Docket Item # 10&11 BAR CASE # 2017-00340 & 2017-00341

BAR Meeting October 4, 2017

ISSUE:	After-the-Fact Permit to Demolish/Capsulate and Certificate of Appropriateness for Alterations
APPLICANT:	PRS Holdings, LLC
LOCATION:	923 South Alfred Street
ZONE:	RM/Townhouse zone

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the new deck and denial of the vinyl windows with the following conditions:

- 1. The new deck must be painted or stained to complement the predominant color of the building or the color of the trimwork.
- 2. The applicant must replace the existing vinyl windows with aluminum-clad SDL windows that match the existing window configuration and comply with the Alexandria Boards of Architectural Review Window Policy within three months.
- 3. The applicant must provide final specifications to confirm conformance with the Window Policy as part of the building permit process, with final approval by staff.

GENERAL NOTES TO THE APPLICANT

- 1. ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND PERMITS TO DEMOLISH: Applicants must obtain a stamped copy of the Certificate of Appropriateness or Permit to Demolish PRIOR to applying for a building permit. Contact BAR Staff, Room 2100, City Hall, 703-746-3833, or preservation@alexandriava.gov for further information.
- 2. APPEAL OF DECISION: In accordance with the Zoning Ordinance, if the Board of Architectural Review denies or approves an application in whole or in part, the applicant or opponent may appeal the Board's decision to City Council on or before 14 days after the decision of the Board.
- 3. COMPLIANCE WITH BAR POLICIES: All materials must comply with the BAR's adopted policies unless otherwise specifically approved.
- 4. BUILDING PERMITS: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-746-4200 for further information.
- 5. EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.
- HISTORIC PROPERTY TAX CREDITS: Applicants performing extensive, certified rehabilitations of historic properties may separately be eligible for state and/or federal tax credits. Consult with the <u>Virginia Department of</u> <u>Historic Resources (VDHR)</u> prior to initiating any work to determine whether the proposed project may qualify for such credits.



I. <u>ISSUE</u>

The applicant requests after-the-fact approval of a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate to demolish the existing rear deck. In addition, the applicant is requesting after-the-fact approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new deck and to retain existing inappropriate vinyl windows.

The application is in response to a neighbor's complaint regarding the vinyl windows, demolition of the deck and construction of the current deck.

II. <u>HISTORY</u>

The two-story brick-clad cinderblock rowhouse at 923 South Alfred Street was originally part of an apartment complex constructed in the 1940s or 1950s as the apartment complex first appears on the 1958 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. In 1977, the Board approved the conversion of the four connected apartment buildings (then known as 911, 915, 919 & 932 South Alfred Street) to eight single family rowhomes (now known as 909, 911, 913, 915, 917, 919, 921 and 923 South Alfred Street). Michael & Michael served as the architect for the conversion. Architectural embellishments were added to the fronts of all eight units and the exteriors of several units were painted while openings at the rear were altered, allowing each unit to read and function as a separate two-story rowhouse. The work was completed in 1978.

Previous BAR Approvals:

In 2017, staff administratively approved the in-kind replacement of the front door and repair of the rear fence.

In 1981, the Board approved the construction of a wood deck.

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>

Permit to Demolish

In considering a Permit to Demolish, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, §10-105(B):

Standard	Description of Standard	Standard Met?
(1)	Is the building or structure of such	No
	architectural or historical interest that its	
	moving, removing, capsulating or razing	
	would be to the detriment of the public	
	interest?	
(2)	Is the building or structure of such	No
	interest that it could be made into a	
	historic house?	
(3)	Is the building or structure of such old	No
	and unusual or uncommon design,	
	texture and material that it could not be	
	reproduced or be reproduced only with	
	great difficulty?	

(4)	Would retention of the building or structure help preserve the memorial character of the George Washington Memorial Parkway?	N/A
(5)	Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?	No
(6)	Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?	No

The previous 20'x10' deck was approved on the east (rear) elevation by the Board in 1981. The wood deck was only accessible through the interior of the house and only visible from the public alley adjacent to the property. The deck was a later architectural feature and did not contribute to the property's historic significance. Staff finds none of the criteria are met and the Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate should be granted as submitted.



Figure 1: Approved 1981 deck before demolition.

Certificate of Appropriateness

The applicant is requesting after-the-fact approval for a new wood deck. The deck was construction to replace the 1981 deck that was demolished without Board approval. The new deck is smaller in size (14'x12') and includes a set of stairs which makes it accessible from the backyard. Excluding the stairs, the overall design of the new deck is similar to the 1981 approved deck. It is constructed of wood with metal railings and is built in the same location as the previous deck.

