Docket Item # 1 BAR CASE #2016-0307

BAR Meeting September 28, 2016

ISSUE:	Certificate of Appropriateness (Alterations)		
APPLICANT:	Mark Zavack		
LOCATION:	916 Princess Street		
ZONE:	RB/Residential		

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends **denial** of the Certificate of Appropriateness and that the applicant replace all street-facing windows with double-hung wood windows in a one-over-one configuration, in compliance with the conditions of the original BAR case from February 27, 2008.

GENERAL NOTES TO THE APPLICANT

- 1. ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND PERMITS TO DEMOLISH: Applicants must obtain a stamped copy of the Certificate of Appropriateness or Permit to Demolish PRIOR to applying for a building permit. Contact BAR Staff, Room 2100, City Hall, 703-746-3833, or preservation@alexandriava.gov for further information.
- 2. APPEAL OF DECISION: In accordance with the Zoning Ordinance, if the Board of Architectural Review denies or approves an application in whole or in part, the applicant or opponent may appeal the Board's decision to City Council on or before 14 days after the decision of the Board.
- 3. COMPLIANCE WITH BAR POLICIES: All materials must comply with the BAR's adopted policies unless otherwise specifically approved.
- 4. BUILDING PERMITS: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-746-4200 for further information.
- 5. EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.
- HISTORIC PROPERTY TAX CREDITS: Applicants performing extensive, certified rehabilitations of historic properties may separately be eligible for state and/or federal tax credits. Consult with the <u>Virginia</u> <u>Department of Historic Resources (VDHR)</u> prior to initiating any work to determine whether the proposed project may qualify for such credits.



BAR2016-00307

Note: This application is to correct an existing violation (ZEN2016-00188).

I. <u>ISSUE</u>

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace four secondstory windows with Andersen 400 Series double-hung windows. The proposed windows are vinyl-clad wood. Windows matching the proposed windows are currently installed on the firststory and the applicant is also requesting after-the-fact approval for those windows to remain in place.

II. <u>HISTORY</u>

916 Princess Street is a two-story, flat roofed stucco dwelling with Italianate cornice details, only some of which appear to be original to its construction.

916 Princess Street first appears on Sanborn Fire Insurances maps in **1896** as a two-story wood, semi-detached dwelling. From staff's research using the according to Sanborn maps, it appears that the two units at 916 and 914 were combined into one single-family dwelling at some point after 1958. At that time the wood siding was covered over with stucco, and the front door of 916 was converted to a window.

Prior BAR Approvals and Violations

On February 27, 2008, BAR2008-0014, the present owner made an application to install vinyl windows. The Board approved an application for window replacement with the following condition: "...that the windows be replaced with wood, double-hung windows in a one-over-one configuration. The vote on the motion was 5-0. REASON: The Board agreed with the staff analysis and believed that vinyl windows were inappropriate in any application in the historic district."

On March 11, 2016, the BAR staff administratively approved the following description in the application materials. No manufacturer's window specifications or cut sheets were provided.

- 1. Replace 4 street facing double hung windows (Anderson circa 1980) with like Anderson windows, full frame, clear glass, painted wood;
- 2. Replace approximately 8' of street facing wood fencing with like wood fencing, 6' wood;
- 3. Replace approximately 64' of side and rear facing wood fencing with like wood fencing, 6' wood;
- 4. Replace 90 Sq Ft of side facing siding with "hardie" siding, 1x6 clapboard;
- 5. Replace approximately 144 Sq Ft of rear facing siding with "hardie" siding, 1x6 clapboard.

The action line in PermitPlan for case BAR2016-00066 states: "4 full-framed replacement inkind windows (clear glass and painted wood), side and rear fence (no taller than 6'), rear elle siding replacement with Hardie plank."

Building permit BLD2016-00417 was signed off by zoning staff in the permit center stating: "3/11/16 Approved for window and siding replacement per BAR approval. CXD"

On July 27, 2016, a proactive notice of violation was issued after a routine construction inspection when staff noticed the inappropriate first floor front windows. Staff also questioned the height of the replacement fence. Following a site visit it was confirmed that the height of the fence posts would be in compliance with the administrative approval when construction was complete but that the existing first-story windows were inappropriate (vinyl-clad) and the second floor windows, not yet installed, would also be vinyl clad windows to match, in violation of the recently issued building permit conditions. It is unclear when the inappropriate windows were installed prior to the request for the 2016 administrative approval.

