

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, May 16, 2018
7:30pm, Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christina Kelley, Chair
Christine Roberts, Vice Chair
Robert Adams
John Goebel
Margaret Miller
John Sprinkle

Members Absent: Slade Elkins

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Stephanie Sample, Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm. Mr. Elkins' absence was excused. All other members were present.

II. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the **May 2, 2018** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review approved the minutes from the May 2, 2018 meeting, as submitted, 6-0.

III. CONSENT CALENDAR

3. BAR Case #2018-00183

Request for accessory structure at 917 Duke Street
Applicant: James Vavricek & Michelle Roeser

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00183, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

4. BAR Case #2018-00184

Request for signage at 1000 King Street
Applicant: Bellacara, Inc.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00183, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

IV. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

5. CASE BAR #2018-00116

Request for alterations at 610 South Fairfax Street
Applicant: Tracy Kennedy

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00116, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

REASON

The Board agreed with the staff recommendation for denial of the fence waivers and appreciated the applicant's willingness to install an architecturally appropriate fence.

SPEAKERS

Tracy Kennedy, applicant, spoke in support of the staff recommendation and stated that the staff generated image included in the staff report helped her understand exactly what her contractor proposed, which she did not support.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board moved the staff recommendation without discussion.

V. NEW BUSINESS

6. BAR Case #2018-00180

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 410 South Fairfax Street
Applicant: Chris & Lauren Bishop

The Board combined #6 & #7 for discussion purposes.

7. BAR Case #2018-00181

Request for addition and waiver of rooftop HVAC screening at 410 South Fairfax Street
Applicant: Chris & Lauren Bishop

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 5-0-1

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00180 & BAR Case #2018-0181, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0-1. Mr. Sprinkle abstained.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Any new rooftop mechanical equipment must be located on the roof of the hyphen.
2. In coordination with staff, photographically document the condition of the existing historic alley prior to initiating any construction.

3. The applicant shall be responsible for the protection of the alley during construction and restoration of any damage to historic materials or conditions caused by the construction of this project.

REASON

The Board supported the proposed addition, finding it appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines, as discussed in the staff report. The Board concurred that the new HVAC unit should be placed on the addition roof rather than the historic roof. The Board was also concerned about how the construction of the addition would impact the fragile private historic cobblestone alley adjacent to the site and conditioned their approval on the documentation, preservation and restoration of the alley.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Most of the Board supported the design and form of the proposed addition, finding the wood frame hyphen an effective way to break up the addition mass. While the adjacent historic alley is private, the Board stressed the importance of working with the neighbors to preserve alley access during construction and the need to protect the ally from construction related damage and future water drainage.

SPEAKERS

Patrick Camus, the applicant's designer, spoke in support of the project and answered questions.

Robert Pringle, 216 Wolfe Street, spoke in opposition to the large addition and the impact to the historic alley.

Francis Ayer, 212 Wolfe Street, spoke about maintaining access to the alley during construction.

John Thorpe Richards, Jr., representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in opposition to the large size of the addition and the construction impacts to the alley. He said that that the property abuts a distinctive historic alley and suggested a restudy of the addition mass and bulk.

Gail Rothrock, 209 Duke Street, spoke about the importance of the alley and that the bulk and mass of the addition on the alley is uncharacteristic of Old Town, where most additions and ells are set back from the alley. She also said that the Board did not have to approve such a large addition and that she was concerned about the loss of open space.

Yvonne Weight Callahan, 735 South Fairfax Street, spoke about her concern about potential construction damage to the adjacent alley. She said that a similar project on Gibbon Street caused irreversible damage to a historic alley so there needed to be specific conditions so that the subject alley would not be similarly damaged.

Danny Smith, co-Chair of the Historic Alexandria Resource Commission, spoke in support of the staff recommendation and preservation of the historic alley.

Stephen Milone, President, Old Town Civic Association, spoke in opposition to the size of the addition and its location on the north property line. He said that the alley should be protected during construction.

Alice Reid, 412 South Fairfax Street, spoke in support of the application.

8. BAR Case #2018-00082

Request for complete demolition at 400 North Washington Street
Applicant: Jerry Liang, Sunrise Development, Inc.

The Board combined #8 & #9 for discussion purposes.

