

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, December 7, 2016
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: John von Senden, Chair
Robert Adams
Slade Elkins
Christina Kelley
Margaret Miller
Christine Roberts

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Stephanie Sample, Preservation Planner

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes from the **November 16, 2016** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

II. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

1. CASE BAR #2016-00363

Request for partial demolition and capsulation at **412 Wolfe Street**
Applicant: Brian Klotz & David Terry

Items #1 & #2 were combined for discussion purposes.

2. CASE BAR #2016-00343

Request for alteration an addition at **412 Wolfe Street**
Applicant: Brian Klotz & David Terry

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Kelley and seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00363 & 00364 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Approved as submitted.

REASON

The BAR found that the revised design was architecturally appropriate for the house and complied with the BAR's Design Guidelines and policies.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Kelley thanked the applicant for the improvements and supported the revised design.

SPEAKERS

Erin May, architect, represented the applicant.

III. NEW BUSINESS

3. CASE BAR #2016-00394

Request to partial demolition at **428 N Washington Street**

Applicant: Chris & Courtney Cox

Items #3 & #4 were combined for discussion purposes.

4. CASE BAR #2016-00395

Request for alterations at **428 N Washington Street**

Applicant: Chris & Courtney Cox

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Miller and seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00394 & 00395 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Approved as submitted.

REASON

The BAR found that the revised design was architecturally appropriate for the house and complied with the BAR's Design Guidelines and policies.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Miller complimented the design and supported the application.

SPEAKERS

Patrick Camus, designer, represented the applicant.

5. CASE BAR #2016-00396

Request for partial demolition and capsulation at **319 Queen Street**

Applicant: Jill and Ken Rieth

Items #5 & #6 were combined for discussion purposes.

6. CASE BAR #2016-00397

Request for alterations and an addition at **319 Queen Street**
Applicant: Jill and Ken Rieth

BOARD ACTION: Deferred without objection, 6-0

Without objection, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review deferred BAR Case #2016-00396 and 00397 as requested by the applicant.

REASON

The BAR supported the addition and alterations, in concept, but were not comfortable with the amount of demolition proposed or capsulation of the ell without a preservation easement

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Miller confirmed that the unusual collar tie joints of the ell rafters would be preserved. She appreciated hearing the views of both the applicant and the neighbors. She liked that the addition would reduce the visibility of the large white wall to the east and suggested that the staff recommendation was a good compromise.

Ms. Roberts agreed that the existing large white wall was ugly but suggested a restudy to scale back the addition slightly. She recommended a restudy.

Mr. Adams confirmed that the rafters in the ell would remain exposed after construction.

Mr. Elkins inquired about the pitch of the pyramidal roof of the addition and confirmed that the addition would have no chimney.

Ms. Kelley stated that this should not be a decision between good design *or* preservation.

Chairman von Senden was greatly concerned by the amount of demolition and capsulation without a preservation easement. He recommended that the applicant explore alternatives to preserve the ell to the greatest extent possible.

SPEAKERS

Bill Cromley represented the applicant.

Elaine Johnson, representing the HAF, supported the staff recommendation.

Michael Maibach, 325 Queen, provided a neighbor petition in opposition and recommended working within the existing footprint.

Joan Roland, 323 Queen, opposed the project.

Francois Duret, 317 Queen, opposed the project, suggesting that the addition only extend a few feet and keep the current height.

Ms. Johnson, 309 N Royal, opposed the project and asked that the BAR not approve a McMansion.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

7. Consideration of amendments to the *Criteria & Standards for Administrative Approval of Commercial Signs within the Historic Districts* in response to recent changes to the Sign chapter of the Alexandria zoning ordinance.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Ms. Kelly, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted unanimously to approve amendments to the Criteria & Standards for Administrative Approval of Commercial Signs within the Historic Districts as submitted and also recommended that the Planning Commission and City Council adopt revised Zoning Section 9-300. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

SPEAKERS

Stephanie Sample presented the proposed revisions and described why staff recommended removing window signs and most temporary signs from BAR review, simplifying the ordinance and making the process more business friendly.

