2019-00164 OHAD

Request for alterations to previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness at
211 Strand Street
Applicant: IDI Strand, L.C.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Ms. Neihardt and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00164, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposed glazing to be appropriate on this modern building and agreed that the slightly more reflective glass would be largely unnoticeable due to its location on the fifth floor and set back from the primary building facade. The Board agreed with staff recommendations.

SPEAKERS

John Rust, the project architect, spoke in favor of the project and answered questions.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Roberts inquired about the reflectivity and coloration of the proposed glazing. The Board agreed that the proposed glass would not be noticeably different because it was on the fifth floor, was part of a storefront window assembly and that this was being installed on a modern building. Ms. Irwin noted that it was appropriate to have modern glass in modern buildings but not historic structures. The Chair asked staff to update the BAR's *Design Guidelines* to reflect this policy.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

16. RiverRenew CSO Project Update

Representatives from AlexRenew and the City's Department of Planning & Zoning updated the BAR on the status of the combined sewer project.

17. Small Cell Presentation

Representatives from AT&T and staff from the City Manager's Office made a presentation to the BAR about small cell wireless facilities in advance of applications for small cell facilities in the historic district on Dominion Energy utility poles.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 9:05 p.m.

VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR #2019-00175

Request for reroofing at 1016 ½ Oronoco Street

Applicant: Nancy Kline

BAR #2019-00176

Request for fence repair at 1206 Princess Street

Applicant: Loriass Bounds

BAR #2019-00177

Request for siding replacement at 309 North Alfred Street

Applicant: Jacob Hegeman

BAR #2019-00178

Request for window and door replacement at 1250 South Washington Street, Unit 720

Applicant: Richard Tully

BAR #2019-00179

Request for window replacement at 712 South Fairfax Street

Applicant: Conrad Zimmnick

BAR #2019-00180

Request for window replacement at 1020 Queen Street

Applicant: Anna Badyoczek

BAR #2019-00181

Request for window replacement at 734 South Lee Street

Applicant: Karleen Murray

BAR #2019-00182

Request for gas meter at 107 King Street

Applicant: Fish Market Anchor

BAR #2019-00184

Request for window replacement at 104 Pommander Walk

Applicant: Karlee Murray

BAR #2019-00185

Request for new vents at 102 South Patrick Street

Applicant: Sarah Moore

BAR #2019-00186

Request for alterations at 721 South Alfred Street

Applicant: Garret Reinhart

BAR #2019-00199

Request for window replacement at 1310 Princess Street

Applicant: Damian Yanessa

BAR #2019-00200

Request for window replacement at 606 Battery Place

Applicant: Kristen Jone