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>

The Parker-Gray Residential Reference Guide (RRG) states that replacement windows on the street facing elevations of Early buildings must be painted wood (if no historic windows exist or they cannot be reasonably preserved) without tinted or reflective glass. These windows may generally be double glazed and have Low-E 272 energy film. Windows visible on the side and rear of early buildings, and on Later residential buildings within 15' of the front lot line may be any material but vinyl. Such windows are regularly approved administratively by staff. The use of any other type of window requires approval by the BAR at a public hearing.

Based on the criteria of the RRG and the conditions of the previous approvals, staff does not support the use of inappropriate vinyl windows, particularly for a street facing facade on the front property line where visitors and the public can easily discern the material from the sidewalk. The RRG provides much more flexibility for the choice of material for non-street-facing side and rear elevations for this very reason. One of the key principles of the RRG is that street-facing elevations of Early buildings be held to a higher standard than side and rear elevations.

Therefore, staff recommends denial of the request for vinyl clad-windows and recommends that the applicant replace all street-facing windows with double-hung wood windows in a one-overone configuration, in compliance with the conditions of the original BAR case from February 27, 2008. This action will also correct the outstanding 2016 violation.

STAFF

Amirah Lane, Historic Preservation Sr. Planning Technician, Planning & Zoning Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager, Planning & Zoning

IV. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C- code requirement R- recommendation S- suggestion F- finding

Zoning Comments

C-1 Proposed window replacement complies with zoning.

Code Administration

No comments received.

Transportation and Environmental Services

- R-1 The building permit must be approved and issued prior to the issuance of any permit for demolition. (T&ES)
- R-2 Applicant shall be responsible for repairs to the adjacent city right-of-way if damaged during construction activity. (T&ES)
- F-1 After review of the information provided, an approved grading plan is not required at this time. Please note that if any changes are made to the plan it is suggested that T&ES be included in the review. (T&ES)
- C-1 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Solid Waste Control, Title 5, Chapter 1, which sets forth the requirements for the recycling of materials (Sec. 5-1-99). (T&ES)
- C-2 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Noise Control Code, Title 11, Chapter 5, which sets the maximum permissible noise level as measured at the property line. (T&ES)
- C-3 All improvements to the city right-of-way such as curbing, sidewalk, driveway aprons, etc. must be city standard design. (Sec. 5-2-1) (T&ES)

Alexandria Archaeology

No comments received.

V. <u>ATTACHMENTS</u>

- *1 Supplemental Materials*
- 2 Application for BAR2016-0307: 916 Princess St.