The *Design Guidelines* state that as a general rule decks are suburban in character and not appropriate in the historic districts. Nevertheless, the Boards are cognizant of the amenity that open air decks create and has approved the construction of decks in a number of instances in sections of the historic districts that have a distinctly suburban feel or where there is minimal visibility of the deck from a public way. 923 South Alfred Street is in the southwest quadrant of the Old and Historic Alexandria District, this section of the district has a very distinct suburban feel and the deck will only be visible from the public alley. Staff finds the new deck to be architecturally appropriate.



Figure 2: View of new deck from public alley.

Additionally, the applicant is also requesting an after-the-fact approval for vinyl windows. Based on documentations provide by the current property the owner, the non-complying windows were installed in the early 1990s by the previous property owner. Staff did not find a record of the Board approving the existing vinyl windows.

The *Design Guidelines* states that the size, location, type and trim of windows are a defining element of historic architectural styles. The proportion of a building façade made up of windows is also an important architectural design element. The use of vinyl windows is discouraged by the guidelines. Also, the *Alexandria Boards of Architectural Review Window Policy* states that

vinyl or vinyl clad windows, and windows with removable muntins ("grilles") or muntins sandwiched between the glass, are not considered appropriate or compatible in any location in the Old and Historic Alexandria District.

The BAR's Window Policy currently states that a building must be constructed in 1965, or later, for staff to administratively approve aluminum-clad windows. However, in a number of instances in the southwest quadrant of the district the Board has approved alternative window materials, including aluminum-clad and fiberglass, particularly when the building was set back from the street. 923 South Alfred Street is set back approximately 25' feet from the street and while staff does not support the applicant retaining the existing vinyl windows, staff supports the use of aluminum-clad SDL wood windows in this case. It is also important to note that the district's boundary line is in the middle of the public alley to the west of the property. The windows on the rear (west) elevation will only be visible from outside of the historic district.

In summary, staff recommends **approval of the after-the-fact replacement deck and denial of the request to retain the existing vinyl windows**. Staff has no objection to the use of aluminum-clad windows, provided that they otherwise meet the Board's window policy because of the reasons stated above. As the Board may remember, staff and the Design Guidelines subcommittee are about to undertake a project to study and amend a number of existing Board policies and Design Guidelines. Staff recommends that this issue be considered as part of that initiative.



Figure 3: Existing front (east) elevation with vinyl windows.



Figure 4: Existing side (front) elevation with vinyl windows

STAFF

Amirah Lane, Historic Preservation Planner, Planning & Zoning Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager, Planning & Zoning

IV. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C- code requirement R- recommendation S- suggestion F- finding

Zoning

C-1 The proposed deck complies with zoning.

Code Administration

No comments received.

Transportation and Environmental Services

- R-1 The building permit must be approved and issued prior to the issuance of any permit for demolition. (T&ES)
- R-2 Applicant shall be responsible for repairs to the adjacent city right-of-way if damaged during construction activity. (T&ES)
- R-3 No permanent structure may be constructed over any existing private and/or public utility easements. It is the responsibility of the applicant to identify any and all existing easements on the plan. (T&ES)

- F-1 After review of the information provided, an approved grading plan is not required at this time. Please note that if any changes are made to the plan it is suggested that T&ES be included in the review. (T&ES)
- F-2 If the alley located at the rear of the parcel is to be used at any point of the construction process the following will be required:
 <u>For a Public Alley -</u> The applicant shall contact T&ES, Construction Permitting & Inspections at (703) 746-4035 to discuss any permits and accommodation requirements that will be required.
 <u>For a Private Alley</u> The applicant must provide proof, in the form of an affidavit at a minimum, from owner of the alley granting permission of use. (T&ES)
- C-1 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Solid Waste Control, Title 5, Chapter 1, which sets forth the requirements for the recycling of materials (Sec. 5-1-99). (T&ES)
- C-2 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Noise Control Code, Title 11, Chapter 5, which sets the maximum permissible noise level as measured at the property line. (T&ES)
- C-3 Any work within the right-of-way requires a separate permit from T&ES. (Sec. 5-2) (T&ES)
- C-4All improvements to the city right-of-way such as curbing, sidewalk, driveway aprons, etc. must be city standard design. (Sec. 5-2-1) (T&ES)

Alexandria Archaeology

No comments received.

