DATE: NOVEMBER 14, 2016

TO: MEMBERS OF THE TRAFFIC AND PARKING BOARD

FROM: T&ES STAFF

SUBJECT: DOCKET ITEM # 9

ISSUE: Consideration of the Biennial review and public hearing on conditions within the

Alexandria taxicab industry.

APPLICANT: T&ES Staff

LOCATION: Citywide

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: That the Traffic and Parking Board receive the information provided herein and the testimony offered during the public hearing for consideration of conditions within the Alexandria taxicab industry.

Background: City Code Section 9-12-31 requires that the Traffic and Parking Board and City Manager conduct a review of the taxicab industry in Alexandria. As part of this review, the Board is to hold a public hearing to receive testimony from industry representatives and the public as to the economic condition of the industry, the adequacy of public service provided and necessary or desirable changes in the regulation of the industry, including the number of taxicabs authorized for each company.

In consideration of the public testimony and other available information, the Board is to forward its conclusions as to the status of the industry and its recommendations on all matters included in the annual review to the City Manager for consideration in making final determinations on any pending applications or proposals under section 9-12-30.

<u>DISCUSSION:</u> The Alexandria taxicab industry is in a state of transition resulting from Transportation Network Providers (TNCs), such as Uber and Lyft, entering the regional market. Since 2014, when TNCs were authorized to operate in Virginia, there has been substantial growth in this market, and there are now are 143,000 registered TNC drivers in the State of Virginia. TNCs have provided more competition in the industry, however, they also cater toward more lucrative markets. This leaves certain segments of the population un-served, such as, disabled persons, lower income persons and the elderly.

TNCs are cause for concern for local regulators because the State regulates TNCs and there is no locality oversight. Although TNCs are required to perform background checks on their drivers,

these checks are not as rigorous as the background checks for taxicab drivers. Insurance coverage is also questionable.

TNC's have had impacts on the taxi industry in the Cities they operate. In neighboring Arlington County, taxicab dispatch is down by 33 percent during the last two years. In Fairfax County dispatch is down by 15 percent over the last year. In Alexandria dispatch call volumes are down by 2.5 percent since the last biennial review. Staff expects this trend to continue over the next several years until the market stabilizes. Demand at the airport for taxicab service has remained unchanged since the last review.

Recruitment

Finding new taxi drivers is becoming difficult. Arlington, Fairfax and Alexandria taxicab companies are having difficulty attracting drivers. In Fairfax there are 173 vacant cabs and in Arlington the number of vacancies is about a third of that. Alexandria has 30 driver vacancies. Some of the reasons for these high vacancy rates are the barriers to entry. Current taxicab regulations require a finger print background check, driver test and vehicle inspection before a new taxicab driver can start working. This consumes considerable time and many applicants are unable to pass the test. The entry for drivers into TNCs is quicker, less rigorous and only takes about a week. Plus a TNC driver is not bound by jurisdictional boundaries. For example, if an Alexandria driver takes a passenger to Dulles airport, the driver must dead-head back to Alexandria with no fare before being able to take another passenger. A TNC driver, on the other hand, can drop the passenger off at Dulles and then pick up additional trips close by.

The availability of handicapped accessible cabs is an area of concern. Companies are reporting that finding drivers willing to operate accessible cabs is extremely difficult. In fact several accessible cabs have been pulled from service by the City for being vacant over 90 days as required by section 9-12-34 of the City Code. Finding drivers for accessible cabs has always been difficult; however, the competition for drivers created by TNCs has created a situation where companies may no longer be able to provide this service. Many passengers do not like to ride in the accessible cabs because they are noisier and bumpier than regular cabs, and there can be a misconception that the cab is reserved exclusively for handicapped persons. In neighboring Arlington a new ADA cab service was recently created, All Access Taxi. All Access Taxi was approved in January 2015 with 50 new ADA only certificates - and at this point, they have only been able to find one driver.

Certificates

Alexandria has issued15 certificates of public convenience and necessity that authorize the operations of taxicabs in the City of Alexandria. Of these, six are issued to taxicab companies and nine are issued to individuals (grandfathered certificates). In aggregate, these certificates authorize the operation of 760 taxicabs, all of which are required to maintain affiliation with a taxicab company. Individually-held certificates authorize the operation of one taxicab each or nine taxicabs total. Collectively, company-held certificates authorize the operation of 751 taxicabs.