Application & Materi BAR2016-00307 916 Princess Street 8/26/2016

Ĕ





TILT-WASH FULL-FRAME WINDOWS

Table of Tilt-Wash Double-Hung Window SizesScale ¼" (3) = 1'-0" (305) - 1:96

Application & Materials BAR2016-00307 916 Princess Street 8/26/2016

Window Dimension	1'-9 5/8° (549)	2'-1 5/8" (651)	2'-5 ⁵ /8° (752)	2'-7 5/8" (803)	2'-9 5/8* (854)	2'-11 5/8" (905)	3'-1 ⁵ /8" (956)	3'-5 5/8" (1057)	3'-9 5/8" (1159)	
Minknum Rough Opening	1'-10 1/8" (562)	2'-2 1/8* (664)	2'-6 1/8" (765)	2'-8 1/8" (816)	2'-10 1/8" (867)	3'-0 1/8" (917)	3'-2 1/8" (968)	3'-6 1/8" (1070)	3'-10 ¼8" (1172)	
Unobstructed Glass (lower sash only)	15° (381)	19" (483)	23° (584)	25" (635)	27" (686)	29* (737)	31* (787)	35* (889)	<u>39"</u> (991)	
3-0 7/g ⁻ (937) 3-0 7/g ⁻ (937) 13 15/16 ⁻ (354)	W 18210	TW20210	TW24210	TW26210	TW28210	TW210210	TW30210	TW34210	TW38210	
3'4 ¹ /s" (1038) (1038) (1038) 15 ^{15/16} (405)	W1832	W2032	TW2432	TW2632	TW2832	TW21032	TW3032	TW3432	TW3832	
3-8 1/8" (1140) 3-8 1/8" (1140) 17 15/16" (456)	TW1836	TW2036	TW2436	TW2636	TW2836	TW21036	TW3036	TW3436	TW3836	Cottage and reverse cottage sash available for these heights and in all widths.
4-0 //8* (1241) 4-0 //8* (1241) 19 15/15* (506)	TW18310	TW20310	Tw24310	TW26310	TW28310	TW210310	TW30310	TW34310	TW38310	Cottage Reverse Cottage
4'4 7/6" (1343) 4'4 7/6" (1343) (1343) 21 15/16" (557)										
4-8 7/6" (1445) 4-8 7/6" (1445) 23 15/16" (608)	TW1842	TW2042	TW2442	TW2642	TW2842	TW21042	TW3042	TW3442	TW3842	
	TW1846	TW2046	TW2446	TW2646	TW2846	TW21046	TW3046*	TW3446*	TW3846°	
5'-0 ½ (1546) 5'-0 ½ (1546) 25 ¹⁵ / ₁₆ (559)										
5-4 7/s* (1648) 5-4 7/s* (1648) (1648) (710)	TW18410	TW20410	TW24410	TW26410	TW28410	TW210410°	TW30410*	TW34410 ⁹	TW38410°	
5-8 7/a* (1749) 5-8 7/a* (1749) 29 15/16* (760)	TW1856	TW2056	TW2452	TW2656°	TW2856°	TW21056	TW3056*	TW3456°	TW3856°	
6-0 % (1851) (1851) (1851) 31 1\$\sts ⁶ (811)				500 500 500 800		TW210510°	TW30510 ⁴	TW34510 [°]	TW38510 ⁴	• "Window Dimension" always refers to
	TW18510	TW20510	TW24510°	TW265109	TW28510*	IM510310.	11120210	14124210.	11120210.	outside frame to frame dimension.
	TW18510	TW20510	TW24510°	TW26510°	TW2862*	TW21062*	TW3062*	TW3462°	TW3862 ⁰	outside frame to frame dimension. • "Minimum Rough Opening" dimensions may need to be increased to allow for use of building wraps, flashing, sill panning, brackets, fasteners or other Hems. • Dimensions in parentheses are in minimeters. • Meet or exceed clear opening area of 5.7 sq.ft. or 0.53 m³, clear opening width of 20° (508) and clear opening height of 24° (610).

2013-2014 400/200 Series Product Guide

11

Andersen.

Table of Tilt-Wash Double-Hung Window Sizes (continued)

Scale 1/8" (3) = 1'-0" (305) - 1:96



. "Window Dimension" always refers to outside frame to frame dimension.

"Minimum Rough Opening" dimensions may need to be increased to allow for use of building wraps, flashing, still panning, brackets, fasteners or other items.
 Dimensions in parentheses are in millimeters.

0 Meet or exceed clear opening area of 5.7 sq.ft. or 0.53 m², clear opening width of 20" (508) and clear opening height of 24" (610).

Windows 7'-4 7/s" (2257) and 7'-8 7/s" (2359) high have interior and exterior brackets. Interior brackets, located on both sides of the check rail, must be flipped up for proper product performance.

7'-4 7/s" (2257) and 7'-8 7/s" (2359) high windows joined vertically must use Andersen" reinforced joining materials.

BAR Case # 2010 -50307

ADDRESS OF PROJECT: 916 Princess St
TAX MAP AND PARCEL: 064-02-06-34 ZONING:
APPLICATION FOR: (Please check all that apply)
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
PERMIT TO MOVE, REMOVE, ENCAPSULATE OR DEMOLISH (Required if more than 25 square feet of a structure is to be demolished/impacted)
WAIVER OF VISION CLEARANCE REQUIREMENT and/or YARD REQUIREMENTS IN A VISION CLEARANCE AREA (Section 7-802, Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)
WAIVER OF ROOFTOP HVAC SCREENING REQUIREMENT (Section 6-403(B)(3), Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)
Applicant: Property Owner Business (Please provide business name & contact person)
Name: Mark Zavack
Address: 916 Princess St
City: <u>Alexandria</u> State: <u>Va</u> Zip: <u>22314</u>
Phone: 571-431-8052 E-mail: Mark. Zavack@comcast.net
Authorized Agent (if applicable): Attorney
Name: Phone:
E-mail:
Legal Property Owner:
Name: Mark Zavack
Address: 916 Princess St
City: Alexandria State: Va Zip: 22-314
Phone: 571-431-8052 E-mail: Murk. Zavackp comeast net
 Yes No Yes No Is there an historic preservation easement on this property? Yes No If yes, has the easement holder agreed to the proposed alterations? Yes No Is there a homeowner's association for this property? Yes No If yes, has the homeowner's association approved the proposed alterations?

