

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, September 19, 2018

7:30pm, Room 2000, City Hall

301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christina Kelley, Chair
Christine Roberts, Vice Chair
Robert Adams
Slade Elkins
John Goebel
Margaret Miller
John Sprinkle

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Stephanie Sample, Historic Preservation Planner
Marina Novaes, Historic Preservation Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm. All members were present.

II. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the **September 5, 2018** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted

By unanimous consent, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review approved the minutes from the September 5, 2018 meeting, as submitted.

III. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

3. CASE BAR #2018-00343

Request for partial demolition/ capsulation at 609 South Lee Street Applicant: Steve Kelmar

4. CASE BAR #2018-00344

Request for addition/alterations and HVAC equipment screening waiver at 609 South Lee Street Applicant: Steve Kelmar

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 5-1

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Elkins, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00343 & BAR Case #2018-00344, as amended. The motion

carried on a vote of 5-1, with Ms. Roberts voting no. Mr. Adams was recused.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. ~~Work with staff to restudy the roof form of the central turret above the front entrance to lower or eliminate the pyramidal roof and finial and to retain the existing front cornice.~~ *Construct the revised front elevation design presented at the hearing which lowers the pyramidal roof feature and removes the finial. (revised condition)*
2. Construct the new parapet/rooftop mechanical screen of brick to match the wall below, rather than wood. Work with staff on the final details of the recessed panels and coping.
3. The applicant may use simulated divided light double glazed windows on the front façade, per the BAR's existing window policy, at their option.
4. Include the following statements in the General Notes of all construction documents and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
5. *Move the north wall pier to the south the same distance as the south wall pier is being moved to the north to create a symmetrical wall, with final design to be approved by staff. (new condition)*
6. *Do not extended the chimney height unless required by the building code. If the chimney must be extended it should match the drawing shown on A203. (new condition)*

REASON

The majority of the Board supported the proposed new porch and the revised front elevation recommended by staff, with a lowered pyramidal roof feature over the center bay and without a finial and agreed that the proposed parapet on the front facade should be constructed of brick rather than wood. The BAR supported the new iron fence design but suggested that the front garden wall pier at the north end should be moved the same distance as the south pier is being moved to the north, in order to maintain the symmetry of the wall. Finally, they felt that if a brick parapet was constructed it would eliminate the need to raise the top of the chimney; however, if it is required to be raised to comply with the building code, it should look like the chimney shown on A203.

SPEAKERS

Daniel Jacobeen, architect, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Miller asked for clarification on the chimney design and increased height. Mr. Jacobeen said that there was a drafting error and that the more decorative brick chimney details on A203 were correct. Most Board members preferred the brick parapet, rather than wood, because of its more traditional appearance. Ms. Roberts voted no because she felt that the pyramidal roof form was not necessary and would not enhance the overall composition of the front façade.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

5. BAR Case #2018-00376

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 1850 Carpenter Road

Applicant: Michael Becker

6. BAR Case #2018-00377

Request alterations at 1850 Carpenter Road

Applicant: Michael Becker

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. Goebel, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00376 & BAR Case #2018-00377, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

REASON

The Board had no objection to the rear deck, which is architecturally appropriate for this 21st century garage townhouse. The Board noted that the project is subject to BAR purview only because of its location (within 500 feet) of the centerline of the George Washington Memorial Parkway, even though the deck itself is not visible from the Parkway. The Board agreed that the deck should only be permitted if it is consistent with the SUP conditions for the Potomac Greens development and provided that the deck will not interfere with Fire Department access in the EVE.

SPEAKERS

Michael Becker, applicant, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

Debra Vitale, neighbor, spoke in opposition to the application.

Mark Anderson, neighbor, spoke in opposition to the application.

Mary Kay Fannerella, neighbor, spoke in opposition to the application.

Shannon McCullar, neighbor, spoke in support of the application.

DISCUSSION

Some of the neighbors objected to the construction of a second floor deck on this unit. Although there are many similar decks in this same Potomac Greens neighborhood, and throughout Old Town on townhomes constructed by EYA, the neighbors noted that there is only one other example of rear decks on the townhouses constructed by the Craftmark Company. The neighbors also believed that the deck was not allowed under the DSUP conditions for the development and that the proposed 5' deep deck would project into the EVE in the alley.

The Board members had no objection to the design of the deck and found that the design was appropriate to this early 21st century townhouse. They further noted that the application contained architectural approval from the homeowner's association. They asked staff to confirm that the deck is permitted by the SUP conditions and that it was not located in the fire department's EVE.

7. CASE BAR #2018-00267

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 801 South Royal Street Applicant: Michael & Alexis Doxey

8. CASE BAR #2018-00268

Request for alterations at 801 South Royal Street
Applicant: Michael & Alexis Doxey

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 7-0

On a motion by Mr. Adams, and seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00267 & BAR Case #2018-00268, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The new windows must fully comply with the Alexandria New and Replacement Window and Door Performance Specifications.
2. The following statements shall appear in the General Notes of all construction documents and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
3. *Work with staff to refine the fenestration on the second floor of the front elevation of the proposed addition to reference the design character of other original structures in the Yates Gardens neighborhood. (new condition)*

REASON

The Board found the addition to be compatible and well designed but felt that the second-floor fenestration lacked symmetry or order and could be modified to be more symmetrical, or balanced with the windows and door below.