Findings

The following is a summary of staff observations regarding current taxicab service, economic condition of the industry and overall industry performance. This information is intended to provide the Board with staff's perspective on current conditions in Alexandria's taxicab industry for consideration along with testimony provided during the public hearing and other information that is available to the Board.

The demand for taxi dispatch has decreased by 2.5 percent over the past two years. This decrease is not equal across the industry with some companies being hit harder than others. By comparison, at the 2015 review the demand for taxi dispatch service increased by 10.5 percent from 2012. Four factors were considered to determine if fare changes are needed; 1) the rate of inflation since the last fare review; 2) the change in gasoline prices; 3) the change in the cost to maintain a vehicle; and, 4) competition in the area.

The Consumer Price Index (CPI) was used to determine the rate of inflation since the last fare review. The CPI measures the price change for a market basket of goods and services from one period to the next and is used as a cost of living index. For this analysis the Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics index for all urban consumers was used. The cost of living increase equates to 1.74 percent over the past two years. For driver's income to keep pace with inflation, their net income must increase by 1.74 percent.

The average cost of a gallon of gasoline based on the Department of Energy's data was \$3.51 for the 12 months preceding the 2014 rate adjustment and \$2.15 for the past 12 months. This represents a 39 percent decrease in the cost of fuel since the last fare adjustment in 2014.

The average trip length and expected fuel economy were used to calculate the impact of gas price changes on a typical taxi trip. The EPA mileage estimates for a 2009 Crown Victoria, a typical taxi vehicle, is 16 miles-per-gallon (mpg). The dispatch data from over 34,000 taxi trips shows the average trip length is 10 miles. The calculation goes as follows:

1) 2014 Trip cost at \$3.51 per gallon

Trip cost = (Trip Miles/Fuel Mileage) X (Gas Cost)

Trip Cost City = (10 miles/16 miles/gallon) X (\$3.51/Gallon) = \$2.19

2) 2016 Trip cost at \$2.15 per gallon

Trip cost = (10 miles/16 miles/gallon) X (\$2.15/Gallon) = \$1.34

3) Cost Difference

Cost Difference = \$1.34 - \$2.19 = (\$0.85/Trip)

Every year the AAA publishes a report titled "Your Driving Costs". This report determines how much it will cost per mile to operate a car for that year. Factors such as fuel, maintenance, tires,

insurance, license, registration, taxes, depreciation and finance are all included in the calculation. Although these costs are based on a non-commercial vehicle, they do provide a good indicator of the relative costs to operate a passenger vehicle similar to a taxicab. In 2014 the AAA calculated that the cost to drive a medium size sedan was \$0.59 per mile and in 2016 was \$0.57 per mile. This represents a 3.4 percent decrease in the operational costs.

MEASURE	CHANGE
Consumer Price Index	1.74%
Cost of Gasoline	-39%
AAA Driving Costs	-3.4%

The last item considered are the fare rates of surrounding jurisdictions. This serves two purposes, first to make sure that the proposed fares are in line with the rest of the region and second to make sure Alexandria's taxi service is competitive. Below is a chart showing the fares of the surrounding competing jurisdictions.

Regional Taxicab Fare Rates and Charges

	Alexandria	Arlington	Fairfax	Montg. Cty	Uber X
Drop	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$3.50	\$4.00	\$1.50
Mileage	\$2.16	\$2.16	\$2.16	\$2.00	\$1.02
Waiting	\$24.92	\$23.40	\$21.60	\$28.00	\$10.20
Passengers	\$1.25	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$1.00	
Suite case	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$1.00	
Trunk			\$2.00	\$2.00	
Groc. Bags			\$0.25	\$1.00	
Animals	\$2.00		\$1.00		
Snow	\$5.00			\$2.50	
Other					\$6.35 Min
					\$5.00
					Canc.

^{*}Uber charges \$0.17 per minute/\$10.20 per hour of trip time, not waiting time like regular taxi services

The table below shows the current authorizations for each company.

