

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******
Board of Architectural Review
Wednesday, March 20, 2019
7:00pm, Room 2000, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christine Roberts, Chair
Purvi Irwin
John Sprinkle
Bill Conkey
Lynn Neihardt

Members Absent: James Spencer, Vice Chair
Robert Adams

Staff Present: Al Cox, Preservation Manager
Stephanie Sample, Historic Preservation Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was called to order at 7:00 p.m. Mr. Adams was excused and Mr. Spencer was absent. All other members were present.

II. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the **March 6, 2019** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review approved the minutes from the March 6, 2019 meeting, as submitted.

III. CONSENT CALENDAR

3. BAR #2019-00044 OHAD

Request for alterations at 428 North Washington Street
Applicant: Coble, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 5-0

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00044, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

4. BAR #2019-00047 OHAD

Request for alterations at 210 South Fayette Street
Applicant: Scott Avery

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 5-0

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00047, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

5. BAR #2019-00060 OHAD

Request for alteration with signage at 814 King Street
Applicant: Old Town 1, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 4-0-1

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00060, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 4-0-1. Ms. Irwin abstained.

CONDITIONS

1. The brightness of the lighting at the entrance is subject to field inspection by staff to ensure lighting levels do not overwhelm the building or its neighbors.
2. The final color/temperature of all lighting must be warm (not cool/blue) and no greater than 3000 Kelvin.
3. When the existing Escape Room Live sign and bracket is relocated due to the installation of the C channel it should be mounted through the mortar joints and not the masonry units.

IV. ITEM WITHDRAWN

6. BAR #2019-00059 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 814 King Street
Applicant: Old Town 1, LLC

BOARD ACTION: ACKNOWLEDGED REQUEST FOR WITHDRAWAL

By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review acknowledged the request for withdrawal of BAR #2019-00059.

V. NEW BUSINESS

7. BAR #2019-00042 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 405 South Fairfax Street
Applicants: David Osterndorf & Jennie Korth

8. BAR #2019-00043 OHAD

Request for addition, alterations and HVAC waiver at 405 South Fairfax Street
Applicants: David Osterndorf & Jennie Korth

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00042 & BAR #2019-00043, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS

1. That the applicant may use modern materials on the new construction, provided the materials comply with the Board's adopted policies.
2. Include the statements in archaeology conditions below in the General Notes of all site plans and on all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. Call Alexandria Archaeology (703.746.4399) two weeks before the starting date of any ground disturbance so that a monitoring and inspection schedule for city archaeologists can be arranged.
 - b. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703.746.4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - c. No metal detection may be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board felt that the addition was well designed and sufficiently differentiated from the historic portion of the building.

SPEAKERS

Patrick Camus, representing the property owners, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

Elaine Lamontagne, 407 South Fairfax Street, spoke in opposition to the project and stated her concern about the size and proximity of the proposed addition to her house.

Elaine Johnson, HAF, spoke in opposition to the proposed addition height, scale and mass and the loss of open space.

DISCUSSION

The Board was acknowledged the limited impact of the new addition on the historic portions of the house and the use of stucco wall material to differentiate the addition from the original dwelling. Mr. Sprinkle asked the applicant to affirm that they would notify Alexandria Archaeology if a well was found on the site, as has been suggested by that department. The applicant agreed. The majority of the Board also supported the use of appropriate modern materials on the new addition if the applicant was interested. The BAR also affirmed that preservation of open space that was not visible from a public way was not within their purview.

9. BAR #2019-00045 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 600 Montgomery Street
Applicant: Hank's Pasta Bar, LLC

10. BAR #2019-00046 OHAD

Request for addition and alterations at 600 Montgomery Street
Applicant: Hank's Pasta Bar, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Ms. Neihardt, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00045 BAR #2019-00046, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS

1. Mechanical equipment must be screened on all sides.
2. Provide exterior lighting specifications to staff prior to applying for building permits;
3. Provide specifications for two new rooftop mechanical units.
4. Work with staff on the number and proportions of the windows of the stair penthouse to relate to the overall building and the openings below.
5. Increase the differentiation between the proposed rooftop additions and the existing building materials/colors.
6. Finalize the design of the shed so that it is as small as possible and appears to be portable furniture rather than architecture.

REASON

The Board members supported the overall design of the proposed addition. The Board stipulated the applicant should work with staff on final design details of the rooftop addition and shed.

SPEAKERS

Anila Angjeli, architect, spoke in support of the project and answered questions.

Shane Mayson, applicant, spoke in support of the project and answered questions.

DISCUSSION

The Board members preferred that the addition be further differentiated from the existing building and agreed that the design of the furniture storage shed in the right-of-way should be smaller and portable. The BAR differentiated between a retractable awning, which has no vertical supports, and the proposed canopy which has a permanent metal frame, agreeing that a canopy was a part of the architecture that counts as FAR in the zoning ordinance and that it did not need to be retracted when not in use, as awnings are typically conditioned.

