

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, April 18, 2018
7:30pm, Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christina Kelley, Chair
Christine Roberts, Vice Chair
Robert Adams
Slade Elkins
John Goebel
Margaret Miller
John Sprinkle

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Principal Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm. All members were present.

II. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the **April 4, 2018** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted

By unanimous consent, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review approved the minutes from the April 4, 2018 meeting, as submitted.

III. CONSENT AGENDA

3. CASE BAR #2018-00136

Request for alterations at 904 Franklin Street
Applicant: Natascha Syre O' Leary

BOARD ACTION: Approved as Submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00136, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

4. CASE BAR #2018-00137

Request for demolition/capsulation at 813 S Royal Street
Applicant: Robin Tucker

BOARD ACTION:

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. Sprinkle, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00137, as submitted. The motion carried on a roll-call vote of 7-0.

REASON

The Board had no objection to the limited amount of demolition on a later addition.

SPEAKERS

Robin Tucker was available for questions.

5. CASE BAR #2018-00116

Request for alterations at 610 South Fairfax Street
Applicant: Tracy Kennedy

BOARD ACTION:

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review noted the Applicant's request for deferral of BAR Case #2018-00116.

6. CASEBAR #2018-00138

Request for partial demolition at 214 Green Street
Applicants: Chris and Courtney Capistran

The Board combined #6 & #7 for discussion purposes.

7. CASE BAR #2018-00139

Request for alterations at 214 Green Street
Applicants: Chris and Courtney Capistran

BOARD ACTION:

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Goebel, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2018-00138 & BAR Case #2018-00139, as submitted. The motion carried on a roll-call vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Shift the shed dormer on the rear roof slope to the east approximately 1', so that the west wall of the dormer generally aligns with the east wall of the chimney;
2. Align the windows of the shed dormer with the center of the paired windows on the floor below;
3. The new windows must comply with the BAR's adopted *Alexandria Replacement Window Performance Specifications*; and
4. The shutters must be architecturally appropriate and constructed of wood or a solid-through-the-core, millable composite material with a smooth finish.

5. The applicant may use fiber cement siding with fiber cement or solid PVC trim rather than the wood trim noted on the dormers on the front elevation.

REASON

The Board found the proposed addition to be well-designed and consistent with the Design Guidelines.

DISCUSSION

The Board complimented the owner and project designer on the final design and appreciated their willingness to work with staff to come up with a more compatible design. The applicant confirmed that the unpainted brick on the rear wall will remain unpainted.

SPEAKERS

Chris Capistran, owner, responded to questions and agreed to all the conditions.

Bradley Linden, designer, responded to questions.

8. CASE BAR #2017-00435

Request for partial demolition at 417 King Street
Applicant: TB Cantina, LLC

The Board combined #8 & #9 for discussion purposes.

9. CASE BAR #2018-00156

Request for alterations and HVAC waiver at 417 King Street
Applicant: TB Cantina, LLC

BOARD ACTION:

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2017-00435 & BAR Case #2018-00156, as amended. The motion carried on a roll-call vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The exterior lighting shall be dimmable and the final illumination level is contingent upon approval by staff in the field to ensure that it is equal to or less than other lighting in the area. The color of the lighting must be warmer rather than cooler, measuring no greater than 4100K
2. In place of the proposed opaque film on the courtyard windows, the window glass must either be replaced by a high-quality, opaque, traditional building material or, alternatively, the applicant could work with staff to create interpretive graphics panels rooted in the history of this site.

REASON

The Board was generally supportive of the request, noting that all the proposed alterations were improvements to the storefront of this 1960s urban renewal building. The Board noted that bright white color LED lighting, that verged on blue, was not compatible with the overall character of the historic district and conditioned a warmer color, consistent with other recent approvals for sign lighting.