V. <u>ATTACHMENTS</u>

1 – Application for BAR 2017-0340 & 2017-0341: 923 S Alfred Street 2 – Supplemental Materials

BAR Case #
ADDRESS OF PROJECT: 923 S Alfred Street
TAX MAP AND PARCEL: 080.03 - 14 - 15 ZONING: RM
APPLICATION FOR: (Please check all that apply)
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
PERMIT TO MOVE, REMOVE, ENCAPSULATE OR DEMOLISH (Required if more than 25 square feet of a structure is to be demolished/impacted)
WAIVER OF VISION CLEARANCE REQUIREMENT and/or YARD REQUIREMENTS IN A VISION CLEARANCE AREA (Section 7-802, Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)
WAIVER OF ROOFTOP HVAC SCREENING REQUIREMENT (Section 6-403(B)(3), Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)
Applicant: M Property Owner 🔲 Business (Please provide business name & contact person)
Name: PRS Holdings, UC
Address: 6447 Orland St
City: Falls Church State: VA Zip: ZZ043
Phone: E-mail :
Authorized Agent (if applicable): Attorney Architect
Name: Robert Allocca Phone: 703 859 2489
E-mail: roballocca@gmail.com
Legal Property Owner:
Name: PRS Holdings, LLC
Address: 6447 Orland St
City: Falls Church State: VA Zip: 2043
Phone: E-mail:
Yes ✓ No Is there an historic preservation easement on this property? Yes No If yes, has the easement holder agreed to the proposed alterations? Yes ✓ No Is there a homeowner's association for this property? Yes No If yes, has the homeowner's association approved the proposed alterations?

If you answered yes to any of the above, please attach a copy of the letter approving the project.

BAR Case # _

NATURE OF PROPOSED WORK: Please check all that apply

	NEW CONSTRU	CTION ERATION: <i>Please check all that ap</i>	plv.	
_	awning	fence, gate or garden wall		shutters
	doors	windows	siding .	🔲 shed
	lighting	🔲 pergola/trellis	painting unpainted masonr	y
	other deck	replacement		•
\Box	ADDITION	× •		
Ø	DEMOLITION/EN	CAPSULATION		
	SIGNAGE			

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED WORK: Please describe the proposed work in detail (Additional pages may be attached).

After-the-fact permit for demolition of deteriorating deck; After-the-fact certificate of appropriateness for new deck. After-the-fact window approval

SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS:

Items listed below comprise the **minimum supporting materials** for BAR applications. Staff may request additional information during application review. Please refer to the relevant section of the *Design Guidelines* for further information on appropriate treatments.

Applicants must use the checklist below to ensure the application is complete. Include all information and material that are necessary to thoroughly describe the project. Incomplete applications will delay the docketing of the application for review. Pre-application meetings are required for all proposed additions. All applicants are encouraged to meet with staff prior to submission of a completed application.

Electronic copies of submission materials should be submitted whenever possible.

Demolition/Encapsulation : All applicants requesting 25 square feet or more of demolition/encapsulation must complete this section. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

/	N/A
D	

- Survey plat showing the extent of the proposed demolition/encapsulation.
- Existing elevation drawings clearly showing all elements proposed for demolition/encapsulation.
- Clear and labeled photographs of all elevations of the building if the entire structure is proposed to be demolished.
 - Description of the reason for demolition/encapsulation.
 - Description of the alternatives to demolition/encapsulation and why such alternatives are not considered feasible.

BAR Case

Additions & New Construction: Drawings must be to scale and should not exceed 11" x 17" unless approved by staff. All plans must be folded and collated into 3 complete 8 1/2" x 11" sets. Additional copies may be requested by staff for large-scale development projects or projects fronting Washington Street. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

NIK	
Ľ	Scaled survey plat showing dimensions of lot and location of existing building and other
	structures on the lot, location of proposed structure or addition, dimensions of existing
	structure(s), proposed addition or new construction, and all exterior, ground and roof mounted
	equipment.
	FAD & Open Space colouinting form

- FAR & Open Space calculation form. Clear and labeled photographs of the site, surrounding properties and existing structures, if applicable.
- Existing elevations must be scaled and include dimensions.
- Proposed elevations must be scaled and include dimensions. Include the relationship to adjacent structures in plan and elevations.
- Materials and colors to be used must be specified and delineated on the drawings. Actual samples may be provided or required.
- Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows, doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.
- For development site plan projects, a model showing mass relationships to adjacent properties and structures.