Current Authorizations

Certificate	Company	Regular	ADA	Grandfather	Total
Number	Name				
34	Alexandria Yellow Cab	271	8	4	283
46	King Cab	50	2	2	54
77	VIP Cab	62	1	0	63
120	White Top	101	6	1	108
130	Alexandria Union Cab	223	2	2	227
140	Go Green	17	0	0	17

DATE: NOVEMBER 14, 2016

TO: MEMBERS OF THE TRAFFIC AND PARKING BOARD

FROM: T&ES STAFF

SUBJECT: DOCKET ITEM # 10

ISSUE: Consideration of staff recommendations on the proposed changes to Part II, Title

9, Chapter 12 of the City Code and the City Manager Regulations.

APPLICANT: T&ES Staff

LOCATION: Citywide

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: That the Traffic and Parking Board consider and adopt recommendations to the City Manager with regard to:

- 1. 9-12-34(a) <u>Authorizations not in use</u>: Recommend changing the amount of time an authorization can be vacant before termination from 90 days to 180 days;
- 2. 4.1.A. <u>Age Limit for Taxicab Vehicles</u>: Recommend increasing the age limit for taxicab vehicles from 8 model years to 10 model years of age;
- 3. 6.2. <u>Taxicab Industry Fees</u>: Recommend no change to industry fees and ask city staff to perform a comprehensive review of industry fees and develop recommendations.

<u>DISCUSSION:</u> Staff is proposing a number of changes to the code and city manager regulations to improve service delivery. A discussion of the proposed changes follows:

1. <u>9-12-34(a)</u> Authorizations not in use: Staff received a request at the industry meeting held on October 19th to increase the amount of time an authorization can be vacant before termination from 90 days to 18 months. Staff disagrees with extending the vacancy time to 18 months and recommends increasing the amount of time an authorization can be vacant before termination from 90 days to 180 days (6 months). Staff believes that six months should be more than adequate time for companies to replace driver vacancies. Section 9-12-34(a) provides a mechanism for the taxicab industry to reduce in size in response to market

- changes. Allowing driver vacancies to remain vacant for 18 months would limit the industry's ability to downsize.
- 2. 4.1.A. Age Limit for Taxicab Vehicles: Staff received a request at the industry meeting held on October 19th and the driver meeting held on November 9th to increase the age limit of taxicab vehicles from 8 model years to 10 model years. The City of Alexandria imposed the 8 year age limit about 10 years ago to improve the quality of vehicles in the fleet. The industry is requesting this change due to the financial hardship of vehicle replacement. Neighboring Arlington County recently increased the age limit for their taxicabs to 10 years and Fairfax County is in the process of doing the same. Reagan National Airport has an 8 year age limit on taxicab vehicles.
- 3. <u>6.2. Taxicab Industry Fees</u>: Staff received a request at the industry meeting held on October 19th and the driver meeting held on November 9th to reduce the fees charged to the taxicab industry. Shown below is a summary of the changes requested by the industry:

Industry Requested Fee Changes

	Existing Fee	Proposed Fee			
Certificate Renewal	\$4,000	\$0.00			
Authorized Vehicle Renewal	\$150	\$150			
Grandfathered Certificate	\$150	\$150			
Renewal					
Driver Permit Renewal	\$150	\$40			
Vehicle Permit Renewal	\$150	\$0.00			

The purpose of the request is to help make the taxicab industry more competitive with TNCs. More time is needed to work with the industry to develop recommendations that will benefit service delivery to the public. After the industry fees are thoroughly evaluated and meaningful recommendations are developed, this item will be brought before the Board for consideration. The table below shows a comparison of Alexandria's fees to that of surrounding jurisdictions.

Existing Company and Driver Fees

	Alexandria	Arlington	Fairfax
Certificate (company)	\$4,000	N/A	N/A
Affiliated Vehicles	\$150	\$150	\$150
(company)			
Vehicle Permit (driver)	\$150	N/A	N/A
Driver's Permit (driver)	\$150	\$40	\$40

DATE: NOVEMBER 14, 2016

TO: MEMBERS OF THE TRAFFIC AND PARKING BOARD

FROM: T&ES STAFF

SUBJECT: DOCKET ITEM # 11

ISSUE: Consideration of staff recommendations on the proposed taxicab fare rate change.

