

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, July 20, 2016
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: The Late Chip Carlin, Vice Chair
Christina Kelley
Margaret Miller
Slade Elkins

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes from the **July 6, 2016** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 3-0-1.

On a motion by Ms. Miller, seconded by Mr. Elkins, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes of July 6, 2016 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 3-0-1. Ms. Kelley abstained, as she was not present at the prior meeting.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

1 CASE BAR2016-00220

Request for alterations at **700 S Washington Street (parcel address: 610 Franklin Street)**
Applicant: **SDC 700 South Washington, Inc.**

BOARD ACTION: Approved

By unanimous consent, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00220 as submitted.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The previously approved sign plan was amended to include the following:

1. Approval of an amendment to the existing comprehensive sign plan to add two wall plaques near the building's office entrance with the requirement that the sign material be durable and high-quality and that the signs be installed through the mortar joints.
2. The proposed building numbers should be an ivory color rather than white.

2 CASE BAR2016-00228

Request for alterations at **310 & 314 Duke St.**

Applicant: Saint Mary's Catholic Rectory/Thomas J Welsh, Bishop of Arlington

BOARD ACTION: Approved

By unanimous consent, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00228 as submitted.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The proposed pergola must be free-standing, located entirely on one parcel and a minimum of 80% open.
2. The retractable awning is removed from scope of work.
3. Lattice must be constructed of wood and affixed to the building through the mortar joints.
4. New location of walkway on Duke St. must be approved by T&ES.

III. Unfinished Business and Items Previously Deferred

3 CASE BAR 2016-00204

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **308 Commerce St.**

Applicant: Mike Dameron

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 4-0.

On a motion by Ms. Kelley, seconded by Ms. Miller, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00204 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 4 to 0.

Items #3 and #4 were combined for discussion purposes.

4 CASE BAR2016-00206

Request for an addition at **308 Commerce St.**

Applicant: Mike Dameron

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 4-0.

On a motion by Ms. Kelley, seconded by Ms. Miller, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00206 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 4 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. *Front light fixture to have final approval by BAR staff. The front porch railing and bench will be retained.*
2. The applicant must work closely in the field with BAR staff on the final design of the cornice, window and door trim of the original building while using documentary evidence in the field prior to submission of the building permit.
3. All windows, doors and siding must meet the BAR's established policies.
4. The applicant must provide AC waivers signed by the neighboring property owners to the side and rear of his property prior to issuance of any building permits or relocate the condenser units to meet setback requirements.
5. Include the following statements on all construction documents involving any ground disturbing activities, so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/contractor shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703.746.4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

- b. The applicant/contractor shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board found the revised design to be compatible and consistent with the *Design Guidelines*.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board appreciated the applicant's efforts to respond to their concerns.

SPEAKERS

Mike Dameron, applicant, explained the design changes since the previous review and responded to questions. He stated that he would keep the existing bench and front porch railing.

Mary Gardner, 211 South West Street, expressed concern about the size of the addition and neighbor notification.

5 CASE BAR #2016-00188

Request to partially demolish & capsule at **106 Quay St.**

Applicant: Renee & Jim Novakoff

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 4-0.

On a motion by Ms. Kelley, seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR case #2016-00188 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 4 to 0.

Items #5 and #6 were combined for discussion purposes.

6 CASE BAR #2016-00189

Request for alterations and an addition at **106 Quay St.**

Applicant: Renee & Jim Novakoff

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 4-0.

On a motion by Ms. Kelley, seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR case #2016-00189 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 4 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Doors and windows must be in accordance with the BAR's approved policies.
2. Either rear elevation design may be used at the applicant's discretion, with final approval as part of the building permit review process.
3. *Work with staff on final design approval of a more contemporary front door surround consistent with the overall contemporary character.*
4. *Remove metal shutters from front elevation.*

REASON

The Board enthusiastically supported the redesign of this building from a neo-Colonial Revival townhouse to a more contemporary and cohesive design.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board generally supported the redesign of this façade on a 1970s townhouse to a more contemporary design. The Board extensively discussed the proposed metal shutters on the picture

window on the front elevation, expressing concern that the shutters were not appropriately sized to fit the opening and noting that they visually cluttered the minimalist, contemporary façade.

SPEAKERS

Karen Conkey, project architect, presented the application and responded to questions.

7. CASE BAR #2016-00221

Request to partially demolish at **200 King Street**

Applicant: Comfort Management Corporation

BOARD ACTION: Approved 4-0.