9. BAR Case #2018-00083

Request for new construction at 400 North Washington Street
Applicant: Jerry Liang, Sunrise Development Inc.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Amended, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. Goebel, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00082 & BAR Case #2018-0083, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0. Mr. Sprinkle recused himself from this item.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Work with staff to resolve the details of the following items prior to release of the building permit:

1. Install parking garage entrance door with a less rustic character facing Princess Street;
2. Further articulate building #4 to better represent the Richardson Romanesque style;
3. Building and sign lighting should be no more than 3500 Kelvin;
4. Metal and PVC trim must have appropriate backing and joint details;
5. The six-foot fence height limitation is waived to permit a maximum eight-foot tall fence adjacent to the neighboring property at 711 Prince Street;
6. Work with staff in the field to determine HVAC rooftop visibility, and return to the BAR if additional screening is needed;
7. Extend the belt course to project the full depth of the base of the pilasters on Washington Street.

REASON

The Board felt that the project complied with the Design Guidelines and the Washington Street Standards and the applicant had addressed all of BAR's concerns from the concept review as well as details noted by staff in the report. The BAR approved the Permit to Demolish and Certificate of Appropriateness, with several conditions and requiring continued staff coordination prior to release of the building permit. The Board also waived the required fence height for the fence adjacent to 711 Prince Street, where the fence may extend to 8 feet.

DISCUSSION

The Board said that they appreciated the detailed description of the project details. Mr. Goebel said that the applicant's presentation addressed his concerns and questions. Mr. Adams suggested only that the architect extend the belt course the full depth of the base of the pilasters on the main building fronting on North Washington Street. The BAR said that they were hopeful that some of the rooftop mechanical units would not be visible from the right-of-way so not all the

screening shown on the plans would be installed. Ms. Roberts said that the lighting temperature/color on the building and illuminating the signs should be no more than 3500 Kelvin, so that it is not too bright at night along the George Washington Parkway. Ms. Roberts also noticed that she had no objection to either metal PVC for the major architectural trim but noticed that the backing and joint details needed to be of good quality and carefully installed so that the joints are visually minimized the surface of the material does not warp or oil-can. The Board discussed the need to further articulate building #4 to more obviously reflect the Richardson Romanesque style. Ms. Miller noted that the garage door facing Princess Street appeared to be too rustic and suggested a more appropriate design for that style building.

SPEAKERS

John Rust, architect, presented the project details and answered questions.

Johannes Van Zyl, 711 Princess Street, spoke in support of the project and asked the Board to approve the waiver of fence height so that the fence can be 8 feet tall along his property line.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

10. Work Session to discuss revisions to the Administrative Shed and Sign policy and an introduction of the draft Masonry Design Guidelines
 - a. *Sheds*
On a motion by Mr. Goebel, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the revised Administrative Shed Policy. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.
 - b. *Signs*
On a motion by Mr. Adams, and seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the revised Administrative Sign Policy. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.
 - c. *Masonry*
On a motion by Mr. Goebel, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to endorse the draft Masonry Guideline so that it can be circulated for comment. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.
11. Letters of support for initiating a NHL Nomination for 413 Prince Street
The Board deferred endorsement of the letter on procedural questions and will take it up again at the next public hearing.
12. Masonry Workshop
Staff reminded the Board of the upcoming workshop on Saturday, May 19, 2018.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 10:45 pm.

VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR Case #2018-00189

Request for antenna at 312 South Washington Street

Applicant: Urban Rock Old Town, llc

Bar Case #2018-00198

Request for Phase I – II roof and chimney repairs at 619 South Lee Street

Applicant: Quill Architects

BAR Case #2018-00199

Request for in kind roof replacement at 401 Wilkes Street

Applicant: J. Smith

BAR Case #2018-00206

Request for door repair at 208 Gibbon Street

Applicant: Maura Dunn

BAR Case #2018-00207

Request for signage at 1605 King Street

Applicant: Outdoor Power Equipment Institute

BAR Case #2018-00208

Request for shed at 721 South Fairfax Street

Applicant: Kathy E. Loretta

BAR Case #2018-00210

Request for window replacement at 539 South Saint Asaph Street

Applicant: Adam Moyers

BAR Case #2018-00212

Request for signs at 215 South Union Street

Applicant: George Spicer

BAR Case #2018-00213

Request for roof replacement at 207 South Fairfax Street

Applicant: Betty & Paul Foster

BAR Case #2018-00214

Request for door replacement at 811 Church Street

Applicant: Maria Meza

BAR Case #2018-00215

Request for window replacement at 1250 South Washington Street suite 820

Applicant: Raphael Botbol

BAR Case #2018-00216

Request for vents at 402 South Lee Street

Applicant: Joyce Bliss