## \*\*\*\*\*DRAFT MINUTES\*\*\*\*\*

Board of Architectural Review Old & Historic Alexandria District Wednesday, January 18, 2017

7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall 301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Christina Kelley, Chair

Robert Adams
Slade Elkins
John von Senden
Margaret Miller
Christine Roberts
John Goebel

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager

Stephanie Sample, Preservation Planner

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30 pm. Mr. Elkins arrived during item #3 and did not vote on the consent calendar items.

## I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes from the **December 21, 2016** public hearing.

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.**

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes as submitted from the December 21, 2016 OHAD Board of Architectural Review hearing. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

## II. CONSENT CALENDAR

## 1. CASE BAR #2016-00444

Request for alterations at 100 Quay Street

Applicant: Magaly Galdo-Hirst and Thompson M. Hirst

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. von Senden, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00434 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0. Mr. Elkins was not present.

## 2. CASE BAR #2016-00434

Request for alterations at **324 S Pitt Street** Applicant: Jeff Fissell and Meredith Forbes

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. von Senden, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00434 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of

6-0. Mr. Elkins was not present.

#### 3. CASE BAR #2016-00436

Request for alterations at 682 N Saint Asaph Street

Applicant: Sunday in Saigon

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0**

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, and seconded by Mr. von Senden, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00436 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0. Mr. Elkins was not present.

## III. NEW BUSINESS

#### 4. CASE BAR #2016-00441

Request for partial demolition at 103 Queen Street

Applicant: Kathy and Charlie Allegrone

*Items #4 & #5 were combined for discussion purposes.* 

#### 5. CASE BAR #2016-00442

Request for alterations at 103 Queen Street

Applicant: Kathy and Charlie Allegrone

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0**

On a motion by Mr. Adams and seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00441 & 00442, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

## CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That brackets be installed under the mullions of the projecting bay window, with the final details to be approved by staff.

## **REASON**

The Board felt that the installation of simple brackets under the projecting bay window would help to create a better visual transition between the second floor and the large first floor.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board felt that the bottom plinth of the projecting bay window awkwardly over hangs the first floor and that the addition of simple brackets would help to visually support the new architectural feature using a Colonial Revival style motif.

#### **SPEAKERS**

Karen Conkey, architect, spoke in support of the project and answered questions.

#### 6. CASE BAR #2016-00425

Request for partial demolition at 724 S Fairfax Street

Applicant: Michael Lyons

*Items #6 & #7 were combined for discussion purposes.* 

## 7. CASE BAR #2016-00426

Request for alterations at 724 S Fairfax Street

Applicant: Michael Lyons

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-1**

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, and seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00425 & 00426, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6-1. Mr. Elkins voted against.

## CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

**Approval** of a Permit to Demolish to demolish the existing chimney, and a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following new materials:

- 1. Standing seam metal roof;
- 2. Metal gutters and downspouts;
- 3. Operable wood shutters;
- 4. Six foot wood gate, provided that it is located entirely on the applicant's property; and,
- 5. Six-panel wood front doors with full-light storm doors.

## **Denial** of a Certificate of Appropriateness of the following:

- 1. HardiePlank siding on the three visible elevations of the historic main block and *approval* of historically appropriate wood siding, provided that staff confirms in the field that historic wood siding does not exist below the existing cement siding; and,
- 2. Aluminum clad windows on the front and north side facades of the historic main block and *approval* of painted wood, single glazed wood windows on the front façade and wood, simulated-divided-light wood windows on the north side elevation.

## **REASON**

The majority of the Board supported the rehabilitation efforts proposed by the applicant but did not find a compelling reason to vary from the BAR's long established policies and felt that all of the materials on the historic main block of the house should be historically appropriate to the original period of construction.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The majority of the Board did not support the use of modern materials on the c1900 historic main block of the house because the use of Hardieplank siding and aluminum clad windows is inconsistent with the Board's adopted policies which state that the use of modern materials is generally appropriate only if the material was commercially available at the time of the original construction of that portion of the building. The Board noted that there are high-quality wood and treated wood siding products available that can last much longer, with less maintenance, than the yellow pine siding described by the applicant. Mr. Elkins supported the use of smooth fiber-cement siding.