Signs & Awnings: One sign per building under one square foot does not require BAR approval unless illuminated. All other signs including window signs require BAR approval. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

	N/A
	Linear feet of building: Front: Secondary front (if corner lot):
	Square feet of existing signs to remain:
	Photograph of building showing existing conditions.
\Box	Dimensioned drawings of proposed sign identifying materials, color, lettering style and text.
	Location of sign (show exact location on building including the height above sidewalk).
	Means of attachment (drawing or manufacturer's cut sheet of bracket if applicable).
	Description of lighting (if applicable). Include manufacturer's cut sheet for any new lighting
	fixtures and information detailing how it will be attached to the building's facade.

Alterations: Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

	I/A
\square	Clear and labeled photographs of the site, especially the area being impacted by the alterations,
	All sides of the building and any pertinent details.
	All sides of the building and any pertinent details. Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows,
/	doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.

- Drawings accurately representing the changes to the proposed structure, including materials and overall dimensions. Drawings must be to scale.
 - An official survey plat showing the proposed locations of HVAC units, fences, and sheds.

Historic elevations or photographs should accompany any request to return a structure to an earlier appearance.

ALL APPLICATIONS: Please read and check that you have read and understand the following items:

- I have submitted a filing fee with this application. (Checks should be made payable to the City of Alexandria. Please contact staff for assistance in determining the appropriate fee.)
- I understand the notice requirements and will return a copy of the three respective notice forms to BAR staff at least five days prior to the hearing. If I am unsure to whom I should send notice I will contact Planning and Zoning staff for assistance in identifying adjacent parcels.

I, the applicant, or an authorized representative will be present at the public hearing.

I understand that any revisions to this initial application submission (including applications deferred for restudy) must be accompanied by the BAR Supplemental form and 3 sets of revised materials.

The undersigned hereby attests that all of the information herein provided including the site plan, building elevations, prospective drawings of the project, and written descriptive information are true, correct and accurate. The undersigned further understands that, should such information be found incorrect, any action taken by the Board based on such information may be invalidated. The undersigned also hereby grants the City of Alexandria permission to post placard notice as required by Article XI, Division A, Section 11-301(B) of the 1992 Alexandria City Zoning Ordinance, on the property which is the subject of this application. The undersigned also hereby authorizes the City staff and members of the BAR to inspect this site as necessary in the course of research and evaluating the application. The applicant, if other than the property owner, also attests that he/she has obtained permission from the property owner to make this application.

APPLICANT OR AUTHORIZED AGENT:

M

Signature:	
Printed Name: David Dowles, Managing member for	PRS Holdings, CCC
Date: 8/31/17	

OWNERSHIP AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT Use additional sheets if necessary

<u>1. Applicant.</u> State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the applicant, unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership
1. PRS Holdings, LLC	6447 Orland ST Falls Church, VA 22043	100.1
2.		
3.		

<u>2. Property.</u> State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the property located at $\underline{923} \leq \underline{Alfred} \leq \underline{Street}$ (address), unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership
1. PRS Holdings, LLC	6447 Orland St Falls Church , VA 22043	100%
2.		
3.		

<u>3.</u> Business or Financial Relationships. Each person or entity listed above (1 and 2), with an ownership interest in the applicant or in the subject property is required to disclose **any** business or financial relationship, as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance, existing at the time of this application, or within the12-month period prior to the submission of this application with any member of the Alexandria City Council, Planning Commission, Board of Zoning Appeals or either Boards of Architectural Review.

Name of person or entity	Relationship as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance	Member of the Approving Body (i.e. City Council, Planning Commission, etc.)
1. David Dowies	No	NA
2.		
3.		

NOTE: Business or financial relationships of the type described in Sec. 11-350 that arise after the filing of this application and before each public hearing must be disclosed prior to the public hearings.

As the applicant or the applicant's authorized agent, I hereby attest to the best of my ability that the information provided above is true and correct.

DAVID DOWHES, MARGING Notor Printed Name for PRS Holdings, LLC Signature



DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND ZONING FLOOR AREA RATIO AND OPEN SPACE CALCULATIONS

A. Property Information 923 5. Alfred St. Alexandria MA

22314 Zone

A2.