If you answered yes to any of the above, please attach a copy of the letter approving the project.

NATURE OF PROPOSED WORK: Please of	check all that apply
------------------------------------	----------------------

NEW CONSTRUC EXTERIOR ALTER awning doors	TION ATION: <i>Please check all that ap</i> fence, gate or garden wall windows pergola/treilis	HVAC equipment	☐ shutters ☐ shed
other		painting unpainted masonry	
ADDITION			
DEMOLITION/ENC	APSULATION		
SIGNAGE			

BAR Case # 2016 - 20307

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED WORK: Please describe the proposed work in detail (Additional pages may be attached).

1. REplace Aupper, Street Facing windows per BAR2016.0066 with already purchased Anderson 400 windows.

2. Keep 3 lower, street frang Anderson 400 windows inplace. Approved under BAR 2008-00014 See attached. 3

SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS:

Items listed below comprise the **minimum supporting materials** for BAR applications. Staff may request additional information during application review. Please refer to the relevant section of the *Design Guidelines* for further information on appropriate treatments.

Applicants must use the checklist below to ensure the application is complete. Include all information and material that are necessary to thoroughly describe the project. Incomplete applications will delay the docketing of the application for review. Pre-application meetings are required for all proposed additions. All applicants are encouraged to meet with staff prior to submission of a completed application.

Electronic copies of submission materials should be submitted whenever possible.

Demolition/Encapsulation : All applicants requesting 25 square feet or more of demolition/encapsulation must complete this section. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

N/A

Survey plat showing the extent of the proposed demolition/encapsulation.

Existing elevation drawings clearly showing all elements proposed for demolition/encapsulation.

Clear and labeled photographs of all elevations of the building if the entire structure is proposed to be demolished.

Description of the reason for demolition/encapsulation.

Description of the alternatives to demolition/encapsulation and why such alternatives are not considered feasible.

BAR Case # 2016 - 00307

Additions & New Construction: Drawings must be to scale and should not exceed 11" x 17" unless approved by staff. All plans must be folded and collated into 3 complete 8 1/2" x 11" sets. Additional copies may be requested by staff for large-scale development projects or projects fronting Washington Street. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

	N/A	
		Scaled survey plat showing dimensions of lot and location of existing building and other
		structures on the lot, location of proposed structure or addition, dimensions of existing
		structure(s), proposed addition or new construction, and all exterior, ground and roof mounted
		equipment.
		FAR & Open Space calculation form.
		Clear and labeled photographs of the site, surrounding properties and existing structures, if
		applicable.
		Existing elevations must be scaled and include dimensions.
		Proposed elevations must be scaled and include dimensions. Include the relationship to
		adjacent structures in plan and elevations.
		Materials and colors to be used must be specified and delineated on the drawings. Actual
		samples may be provided or required.
_	-	

Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows, doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.

For development site plan projects, a model showing mass relationships to adjacent properties and structures.

Signs & Awnings: One sign per building under one square foot does not require BAR approval unless illuminated. All other signs including window signs require BAR approval. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

N/A	
	Linear feet of building: Front: Secondary front (if corner lot):
	Square feet of existing signs to remain:
	Photograph of building showing existing conditions.
	Dimensioned drawings of proposed sign identifying materials, color, lettering style and text.
	Location of sign (show exact location on building including the height above sidewalk).
	Means of attachment (drawing or manufacturer's cut sheet of bracket if applicable).
	Description of lighting (if applicable). Include manufacturer's cut sheet for any new lighting
	fixtures and information detailing how it will be attached to the building's facade

Alterations: Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

- N/A
 Clear and labeled photographs of the site, especially the area being impacted by the alterations, all sides of the building and any pertinent details.
 - Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows, doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.
- Drawings accurately representing the changes to the proposed structure, including materials and overall dimensions. Drawings must be to scale.
 - An official survey plat showing the proposed locations of HVAC units, fences, and sheds.
 - Historic elevations or photographs should accompany any request to return a structure to an earlier appearance.

BAR Case # _2016 - 00307-

ALL APPLICATIONS: Please read and check that you have read and understand the following items:

I have submitted a filing fee with this application. (Checks should be made payable to the City of Alexandria. Please contact staff for assistance in determining the appropriate fee.)

I understand the notice requirements and will return a copy of the three respective notice forms to BAR staff at least five days prior to the hearing. If I am unsure to whom I should send notice I will contact Planning and Zoning staff for assistance in identifying adjacent parcels.

