## \*\*\*\*\*DRAFT MINUTES\*\*\*\*\*

Board of Architectural Review Old & Historic Alexandria District

# Wednesday, April 4, 2018

7:30pm, Council Chambers, City Hall 301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christina Kelley, Chair

Robert Adams Slade Elkins John Goebel Margaret Miller John Sprinkle

Members Absent: Christine Roberts, Vice Chair

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager

Catherine Miliaras, Principal Planner

## I. CALL TO ORDER

**1.** The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:32 pm. All other members were present.

## II. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the, March 7, 2018 public hearing.

# **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

By unanimous consent, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review approved the minutes from the March 7, 2018 meeting, as submitted.

3. Consideration of the minutes from the, March 21, 2018 public hearing.

The Board acknowledged the cancellation of the March 21, 2018 hearing due to inclement weather and noted that there were no minutes to be approved.

# III. CONSENT AGENDA

## 4. CASE BAR #2017-00166

Request for alterations at 109 Duke Street Applicant: Martha & Steven Peterson

# **BOARD ACTION:** Deferred for restudy, 6-0

Docket item was removed from consent for discussion.

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Goebel, and with the concurrence of the applicant, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to defer for further restudy BAR Case #2017-00166. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

## REASON

The Board had concerns with the overall design approach and noted that additional information (more details and a perspective view) were necessary in order to properly evaluate the request.

## **SPEAKERS**

Duncan Blair, representing the applicant, spoke in support and responded to questions.

Sue Nelson, project designer, responded to questions.

Steven Spicer, representing his parents at 215 South Union Street, expressed concerns regarding construction activity blocking access in the private alley.

Lauren Stack, 220 South Lee Street, spoke in support of the project.

Elaine Johnston, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in opposition, noting the HAF plaque on the house and citing concerns about the new porch competing with the historic portion of the house.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board recognized that this property was challenging since the historic Federal Style house had what appeared to be a prominent Italianate style front entrance while the functional front door was located at the later addition to the east that was set back from the sidewalk. was very sympathetic to this condition and appreciated the applicant's efforts to find a compatible and appropriate solution that would also meet their functional needs. The Board expressed concerns with the lack of detail and dimensions on the drawings, finding that the elevations did not fully explain the proposed condition. Some were concerned that adding a portico to the recessed later addition made it too visually prominent and that it would visually compete with the historic main block. Several members commented that the four proposed gas lights were too large and excessive in number. There was also concern that additional design details were submitted at the hearing without the benefit of time for the public and BAR members to review and evaluate. It was also noted that a perspective showing the relationship of the porch to the window on the east wall of the house and the setback from the sidewalk Some BAR members thought the design concept of a side porch was acceptable, though they were not enthusiastic in their support, while the majority did not understand what the proposed porch would actually look like and thought that a restudy was necessary.

## 5. CASE BAR #2018-00079

Request for alterations at 1211 Prince Street

Applicant: Daniel Crane

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00079, as submitted on the Consent Calendar. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

#### 6. CASE BAR #2018-00081

Request for alterations at 801 South Fairfax Street

Applicant: Lawrence & Victoria Farrell

# **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00081, as submitted on the Consent Calendar. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

## 7. CASE BAR #2018-00095

Request for alterations at 813 South Columbus Street

Applicant: Robert & Barbara Szumowski

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00095, as submitted on the Consent Calendar. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

## CONDITION OF APPROVAL

As required by the BAR's adopted window policy, all glazing must be clear, non-reflective and without tint. Low-E (low emissivity) glazing is encouraged for energy conservation but the glass must have a minimum 72% visible light transmission (VLT) with a through-the-glass shading coefficient between 0.87-1.0, and reflectance of less than 10%. Low-E 272 generally meets these criteria.

# IV. <u>UNFINISHED BUSINESS</u>

## 8. CASE BAR #2017-00432

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 926 South Saint Asaph Street Applicant: John & Elise Latawiec

The Board combined #8 & #9 for discussion purposes.

## 9. CASE BAR #2017-00433

Request for alterations at 926 South Saint Asaph Street

Applicant: John & Elise Latawiec

# **BOARD ACTION:** Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle, and seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2017-00432 & BAR Case #2017-00433, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

## CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

- 1. The door and windows shall fully comply with the BAR's adopted policies for new construction for glass transparency and muntins; and,
- 2. The archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the

requirements:

- a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

## REASON

The Board found the revised drawings to more accurately reflect the request and found the proposal to be appropriate and consistent with the *Design Guidelines*.

## **SPEAKERS**

Elise Latawiec, owner, responded to questions.

Larry Hill, project designer, responded to questions.

#### BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board asked minor questions about the design and it was noted that the majority of this onestory addition was not visible from a public way due to the solid wood privacy fence at the rear alley. Some questioned the design which did not appear to be an aesthetic improvement over the existing, though the BAR noted the applicant's desire for increased interior functionality by removing the angled corners of the plan.

# V. <u>NEW BUSINESS</u>

## 10. CASE BAR #2018-00047

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 413 Prince Street

Applicants: 413 Prince Street LLC

The Board combined #10 & #11 for discussion purposes.

## 11. CASE BAR #2018-00048

Request for alterations at 413 Prince Street

Applicants: 413 Prince Street LLC

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle, and seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00047 & BAR Case #2018-00048, as submitted.

The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

## **REASON**

The Board found the proposed design to be an appropriate and compatible porch addition to the historic building, now used as four apartments, at the rear of this property.

## **SPEAKERS**

Ashley Wilson, owner and architect, spoke in support and responded to questions.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board commended the applicant on the clear application materials, the sympathetic detailing and the overall appropriateness of the design.

## 12. CASE BAR #2018-00051

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 312 South Washington Street Applicant: UrbanRock Old Town, LLC

The Board combined #12 & #13 for discussion purposes.

## 13. CASE BAR #2018-00052

Request for alterations and addition at 312 South Washington Street

Applicant: UrbanRock Old Town, LLC

# **BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 5-0-1**

On a motion by Mr. Elkins, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00051 & BAR Case #2018-00052, as amended. The motion carried on a vote 5-0-1. Mr. Sprinkle recused himself.

## CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

- 1. Utilize the Alternate Storefront Option, dated 03-20-18 and included with this report as Attachment 3, that retains more brick around the entrance at the ground floor; includes three sets of triple attic windows; incorporates a simple glass canopy extending from beneath the brick lintel over the front entrance; and lowers the storefront cornice to terminate just below the belt course.
- 2. The brick wall and wood fence may be no taller than six feet in height.
- 3. Work with staff to determine the minimum height necessary to effectively screen the rooftop mechanical equipment from public way; including the elimination of the mechanical screening on the terrace portion where there is no functional need for screening.
- 4. The relocated antenna must be located to be as minimally visible as possible while meeting its technical requirements, may only be installed on the penthouse, may not project above the penthouse roof and must be painted to match the adjacent wall surface.
- 5. Staff shall have the authority to administratively approve up to three signs, generally in conformance with the conceptual sign locations shown in the submitted drawings, provided that the signs meet all zoning requirements and other BAR policies.
- **6.** The applicant shall work with staff to refine the details of the proposed second cornice at the top of the building wall.

## **REASON**

The BAR supported the proposed partial demolition and numerous alterations to this mid-20<sup>th</sup>-century Colonial Revival building on the Parkway, finding the alterations to be appropriate on this building in this location and consistent with the Design Guidelines.

## **SPEAKERS**

John Rust and Scott Fleming, project architects, gave a presentation and responded to questions.

## BOARD DISCUSSION

The BAR appreciated the applicant's effort to providing alternate options based on staff comments and found the applicant's approach to be thoughtful and sympathetic. The BAR liked the visual relief of retaining the existing brick entrance but also adding a contemporary glass and steel awning just below. It was noted that this approach differentiated the residential

entrance from the adjacent storefronts. The BAR also found that breaking up the attic story ribbon windows into three groupings was more successful than a continuous ribbon window. There was concern about the second cornice – how would it match the existing precast cornice and how to treat the top floor windows and cornices as more of a classical attic course and to avoid simply duplicating the existing cornice. The BAR also inquired about staining the brick and the applicant noted that it would only be done if the existing brick could not be salvaged and the proposed infill brick was not an accurate match after cleaning the existing brick.

## 14. CASE BAR #2018-00069

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 311 South Royal Street

Applicant: Danielle N. George

The Board combined #14 & #15 for discussion purposes.

## 15. CASE BAR #2018-00070

Request for alterations and addition at 311 South Royal Street

Applicant: Danielle N. George

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Elkins, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00069 & BAR Case #2018-00070, as amended. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

## CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

- 1. Work with staff on additional detailing for the columns on the rear porch and balustrade.
- 2. Use an architecturally appropriate but slightly different profile siding to better differentiate the new portions of the building from the old.
- 3. 2/2 sash windows may be used for all new windows.
- 4. The applicant should use a solid front door, with final approval of the style by staff, and may also include a storm door, at her discretion.
- 5. The statements in archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that in the unlikely event that archaeological materials are encountered during construction contractors should contact Alexandria Archaeology:
  - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
  - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collecting to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

## **REASON**

The BAR found the proposed addition and alterations to be appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines. The BAR found that 2/2 windows on the addition would be acceptable as those windows would be a modern material in contrast to the 2/2 historic wood windows being restored on the historic building. Additionally, it was confirmed that the siding on the addition should have a slightly different exposure to further differentiate the new from the old.