Floor Area Ratio Allowed by Zone

Maximum Allowable Floor Area

B. Existing Gross Floor Area

Existing Gross Area*		Allowable Exclusions	
Basement	641	Basement**	
First Floor	641	Stairways**	
Second Floor	641	Mechanical**	
Third Floor		Other**	200 SAFI
Porches/ Other DEL	- 20050F1	Total Exclusions	200
Total Gross *	2123		

B1. Existing Gross Floor Area * 2/23 Sq. Ft. B2. Allowable Floor Exclusions** __Sq. Ft. B3. Existing Floor Area minus Exclusions /923 Sq. Ft. (subtract B2 from B1)

- C. Proposed Gross Floor Area (does not include existing area)

Proposed Gross Area*		Allowable Exclusions	
Basement		Basement**	
First Floor		Stairways**	
Second Floor		Mechanical**	
Third Floor		Other**	
-Porches/ Other Deck	168 50PT	Total Exclusions	0
Total Gross *			

C1. Proposed Gross Floor Area * 160 | Sq. Ft. C2. Allowable Floor Exclusions** <u>*O*</u> Sq. Ft. C3. Proposed Floor Area minus Exclusions 168 Sq. Ft. (subtract C2 from C1)

*Gross floor area is the sum of all gross horizontal areas under roof, measured from the face of exterior walls, including basements, garages, sheds, gazebos, guest buildings and other accessory buildings.

** Refer to the zoning ordinance (Section2-145(B)) and consult with zoning staff for information regarding allowable exclusions.

If taking exclusions other than basements, floor plans with excluded areas must be submitted for review. Sections may also be required for some exclusions.

D. Existing + Proposed Floor Area D1. Total Floor Area (add B3 and C3)

4236 D2. Total Floor Area Allowed by Zone (A2) Sq. Ft.

F. Open Space Calculations

Existing Open Space	1354	
Required Open Space	988.4	
Proposed Open Space	1394	

The undersigned hereby certifies and attests/that, to the best of his/her knowledge, the above computations are true and correct.

Sq. Ft.

Signature: Date:

Updated July 10, 2008





Albanese & Associates, PC

4041 University Drive Suite 301 Fairfax, VA 22030

Office 703-385-8880 Fax 703-385-1005

I hereby certify that the position of all existing improvements have been carefully located by a transit and/or tape or electronic measuring device & unless otherwise shown there are no encroachments. This plat has been provided for a transaction on or about the date of this survey. This certification is limited to the parties of this transaction. This plat is furnished for informational purposes in the issuance of title insurance and is not to be used for any design or construction or to set property corners. The fence locations shown on this plat are approximate and are not certified as to relation to the property boundaries or ownership. The settlement agent has requested this survey pursuant to the terms of a contract of sale or In conjunction with a re-finance of the subject property at the owner's, prospective purchaser's, and/or lender's direction. The settlement agent has requested that only that information required for title insurance purposes be shown and does not certify to the accuracy of any of the information shown hereon. No title report has been turnished. This plat is subject to restrictions and easements of record. Boundary and other site Information has been provided by others. o IPF indicates monuments used for location purposes. If no monuments were found the existing improvements were located from the occupation of existing features. Any reproduction of this document that does not bear an original signature is an unauthorized copy and may violate U.S. copyright laws Unauthorized copies may not be in conformance with current survey requirements under Virginia State law and shall not

CRES II, Ltd.

be used for insurance and/or mortgage underwriting.

Professional Land Surveyors 1831 Wiehle Ave., Suite 105 Reston, VA 20190 703 742 9105 WWW.Cressurveys.com





Reston, VA 20190 703 742 9105 www.cressurveys.com NOODOLL HOLL BONNA WWW.LIESSUFVEYS.COM WWW.LIESSUFVE WWW.LIESSUFVEYS.COM WWW.LIESSUFVE WWW JUNE 2

A 2231L

for location purposes. If no monuments were found the existing improvements were located from the occupation of existing features. Any

o IPF indicates monuments used

reproduction of this document

that does not bear an original signature is an unauthorized copy

and may violate U.S. copyright

accuracy of any of the information shown hereon. No title report has This plat is subject to restrictions and easements of record, Boundary and other site Information has been provided by

This plat is furnished for informational purposes in the issuance of title insurance and is not to be used for any design or construction or to set property corners. The fence locations

and/or tape or electronic measuring device & unless otherwise shown there are no This plat has been provided for a transaction on or about the date of this survey. This certification is limited to the parties of this

4041 University Drive Suite 301 Fairfax, VA 22030 Office 703-385-8880 Fax 703-385-1005

14'X12' Deck w/3'stairs

LEXANDRIA



17



1 .