11. BAR #2019-00057 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 1226 Prince Street

Applicant: Daniel C. Crane

12. BAR #2019-00058 OHAD

Request for alterations at 1226 Prince Street

Applicant: Daniel C. Crane

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00057 & BAR #2019-00058, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

REASON

The Board found the design appropriated and agreed with staff recommendations.

SPEAKERS

Anila Angjeli, the architect for the project, spoke in favor of the proposal.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Neihardt started the discussion stating that she found the project fine and compatible with the building and did not detract from the historic architectural character.

The BAR, in general, agreed with Ms. Neihardt and did not have additional comments.

13. BAR #2019-00063 OHAD

Request for alterations at 106 South Union Street

Applicant: Virtue Feed & Grain, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 5-0

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Mr. Conkey, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00063, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS

1. That the applicant work with staff on the details of the canopy.
2. That the sides of the deck remain open to the alley at all times, without either permanent or temporary enclosure, as agreed to by the applicant at the hearing.

REASON

The BAR found the previously approved canopy and deck to be architecturally appropriate for this building, noting that it recalled a warehouse loading dock. The Board stipulated the applicant should work with staff on final design details. The Board also indicated that the deck and canopy may not become an enclosed structure at any time, in order to maintain the visual porosity of the alley called for in the Waterfront Plan.

SPEAKERS

Joe McCoy, project architect, spoke in support of the project and answered questions.

Duncan Blair, applicant's attorney, responded to questions.

DISCUSSION

The Board felt that the proposed glass and steel canopy was appropriate in this location and preferred the deck and canopy to the current retractable awnings and umbrellas with disorganized tables and chairs. The BAR discussed the possibility of the canopy having a visually lighter structural framing system that could help make the canopy appear to be floating. The also stated that they did not support any future enclosure of the deck, which the applicant agreed to at the hearing.

14. BAR #2019-00064 OHAD

Request for alterations at 904 Queen Street

Applicant: Cathy Van Way

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. Conkey and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00064, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS

1. Approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the fiberglass bathroom window, as submitted, but no building permit for window replacement may be approved until the other window violations on the dwelling are resolved;
2. Work with staff to cure the apparent violation of replacement window designs and material on the street facing north elevation within the next 12 months; and
3. After-the-fact approval of a waiver of fence height in the rear yard.

REASON

The BAR found that the window on the rear of the early 19th century dwelling was only visible from the public alley and that a wood window would be unreasonably difficult to maintain in a bathroom shower. However, the BAR questioned why all of the windows in this house had been replaced with inappropriate vinyl insert windows with no evidence of building permits or BAR approval.

SPEAKERS

Roger with Home Depot represented the applicant.

DISCUSSION

The BAR supported replacement of the existing vinyl bathroom window with a new fiberglass window because of its location and context but questioned why window and fences had been replaced with no BAR approvals. The approved the bathroom window but asked that staff not approve the building permit for this window until a path to resolve the other window violations had been agreed upon.

15. BAR #2019-00065 OHAD

Request for alterations at 407 Prince Street
Applicants: Carlos Cecchi & Lisa Rivas

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 5-0

On a motion by Ms. Irwin and seconded by Mr. Sprinkle, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2019-00065, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITIONS

1. The railing cannot penetrate the historic stone steps and must be mounted into the sidewalk.
2. Work with staff to refine the railing design to be minimally visible, architecturally appropriate, and modern but with Victorian period elements.

REASON

The Board supported staff recommendations. The applicant must work with staff on the final details of the railings.

SPEAKERS

Carlos Cecchi, applicant, spoke in support of the project and answered questions.

DISCUSSION

The Board discussion the best attachment location of the proposed railing. The applicant did not want to mount it to the door surround. The BAR stated, therefore, that the railing should be

mounted in the sidewalk and the refined design should be simple and more modern.

VI. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

VII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following projects were administratively approved since the last BAR meeting:

BAR #2019-00079

Request for repointing at 115 North Fairfax Street

Applicant: 115 Holden, LLC

BAR #2019-00080

Request for new vent at 414 Princess Street

Applicant: Timothy Trayers

BAR #2019-00081

Request for brick column repair at 99 Franklin Street

Applicant: Ford's Landing HOA

BAR #2019-00085

Request for repointing at 200 South Fairfax Street

Applicant: Vaughan Restoration

BAR #2019-00086

Request for roof replacement at 500 Duke Street

Applicant: Wagner Roofing

BAR #2019-00087

Request for roof replacement at 118 North Washington Street

Applicant: Wagner Roofing

BAR #2019-00088

Request for window replacement at 418 North Payne Street

Applicant: Alabama Ave, LC

BAR #2019-00089

Request for roof replacement at 232 North Alfred Street

Applicant: Vertex Roofing

BAR #2019-00090

Request for HVAC unit and gas lantern at 110 Quay Street

Applicant: Rob Landino

BAR #2019-00091

Request for exhaust fan at 803 Prince & 123 South Columbus Street

Applicant: Collin Sorensen

BAR #2019-00092

Request for window replacement at 123 Quay Street

Applicant: Elizabeth Germain