DISCUSSION

The Board's discussion centered primarily on the color of the sign lighting. The Board noted that it is the BAR's practice to require externally illuminated signs to have a dimmer switch with final intensity levels to be determined by staff in the field. The Board noted that the recent proliferation of LED lighting, while positive because they use less energy, tends to be a bright white color and that it is important that the overall lighting in the district be warmer rather than cooler. The BAR reviewed the chart in the applicant's materials, which displayed a spectrum of color ranging from a warm 2700K to a blue/white 6100K, and noted as strong preference for the warmer end of the color spectrum. Acknowledging that the applicant's design intent was for a "white" light on the white letters, the Board agreed to allow up to 4100K. The Board also noted that the lighting color and warmth should be studied and asked staff to prepare an amendment to the sign policy to clarify their preference. The Board also stated that alterations to the rear windows should be done so as to encourage the future use and activation of the currently dead courtyard space. The Board agreed that a high-quality opaque traditional building material or historic interpretive window graphics were the preferred treatments.

SPEAKERS

Cathy Puskar, representing the applicant, responded to questions.

Leanne Andrysco, representing the applicant, responded to questions.

John Thorpe Richards, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, expressed concern about the illumination levels and agreed with the staff recommendations.

Stephen Milone, president of the Old Town Civic Association, agreed with the lighting condition and expressed concern about the bright white color of the lighting.

10. CASE BAR #2018-00146

Request for complete demolition at 114 South Washington Street

Applicant: J. River 699 Prince St., LLC

BOARD ACTION:

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00146, as amended. The motion carried on a roll-call vote of 6-0-1. Mr. Sprinkle recused himself.

CONDITION OF APPROVAL

Carefully remove and save the existing plaque commemorating the church that was located on the site until the 1940s, before being relocated to Cameron Mills Road. Reinstall the plaque in a visible location on the new building.

REASON

The Board had no objection to the demolition of the 1976 parking garage. However, they found the plaque marking the historic building previously located on the site to be important for recalling the evolution of the site.

DISCUSSION

The Board had little discussion beyond noting that the current parking garage has a negative impact on the streetscape and that retention of the historical plaque was important.

SPEAKERS

Cathy Puskar, representing the applicant, introduced the project and responded to questions.

Kevin Sperry, project architect, gave a presentation and responded to questions.

Laurie Wirth, President of the Morrison Office Condo Owners Association, expressed concerns regarding construction and access to their parking.

11. CASE BAR #2018-00114

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 699 Prince Street

Applicant: J. River 699 Prince, LLC

BOARD ACTION:

On a motion by Mr. Goebel, and seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00114, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote 6-0-1. Mr. Sprinkle recused himself.

REASON

The Board found the limited demolition and capsulation proposed to be acceptable and found that the scope of the proposed work applied primarily to later alterations and additions. The Board was supportive of the overall project.

DISCUSSION

The Board was found the proposal to be appropriate and had limited discussion on this case.

SPEAKERS

Cathy Puskar, representing the applicant, introduced the project and responded to questions.

Kevin Sperry, project architect, gave a presentation and responded to questions.

V. OTHER BUSINESS

12. BAR Case #2018-00147

Request for concept review of new construction at 114 South Washington Street

Applicant: J. River 699 Prince St., LLC

DISCUSSION

The Board was very enthusiastic about the project and generally agreed with the comments in the staff analysis. It was recommended that the architect fully study the overall circulation of the project as it relates to connecting the two buildings, fully utilizing the expanded alley space for public activity wherever possible. The Board generally liked the angled window jambs but requested further details and a large-scale mock up at the next meeting. It was noted that these windows successfully provided a subtle differentiation between the new construction and historic punched windows in the original building. The Board particularly liked the proposed public engagement that could be possible in a wider alley, the proposed brick detailing and the contextual approach that referenced the scale, proportions and character defining architectural details of the original hotel.

By an informal straw poll of 6-0-1, the BAR conceptually supported the proposed height, scale, mass and general architectural character of the proposed new construction. It was requested that

the applicant provide a physical sample of the proposed angled window when returning for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

SPEAKERS

Cathy Puskar, representing the applicant, introduced the project and responded to questions.

Kevin Sperry, project architect, gave a presentation and responded to questions.