SPEAKERS

Michael Doxey, applicant, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.
Rebecca Bostick, architect, spoke in support of the application and answer questions.

DISCUSSION

The Board asked questions about the irregular design character of the second-floor window layout on the front elevation of the addition. The architect explained that the interior floor plan of the bathroom informed the location of the windows but said that they would be willing to restudy that feature. The architect stated that the overhead images looked distorted and that the window size and asymmetry is less obvious on the original drawings. The BAR asked staff to work with the applicant and to see how windows such as this were treated on other Yates Gardens houses.

9. Deferral Requested by Applicant

BAR Case #2018-00352

Request for new construction at 1101 North Washington Street Applicant: Toll Mid-Atlantic LP

Company, Inc

BOARD ACTION: Deferred

By unanimous consent, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review approved the Applicants request for deferral of BAR Case #2018-00352.

10. BAR Case #2018-00371

Request for signage at 620 Queen Street
Applicant: Manchester Condominium

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. Goebel, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00371, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That the towing sign be reproduced with a towing truck image per City Code Section 9-13-10; and,
2. That the towing sign be affixed to one of the brick walls flanking the entrance to the parking lot.

REASON

The Board had no questions and agreed with the staff recommendation.

SPEAKERS

Lawrence Mann, representing Manchester Condominium, supported the application and responded to questions.

DISCUSSION

The Board asked if the applicant had seen the staff report and the proposed conditions. The applicant had not so the Board read the conditions to the applicant.

11. BAR Case #2018-00374

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 203 South Union Street Applicant: Keith Urbahn & Matthew Latimer

12. CASE BAR #2018-00375

Request for alterations at 203 South Union Street Applicant: Keith Urbahn & Matthew Latimer

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle, and seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00374 & BAR Case #2018-00375, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That the roof of the stair penthouse be a flat or low-sloped roof form.

REASON

The Board supported the proposed roof deck and stair tower and found it to be appropriate because the stair tower will be located toward the back of the flat roof of the building where it would be minimally visible from a public way, and because the railing will be set back from the parapet and visually transparent.

SPEAKERS

Keith Urban, applicant, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Miller asked for clarification about the roof deck roof and the applicant said that it would be used by the upper floor residential tenant.

13. Deferral Requested by Applicant

BAR Case #2018-00372

Request for alterations at 1125 King Street

Applicant: Ted Pronel Georgicsbpines LLC aka J McLaughlin

BOARD ACTION: Deferred

By unanimous consent, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the Applicant's request for deferral of BAR Case #2018-00372.

14. Application was converted to BAR Administrative Approval

CASE BAR #2018-00373

Request for signage at 1125

Applicant: Ted Pronel Georgicsbpines LLC aka J McLaughlin

15. BAR Case #2018-378

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 314 Wolfe Street Applicant: Mark Poskaitis & Jill DiPasquale

16. CASE BAR #2018-00379

Request for addition at 314 Wolfe Street Applicant: Mark Poskaitis & Jill DiPasquale

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 7-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00378 & BAR Case #2018-00379, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish/Capsulate and Certificate of Appropriateness for a second-floor addition, with the condition that the mansard roof have a stamped metal shingle or slate roof.
2. *That the applicant has the option to work with staff on the design details of an extended porch floor beneath the existing porch roof. (new condition)*
3. *That the applicant may install a second-floor window on the west side of the main block*

and may work with staff to study additional windows if historic window openings are uncovered once the aluminum siding is removed. (new condition)

REASON

The Board supported the applicant's request for alterations and an addition and gave the applicant the flexibility to add a second-floor window if there was evidence of a prior window over the existing aluminum siding, as well as allowed for the extension of the porch floor.

SPEAKERS

Steve Kulinski, architect spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

Kenneth Linnerooth, brother of the neighbor at 316 Wolfe Street, spoke in general support and asked questions about the impact of the proposed design on their adjacent front yard.

DISCUSSION

Some Board members asked the architect to explain some of the more confusing aspects of the plans. Mr. Adams said that he could support the porch floor extension for the length of the porch given the unusual at grade portion under the covered porch. He also said it might be appropriate to add a pilaster where the porch meets the new addition. Ms. Miller said that she would prefer that the addition would be constructed of brick.

Mr. Kulinski said that if the brick under the aluminum siding is painted that they will remove the paint to be consistent with the unpainted masonry on the rest of the building.

V. OTHER BUSINESS

17. Staff update on consolidation of the two Boards of Architectural Review.

18. FY 2018 Annual Report of the OHAD BAR

19. FY 2018 Annual Report for the Parker-Gray BAR

VI. ADJOURNMENT

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 9:30pm.

VII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR Case #2018-00373

Request for signage at 1125 King

Street Applicant: Ted Pronel Georgicsbpines LLC aka J McLaughlin

BAR Case #2018-00415

Request for HVAC Replacement at 128 King Street

Applicant: Jamie Durand

BAR Case #2018-00414

Request for garage door replacement in kind at 42 Alexander Street

Applicant: Daniel N. Riesenberg