On a motion by Ms. Kelley, seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00221 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of **4 to 0**.

Items #7 and #8 were combined for discussion purposes.

8. CASE BAR #2016-00222

Request for alterations at **200 King Street**

Applicant: Comfort Management Corporation

BOARD ACTION: Approved 4-0.

On a motion by Ms. Miller, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00222 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of **4 to 0**.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The applicant must install the same multi-light, double-hung wood windows proposed on the second and third floors on the first floor South Lee Street elevation;
2. All double-hung, wood replacement windows must be single-glazed on street-facing elevations and meet the Board's Window Policy. *The applicant is encouraged to rehabilitate the existing wood windows, at their option;*
3. All storefront doors and windows should be wood rather than the proposed metal storefront system;
4. The roof mesh over the mechanical well must be painted to match the surrounding roof material;
5. ~~The concrete block portion of the alcove facing the alley must be painted brick red to blend in with the building;~~ *The masonry wall in the alcove must be a mid-value red brick that is subtly differentiated from the existing south wall by color, coursing or joints, with final material approval by staff.*
6. Mortar for repointing must be historically appropriate hydraulic lime mortar with profile, composition and color to be approved by staff in the field;
7. *Use a wood plank door in lieu of metal in the alcove at the south elevation, with the final design to be approved by staff;*
8. *Retain the two bay windows on the first floor of the South Lee Street façade; and*
9. *The BAR approval is based on addendum drawing sheets A-1, A-2 and A-3, dated 6/20/16, except as noted in the conditions above.*

REASON

The Board complimented the applicant on the sensitive alterations proposed but asked that the window materials be more appropriate to the early period of the building and that the materials in

the alcove reflect the historic character of Swift's Alley. The alterations comply with the BAR's *Design Guidelines* and adopted policies.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board members strongly supported removal of the metal fire escape and integration of the mechanical units in the roof slope. The majority of the Board agreed with Dr. Delaney and the HAF that the alcove alterations in the alley should be less contemporary and more traditional. They also agreed that the bay windows on the first floor on South Lee Street provided variety and indicated the long retail use in this structure.

SPEAKERS

Stephen Kulinski, AIA, Kulinski Group Architects, made the presentation for the applicant and responded to questions.

Dr. Morgan Delaney, 202 King Street, was concerned about the historic character of the alley and noted the alcove would be visible from S Lee Street. He asked for a period egress door and that the wall in the alcove be brick or stone in lieu of CMU.

Gail Rothrock, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, asked that the existing wood windows be rehabilitated, if possible. She asked that they keep the two bay windows on S Lee Street because they had been there for many years and provided variety. She agreed that the rear door should be wood.

Yvonne Weight Callahan, 735 S Lee Street, agreed with HAF about the bay windows, wood door and brick alcove on the alley.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

9. Update and discussion of the By-laws Committee report.

The OHAD Board of Architectural review noted the deferral of the discussion item.

V. ADJOURNMENT

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review was adjourned at 9:10pm.

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR #2016-00239

Request for new HVAC and vent installation at **103 N. Alfred St**
Applicant: Bittersweet Catering

CASE BAR #2016-00238

Request for in-kind masonry wall replacement at **706 Prince St**
Applicant: Swann-Daingerfield HOA

CASE BAR #2016-00237

Request for door replacement at **312 Franklin St**

Applicant: R. Bruce McColm

CASE BAR #2016-00235

Request for masonry repair at **719 Prince St**

Applicant: Empson USA, Inc.

CASE BAR #2016-00236

Request for in-kind roof replacement at **215 ½ S. Fayette St**

Applicant: Caroline Lopez

CASE BAR #2016-00230

Request for signage at **1000 Cameron St**

Applicant: Energesco

CASE BAR #2016-00229

Request for window replacement at **615 S. Pitt St**

Applicant: Robert Eelkema

CASE BAR #2016-00227

Request for window replacement and door installation at **430 S. Saint Asaph St**

Applicant: Robert and Caroline Reich

CASE BAR #2016-00226

Request for alterations at **818 S. Royal St**

Applicant: Sue Feintheil

CASE BAR #2016-00240

Request for window replacement at **305 Charles Alexander Ct**

Applicant: Maria Smith

CASE BAR #2016-00241

Request for window replacement at **12 Wolfe St**

Applicant: Louise Roseman