Stephen Milone, 907 Prince Street, agreed with the staff recommendations and was in overall support of the project with some design detail suggestions.

John Harman, 113 South Saint Asaph Street, had occupied the property since 1975 and made general comments.

Laurie Wirth, 115C South Saint Asaph Street, appreciated the developer's efforts to reach out to adjacent property owners. She expressed concern regarding parking and pedestrian safety in the alley.

John Thorpe Richards, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, agreed with the comments made by the National Park Service.

13. Sign Light Study

The OHAD BAR asked staff to research the color and intensity of the LED lighting now being used for buildings and signs in the historic districts and to provide recommendations to amend the BAR's Administrative Approval of Signs policy to provide more clarity for applicants and the Board.

14. Consolidation of the two Boards of Architectural Review

At the Chair's request staff provided background on the recent proposal by Vice Mayor Wilson and Councilman Smedberg to initiate a text amendment to study consolidation of the OHAD and Parker-Gray BARs. Mr. Sprinkle thought that this could have a positive preservation outcome and noted that this could be an opportunity to clarify the qualifications needed for BAR members, perhaps using the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications Standards. He also asked whether the BAR should be limited to seven members, suggesting nine. Mr. Goebel agreed that the idea of consolidation made sense but wanted to see a transition plan. Mr. Adams agreed. Ms. Roberts stated that she did not want the BAR to be regulated by the Department of the Interior's Professional Qualifications Standards and thought Alexandria should tailor its own. Ms. Miller agreed that this was a good idea that made sense but thought seven members worked fine and nine is more than is needed. She recommended that a variety of professionals be on the Board. Mr. Elkins wanted what was best for the City, the built environment and the Citizens. He thought meeting every two weeks would be a benefit for Parker-Gray property owners. Ms. Kelley agreed that it was unfair for P-G residents to have to wait a month if they were deferred. Mr. Sprinkle stressed the need for continuity, using a mix of existing members of both boards.

The Chair noted that she would pass the BAR members comments to City Council in a memo prior to Council's discussion on April 24, 2018.

VI. ADJOURNMENT

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 10:00 pm.

VII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR Case #2018-00087

Request for window, door, and exterior lighting replacement at 201 North Washington Street

Applicant: Military Official Association

BAR Case #2018-00125

Request for repair at 201 South Washington Street

Applicant: City of Alexandria

BAR Case #2018-00126

Request for fence replacement at 902 Franklin Street

Applicant: Gerald Fitzgerald

BAR Case #2018-00128

Request for window and exhaust fan replacement at 308 Duke Street

Applicant: C & P Williams

BAR Case #2018-00129

Request for signs at 805 King Street

Applicant: Old Town, LLC

BAR Case #2018-00130

Request for signs at 121 South Royal Street

Applicant: Alexandria & Co.

BAR Case #2018-00133

Request for exterior light at 1221 Duke Street

Applicant: Linda Guillard

BAR Case #2018-00134

Request for window and door replacement at 441 North Lee Street

Applicant: Alexprop, LLC

BAR Case #2018-00135

Request for roof repair at 609 South Saint Asaph Street

Applicant: Walter Nictelin

BAR Case #2018-00141

Request for window replacement at 124 South Royal Street

Applicant: James Turner

BAR Case #2018-00142

Request for shutters at 307 North Washington Street

Applicant: Brian Branton

BAR Case #2018-00143
Request for signage at 100 King Street
Applicant: Mia's Italian Kitchen

BAR Case #2018-00144
Request for roof replacement at 209 North Pitt Street
Applicant: Martin Allen

BAR Case #2018-00153
Request for roof repair at 224 Green Street
Applicant: Mark Romaneski

BAR Case #2018-00154
Request for window repair at 1250 South Washington Street
Applicant: Hilary Peoples

BAR Case #2018-00155
Request for fence repair at 726 Alfred Street
Applicant: Laurence Trembling

BAR Case #2018-00158
Request for light fixture at 225 South Lee Street
Applicant: Marci Lash