I, the applicant, or an authorized representative will be present at the public hearing.

I understand that any revisions to this initial application submission (including applications deferred for restudy) must be accompanied by the BAR Supplemental form and 3 sets of revised materials.

The undersigned hereby attests that all of the information herein provided including the site plan, building elevations, prospective drawings of the project, and written descriptive information are true, correct and accurate. The undersigned further understands that, should such information be found incorrect, any action taken by the Board based on such information may be invalidated. The undersigned also hereby grants the City of Alexandria permission to post placard notice as required by Article XI, Division A, Section 11-301(B) of the 1992 Alexandria City Zoning Ordinance, on the property which is the subject of this application. The undersigned also hereby authorizes the City staff and members of the BAR to inspect this site as necessary in the course of research and evaluating the application. The applicant, if other than the property owner, also attests that he/she has obtained permission from the property owner to make this application.

APPLICANTOR AUTHORIZED AGEN Signature Printed Name: hA2

Date:

OWNERSHIP AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT Use additional sheets if necessary

1. Applicant. State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the applicant, unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership	
Mark Zavack	916 Princess St	100%	
2.			
3			

2. Property. State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the property located at <u>916 Princesc</u> ST (address), unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership	
Mark Tavack	916 Princess St	100 7	
2.			
3.		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	

3. Business or Financial Relationships. Each person or entity listed above (1 and 2), with an ownership interest in the applicant or in the subject property is required to disclose any business or financial relationship, as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance, existing at the time of this application, or within the 12-month period prior to the submission of this application with any member of the Alexandria City Council, Planning Commission, Board of Zoning Appeals or either Boards of Architectural Review.

Name of person or entity	Relationship as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance	Member of the Approving Body (i.e. City Council, Planning Commission, etc.)
1. Mark Zavede	×+ /.	
2.	A/A	
3.		

NOTE: Business or financial relationships of the type described in Sec. 11-350 that arise after the filing of this application and before each public hearing must be disclosed prior to the public hearings.

As the applicant or the applicant's authorized agent, I hereby attest to the best of-my ability that the information provided above is true and correct.

Mark Zavack

Date

Signature

Application & Materials BAR2016-00307 916 Princess Street 8/26/2016

17

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED WORK- 916 Princess Street

I am requesting to replace 4 upper street facing windows with Andersen 400 Series Double Hung windows and to keep in place, 3 lower street facing Andersen 400 Series Double Hung Windows.

The BAR approved the upper windows under BAR 2016-0066. I also received approval for additional work under this approval and received the proper building permit. The building permit was posted on my front window. Mr. Al Cox, while recently walking by my residence noticed the permit and upon inspection noticed the lower Andersen 400 windows replaced in 2008. A couple days later, a representative from the city stopped by with a Stop Work notice. I immediately contacted him and he referred me to Mr. Cox, who I also immediately contacted.

At the time when the lower three windows were replaced, I asked my then contractor to select an appropriate BAR approved Andersen product. He selected the Andersen 400. I believed they conformed to Historical guidelines. During my conversation Mr. Cox following the Stop Work notice, he informed me that the lower window did not conform to Historical Guidelines as they had a cladding on the exterior. I fully respect the concept of not using plastic looing vinyl cladding but to my eye, this cladding looks like a very professional paint job.

When I began the process of replacing the upper windows, I asked my contractor to procure the same Andersen 400 windows believing they were appropriate. He did this ahead of my receiving BAR approval (2016-00014). These four windows were a special order and cannot be returned.

Upon Mr. Cox's suggestion, I looked at the feasibility of moving some of the rear/side windows that have existed since I bought the house, but they are not the correct size.

I am asking the BAR to provide relief in this situation and to approve installation of the new upper windows and to keep the existing lower windows in place. These windows cost approximately \$400 each. Combining the sunk costs I've incurred for the 7 windows (3 lower and 4 upper) plus labor and the additional costs to procure and install seven all wood replacement windows is financially prohibitive.

I truly enjoy living in Old Town and support the concepts of Historical Preservation. I take pride in my home and am dedicated to not only maintaining the home but also maintaining its curb appeal. I would submit that the Andersen 400 window, as mixed material product, provides an excellent balance of traditional and modern materials and it enables a win-win solution. I vaguely recall that when I attended the 2008 BAR meeting were I received approval for the lower windows, the use of Hardie siding was prohibited. It is now authorized and I appreciate the BAR's evolving view on materials.