A speaker who did not identify herself described a petition coming forward to keep the A-frame signs because they add liveliness to the streets and because Arlington, Fairfax and DC allow them. She was troubled about vacant storefronts.

8. Presentation and consideration of proposed amendments to the policy for Concept Review.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Kelley and seconded by Mr. Elkins, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve amendments to the policy for Concept Review as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

Staff presented the proposed updates to the Concept Review policy, noting that the policy was not changing but that this now explained the process more fully for the applicants.

9. Adoption of amendments to the By-Laws recommended by the By-Laws Committee to reflect the format of other City boards and commissions.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0

On a motion by Mr. Elkins and seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve amendments to the Old & Historic Alexandria District By-Laws as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

Ms. Roberts, by-laws committee Chair, and Staff presented proposed revisions to the OHAD BAR by-laws and responded to BAR comments from the previous hearing. The Board discussed revisions to the start time for BAR meetings from 7:30 to 7:00 pm. The initial vote failed on a 3-3 tie. A second vote to keep the existing 7:30 pm start time passed by a vote of 6-0.

10. Election of Board of Architectural Review – Old and Historic District officers for Chairman and Vice Chairman.

BOARD ACTION:

On a nomination by Mr. Von Senden, seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to elect Ms. Kelley as Chair. The nomination carried 5-0.

On a nomination by Mr. Adams, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to elect Ms. Roberts as Vice-Chair. The nomination carried 5-0.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 9:45pm.

V. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR #2016-00423

Request for signage at **601 Wythe Street**
Applicant: WEF

CASE BAR #2016-00422

Request for in-kind roof replacement at **420 S. Pitt Street**
Applicant: King Contracting, LLC

CASE BAR #2016-00415

Request for cornice repair at **601 King Street**
Applicant: 601 King Street Investors

CASE BAR #2016-00414

Request for new gate at **108 Gibbon Street**
Applicant: Benedict Capuco

CASE BAR #2016-00413

Request for window replacement at **1250 S Washington Street #511**
Applicant: Rust Construction

CASE BAR #2016-00412

Request for exterior vent at **600 N Washington Street**
Applicant: Bank of America

CASE BAR #2016-00411

Request for roof replacement at **116 S. Fayette Street**
Applicant: S. Duncan

CASE BAR #2016-00405

Request for signage at **321 Duke Street**
Applicant: Window & Siding

CASE BAR #2016-00387

Request for repair at **807 Oronoco Street**
Applicant: Ann & Joseph Shumard

CASE BAR #2016-00423

Request for vent installation at **500 N Alfred Street**
Applicant: Karen Zauber

CASE BAR #2016-00423

Request for signage at **614 S Fairfax Street**

Applicant: Katie Taplett

CASE BAR #2016-00401

Request for roof replacement at **612 Duke Street**

Applicant: Jeannie Mulfor

CASE BAR #2016-00400

Request for window replacement at **213 Buchanan Street**

Applicant: Richard Redmond

CASE BAR #2016-00399

Request for window replacement at **404 N Henry Street**

Applicant: Renee Delisle

CASE BAR #2016-00392

Request for exhaust vent & siding replacement at **309 N Alfred Street**

Applicant: Jacob Hegeman

CASE BAR #2016-00391

Request for window/door replacement at **109 Quay Street**

Applicant: Sandra McDowell

CASE BAR #2016-00376

Request for exterior lamp replacement at **1022 Queen Street**

Applicant: Jennifer Kibler

CASE BAR #2016-00374

Request for repair of front porch at **317 West Street**

Applicant: Lisa Letke

CASE BAR #2016-00402

Request for repair at **1555 King Street**

Applicant: Bernstein Mgmt. Corp

CASE BAR #2016-00403

Request for roof replacement at **309 S Union Street**

Applicant: Eron Sandoval