APPLICANT: T&ES Staff

LOCATION: Citywide

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: That the Traffic and Parking Board retain the existing taxicab fare rates.

<u>DISCUSSION:</u> A specific consideration for each biennial review is the review of existing taxicab fares. Factors to be considered in these determinations are specified in code section 9-12-31, and include the ability of current drivers to earn a living wage.

The taxicab fare rates were last changed in January 2014. Based on current economic conditions staff does not believe a fare increase is justified. The 39 percent decrease in gasoline prices since the last rate adjustment suggests that an increase is not required. In addition, Transportation Network Providers (TNCs) are severely impacting the taxicab industry. Four factors were considered when evaluating the proposed fare changes: 1) the rate of inflation since the last fare review; 2) the change in gasoline prices; 3) the change in the cost to maintain a vehicle; and, 4) competition in the area.

Rate of Inflation:

The Consumer Price Index (CPI) was used to determine the rate of inflation since the last fare review. The CPI measures the price change for a market basket of goods and services from one period to the next and is used as a cost of living index. For this analysis the Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics index for all urban consumers was used. The cost of living increase equates to 1.74 percent over the past two years since the last biennial review. For driver's income to keep pace with inflation, their net income must increase by 1.74 percent.

Change in Gasoline Prices:

The average cost of a gallon of gasoline based on the Department of Energy's data was \$3.51 for the 12 months preceding the 2014 rate adjustment and \$2.15 for the past 12 months. This represents a 39 percent decrease in the cost of fuel since the last fare adjustment in 2014.

The average trip length and expected fuel economy were used to calculate the impact of gas price changes on a typical taxi trip. The EPA mileage estimates for a 2009 Crown Victoria, a typical taxi vehicle, is 16 miles-per-gallon (mpg). The dispatch data from over 34,000 taxi trips shows the average trip length is 10 miles. The calculation goes as follows:

1) 2014 Trip cost at \$3.51 per gallon

Trip cost = (Trip Miles/Fuel Mileage) X (Gas Cost)

Trip Cost City = (10 miles/16 miles/gallon) X (\$3.51/Gallon) = \$2.19

2) 2016 Trip cost at \$2.15 per gallon

Trip cost = (10 miles/16 miles/gallon) X (\$2.15/Gallon) = \$1.34

3) Cost Difference

Cost Difference = \$1.34 - \$2.19 = (\$0.85/Trip)

Cost of Vehicle Maintenance:

Every year the AAA publishes a report titled "Your Driving Costs". This report determines how much it will cost per mile to operate a car for that year. Factors such as fuel, maintenance, tires, insurance, license, registration, taxes, depreciation and finance are all included in the calculation. Although these costs are based on a non-commercial vehicle, they do provide a good indicator of the relative costs to operate a passenger vehicle similar to a taxicab. In 2014 the AAA calculated that the cost to drive a medium size sedan was \$0.59 per mile and in 2016 was \$0.57 per mile. This represents a 3.4 percent decrease in the operational costs.

MEASURE	CHANGE
Consumer Price Index	1.74%
Cost of Gasoline	-39%
AAA Driving Costs	-3.4%

Area Competition:

The last item considered are the fare rates of surrounding jurisdictions. This serves two purposes, first to make sure that the proposed fares are in line with the rest of the region and second to make sure Alexandria's taxi service is competitive. Below is a chart showing the fares of the surrounding competing jurisdictions.

Regional Taxicab Fare Rates and Charges

	Alexandria	Arlington	Fairfax	Montg. Cty.	Uber X
Drop	\$3.00	\$3.00	\$3.50	\$4.00	\$2.50
Mileage	\$2.16	\$2.16	\$2.16	\$2.00	\$1.02
Waiting	\$24.92	\$23.40	\$21.60	\$28.00	\$10.20
Passengers	\$1.25	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$1.00	
Suitcases	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$1.00	
Trunk			\$2.00	\$2.00	
Groc. Bags			\$0.25	\$1.00	
Animals	\$2.00		\$1.00		
Snow	\$5.00			\$2.50	
Other					
					\$5.00 Canc.
					Fee

Alexandria's taxicab rates are competitive with taxicab rates in surrounding jurisdictions and considerably higher than Uber's rates. The 39 percent decrease in fuel prices since the last rate adjustment and the lower cost of Uber X suggests that the current rates should be reduced. Staff is not recommending any changes to the taxicab fare rates but does suggest that consideration should be given to the elimination of the add-on fees at a future date. The add-on fees are very confusing to customers. The add-on fees should be evaluated as part of a comprehensive plan when staff is reviewing the fees paid by the industry.