## **SPEAKERS**

Gayland French, representing the architect, spoke in support and responded to questions.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The BAR supported the design and found it compatible and appropriately scaled. There was discussion regarding the use of 1/1 or 2/2 windows on the addition. Additionally, the BAR recommended that a solid door be used at the front entrance in place of that existing  $20^{\rm th}$ -century half-glass door which seemed stylistically incompatible.

## 16. CASE BAR #2018-00096

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 217 North Pitt Street

Applicant: Leonard Taylor Jr. and Lana Rae Skirboll

The Board combined #16 & #17 for discussion purposes.

## 17. CASE BAR #2018-00097

Request for addition at 217 North Pitt Street

Applicant: Leonard Taylor Jr. and Lana Rae Skirboll

# **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00096 & BAR Case #2018-00097, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

## CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

- 1. The statements in archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
  - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
  - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

## REASON

The BAR found the proposed addition and alterations to be appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines.

# **SPEAKERS**

Steve Kulinski, project architect, spoke in support.

Phillip Matyas, 219 North Pitt Street, spoke in support and offered a copy of an agreement between he and the applicant. This private agreement was largely for items that were not visible from a public way and were, therefore, outside the BAR's purview.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The BAR noted the minimal visibility of this addition from a public way and had minimal discussion and found the design to be similar in scale to the neighbors and well executed.

## 18. BAR Case #2018-00115

Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 402 Prince Street

Applicant: Sirine Hafez & Shaun Fisher

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approved BAR Case #2018-00095, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

## **REASON OF APPROVAL**

The BAR had no concern with the limited amount of demolition for the reasons noted in the staff report.

## CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

- 1. The following statements shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
- a. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- b. No metal detection or artifact collection may be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

## **DISCUSSION**

There was no discussion.

## **SPEAKERS**

Patrick Camus, project architect, was available for questions and agreed with the proposed condition.

# VI. OTHER BUSINESS

# 1. Gas Meter Policy

a. On a motion by Mr. Sprinkle, and seconded by Mr. Goebel, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to adopt the Gas Meter Policy as part of the BAR administrative approval policies. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

# 2. Work session to review window revisions to OHAD Policy for Administrative Approval

 a. On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Sprinkle, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to adopt amendments to the Administrative Approval Policy related to windows. The motion carried on a vote 6-0.

- 3. Mr. Cox updated the Board on upcoming events including AIA Architecture Week and Preservation Month.
- 4. Ms. Kelley provided information about an upcoming workshop on cleaning masonry that is being sponsored by the local APT chapter on April 20-21.

# VII. ADJOURNMENT

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 10:00 pm.

# VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR Case #2018-00068

Request for window sill replacement at 717 South Royal Street

Applicant: Blair G. Ege

BAR Case #2018-00075

Request for signage at 602 King Street Applicant: Suksompop Nimmannit

BAR Case #2018-00099

Request for window replacement at 328 North Royal Street

Applicant: Brian Hong

BAR Case #2018-00100

Request for window replacement at 412 Queen Street

Applicant: Brian Higgins

BAR Case #2018-00101

Request for window and door replacement at 606 Ford's Landing Street

Applicant: Patricia Walkup

BAR Case #2018-00102

Request for fence at 220 South Lee Street

Applicant: Lauren Stack

BAR Case #2018-00103

Request for repair of HVA at 800 South Saint Asaph Street

Applicant: Deborah Bowman

BAR Case #2018-00105

Request for gas meter at 608 Oronoco Street

Applicant: Leslie Arial

BAR Case #2018-00108

Request for roof replacement and attic vent at 409 North Saint Asaph

Applicant: Rochelle Gray

BAR Case #2018-00109

Request for chimney cap and venting at 404 South Lee Street

Applicant: David Adams

BAR Case #2018-00110

Request for window replacement at 222 South Alfred Street

Applicant: John Weyrich

BAR Case #2018-00112

Request for window repair at 608 Cameron Street

Applicant: Dan and Lillian York

BAR Case #2018-00113

Request for window and door replacement at 604 Battery Street

Applicant: Latta Chapman

BAR Case #2018-00117

Request for chimney repair at 117 Prince Street

Applicant: Ivy Whitlach

BAR Case #2018-00120

Request for vent at 1 Wilkes Street

Applicant: Susan Duboe and Robert Haddock

BAR Case #2018-00121

Request for siding repair at 220 South Fairfax Street

Applicant: Lawrence Seyfried III