## **SPEAKERS**

Mike Lyons, owner, spoke in support of the project and answered questions. He said that he was amenable to using wood single glazed windows on the front façade but wanted to use fiber cement siding for ease of maintenance.

Mark Anderson, relative, spoke in support of the application and described the poor quality of modern wood.

Yvonne Callahan, 735 S. Lee Street, representing the Old Town Civic Association, spoke in support of the staff recommendation and historically appropriate materials on the historic portion of the building.

## 8. CASE BAR #2016-00427

Request for signage at 1420 King Street

Applicant: National Society of Professional Engineers

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0**

On a motion by Ms. Miller, and seconded by Mr. Adams, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00427 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

## CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That all holes in the brick from the existing and previous signs must be filled with a brick-colored masonry restoration material. A mock-up of the restoration material must be approved by staff in the field.

## **REASON**

The Board felt that because the building was a modern building they could support the installation of new pin mounted letters, but that the existing holes in the brick should be filled using appropriate masonry restoration methods and not the colored caulk proposed by the applicant.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board agreed with the applicant that although pin mounted signs created holes in the existing brick and mortar, they could support new pin mounted letters due to the age of the building and the fact that the existing holes would be appropriately filled.

## **SPEAKERS**

Stanley Copeland, sign contractor, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

#### 9. CASE BAR #2016-00439

Request for partial demolition at 115 N Fairfax Street

Applicant: Landon Holden

Items #8 and #9 were combined for discussion purposes

## 10. CASE BAR #2016-00440

Request for alterations at 115 N Fairfax Street

Applicant: Landon Holden

## **BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0**

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, and seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00439 & 00440, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

#### CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That the applicant provide additional information demonstrating that the exterior HVAC air vents cannot be accommodated through ducting in the existing chimney chases. If the vents cannot extend through the chimney, then a single vent centered below the ridge with

a brick rowlock sill must be used.

#### REASON

The Board felt that additional discussion between the mechanical engineer and staff was necessary to determine if some or all of the venting could go through the existing flue, requiring only one vent on the gable end.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board was supportive of the large-scale renovation project currently underway at 115 N. Fairfax Street and supported the proposed skylights. The BAR agreed that the installation of simple, retractable bollards was an appropriate way to limit public access to their driveway and parking.

#### **SPEAKERS**

Landon Holden, property owner, spoke in support of the application and answered questions.

## IV. ADJOURNMENT

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 9:05 pm.

## V. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

#### CASE BAR #2017-00008

Request for roof, skylight, and snowguards at **228 S. Washington Street** Applicant: Simpson Properties, Ltd.

## CASE BAR #2017-00005

Request for roof and skylight replacement at **101 N Union Street** Applicant: Adriana Rodriguez, Virginia Roofing Corporation

#### CASE BAR #2017-00006

Request for window replacement at **106 N Saint Asaph Street** Applicant: T Salt

## CASE BAR #2016-00431

Request for alterations at **221 S Fayette Street** Applicant: John C. Rand

## CASE BAR #2016-00432

Request for in kind front door replacement at **413 Jefferson Street** Applicant: David Diamantopoulos

#### CASE BAR #2017-00003

Request for window replacement at **60 Wolfe Street** Applicant: Matt Vitek

#### CASE BAR #2016-00435

Request for door and transom replacement, new railing at **500 Gibbon Street** Applicant: Robert Webster

# **CASE BAR #2016-00429**

Request for window replacement at **417 Pitt Mews** Applicant: M. Rushen

# **CASE BAR #2016-00428**

Request for new hanging sign at **107 N Fairfax Street** Applicant: AR Workshop Alexandria