DATE: NOVEMBER 14, 2016

TO: MEMBERS OF THE TRAFFIC AND PARKING BOARD

FROM: T&ES STAFF

SUBJECT: DOCKET ITEM # 12

ISSUE: Consideration of recommendations on the renewal of existing certificates of

public convenience and necessity.

APPLICANT: Director of T&ES

LOCATION: Citywide

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The Traffic and Parking Board consider and adopt staff's recommendations to the City Manager with regards to the renewal of existing certificates of public convenience and necessity.

DISCUSSION: A specific consideration for each annual review is the renewal of existing certificates of public convenience and necessity (certificates) and the number of taxicabs that may be affiliated with each certificate holder. Factors to be considered in these determinations are specified in code section 9-12-31, and include the certificate holder's record of compliance with code requirements for certificate holders, the demonstrated need on a company-by-company basis for a sufficient number of affiliated taxicabs to provide satisfactory public service and ensure adequate dispatch service.

There are 15 certificates of public convenience and necessity that authorize the operations of taxicabs in the City of Alexandria. Of these, six are issued to taxicab companies and nine are issued to individuals (grandfathered certificates). In aggregate, these certificates authorize the operation of 752 taxicabs, all of which are required to maintain affiliation with a taxicab company. Individually-held certificates authorize the operation of one taxicab each or nine taxicabs total. Collectively, company-held certificates authorize the operation of 743 taxicabs.

Determining the correct number of taxicabs that are allowed to operate in the City is a challenging task. Too few cabs and the public will not have adequate service. Too many cabs and drivers will not be able to earn a living wage. This issue is further compounded by the introduction of Transportation Network Providers (TNC) into the market. Staff estimates that TNCs have captured 13 percent of the dispatch market and 11 percent of the airport market. Much of this capture has been normal market growth and some in market expansion created by TNCs. Demand for dispatch cab service in Alexandria decreased by 2.5 percent while, at the

same time, the market is estimated to have grown 10.5 percent since the last biennial review. TNCs have exploited all of the market growth while eroding some of the taxicab market. Demand for taxi service from the airport is unchanged since the last biennial review. However, more cabs from Arlington are working the airport since the last biennial review resulting from the decrease in dispatch demand in Arlington. The impact of the influx of Arlington cabs working the airport is not known at this time.

The negative change in actual taxicab trips suggests that the number of authorized taxicabs should not be increased during this review cycle.

If the taxicab industry is to remain viable, there needs to be a paradigm shift as to what is considered the correct number of taxicabs to serve the dispatch market. One of the reasons TNCs have done so well is the availability of vehicles. A TNC driver can usually pick up a passenger within five minutes of a request because of the large number of vehicles in service. The taxicab industry is limited on the number of cabs they can operate and so cannot always provide as timely as a response.

A summary of the requests to renew certificates of public convenience and necessity for 2017 is provided below.

Renewal of Individually-Held (Grandfathered) Certificates

Individually held certificates are routinely renewed each year as long as the holder intends to remain active in the industry by operating a taxicab at least 50 percent of the year. Of the nine certificate holders, all nine plan to remain active in the taxicab industry. Staff recommends renewal of these nine individual certificates as requested.

Renewal and Amendment of Company-Held Certificates

Requests to renew and amend (increase or decrease the number of authorized taxicabs) company-held certificates require consideration of a broader range of factors.

Applications to renew company-held certificates were received from all six existing taxicab companies. The current number of authorized taxicabs for each company and the requested amendments of these certificates are summarized in the following table.

Company	Regular	ADA	Grandfather	Total	Requested
					Amendment
Alex. Yellow Cab	271	8	4	283	No Change
King Cab	50	2	2	54	+5
VIP Cab	62	1	0	63	No Change
White Top	101	6	1	108	No Change
Alex. Union Cab	223	2	2	227	No Change
Go Green	17	0	0	17	+20

Based on the renewal applications, findings of the taxi industry survey and other relevant information, staff's comments and recommendations on these renewal requests follow.

GoGreen Cab (Certificate Number 140)

GoGreen Cab requests renewal of its certificate with the current 17 authorized taxicabs plus 20 new authorizations.

GoGreen Cab was unable to provide dispatch records for the past year, but based on the records from the previous year has a dispatch level of 0.3 dispatch calls per day per driver. GoGreen is requesting 20 additional authorizations which would bring the total authorizations to 37 taxicabs. GoGreen believes that their current fleet size is not a large enough to provide a viable dispatch service and would like to enlarge their fleet so that they can make investments in technology.

Staff recommends renewing GoGreen's certificate with the current 17 authorizations. Staff recommends against granting any new authorizations because of GoGreen's low dispatch rate and the declining market. GoGreen has not provided any plans or rationale for this request other than they need more cabs to support a viable dispatch service.

Alexandria Yellow Cab (Certificate Number 34)

Alexandria Yellow Cab requests renewal of its certificate with the current 279 authorized taxicabs and no new authorizations.

The results of this year's industry review show that Yellow Cab is the primary provider of dispatch service in Alexandria, serving 64 percent of the City's dispatch market which is down from 85 percent at the last biennial review. Yellow's dispatch service level is 5.8 dispatch trips per cab per day. By contrast, in 2014 Yellow had a dispatch level of 8.5, in 2012 had a dispatch level of 7.4 dispatch trips per cab per day and in 2010 had a dispatch level of 5.6 dispatch trips per cab per day.

Alexandria Yellow Cab (AYC) is requesting no new authorizations.

Staff believes that renewal of Yellow Cab's certificate will serve the public interest and recommends that it be renewed with the present 279 authorized taxicabs.

King Cab Company (Certificate Number 46)

King Cab requests renewal of its certificate with the current 53 authorized taxicabs plus 5 new authorizations.

The results of this year's industry review show that King Cab's dispatch service level is 1.3 trips per day per driver. By contrast, in 2014 King had 1.7 dispatch trips per cab per day and in 2012 1.37dispatch trips per cab per day.

Staff believes that renewal of King Cab's certificate will serve the public interest and recommends that it be renewed at the current 53 authorizations. Staff recommends against granting any new authorizations because King has not provided a plan to expand dispatch service with these new certificates and the declining market.

VIP Cab Company (Certificate Number 77)

VIP Cab Company requests renewal of its certificate with the current 63 authorizations.

The results of this year's industry review show that VIP Cab is currently serving 1.2 dispatch trips per cab per day. By contrast, in 2014 VIP had 1.8 dispatch trips per cab per day.

Staff believes that renewal of VIP Cab's certificate will serve the public interest and recommends that it be renewed at the current 63 authorizations.

White Top Cab Company (Certificate Number 120)

White Top Cab Company requests renewal of its certificate with the current 107 authorizations.

The results of this year's industry review show that White Top Cab is currently serving 7.3 dispatch trips per cab per day. In 2015 White Top's dispatch rate was 4.9 dispatch trips per cab per day.

Staff believes that renewal of White Top Cab's certificate will serve the public interest and recommends that it be renewed at the current 107 authorizations.

<u>Union Taxicab Cooperative (Certificate Number 130)</u>

Union Taxicab requests renewal of its certificate with the current 225 authorized taxicabs.

The results of this year's industry review show that Union Taxicab is currently serving 0.52 dispatch trips per cab per day.

Staff believes that renewal of Union Taxicab Cooperative's certificate will serve the public interest and recommends that it be renewed at the current 225 authorizations.

A summary of staff's recommendations are contained in the table below.

Company	Dispatch	Current	Recommended	Total
	Calls per	Authorized	Changes	Recommended
	Driver	Taxicabs		Authorizations
Alexandria Yellow Cab	5.8	279	0	279
King Cab	1.3	52	0	52
VIP Cab	1.2	63	0	63
White Top Cab	7.3	107	0	107
Alexandria Union Cab	<1	225	0	225
GoGreen Cab	<1	17	0	17