

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, June 15, 2016
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: John von Senden, Chair
Chip Carlin, Vice Chair
Kelly Finnigan Mechling
Margaret Miller
Christine Roberts

Members Excused: Christina Kelley
Wayne Neale

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner

Anthony Gammon, Acting Deputy Director, Department of Project Implementation
Matt Landes, Principal Planner, Department of Project Implementation
Jack Browand, Division Chief, Department of Recreation, Parks and Cultural Activities

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:31pm.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes from the **June 1, 2016** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 5-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Mechling, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review, deferred the minutes of June 1, 2016. The motion carried on a vote of 5 to 0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

1 CASE BAR2016-00151

Request for alterations at **106 S Union St**
Applicant: **Virtue Feed & Grain**

This item was removed from the consent calendar.

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 5-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to defer BAR Case #2016-00151. The motion carried on a vote of 5 to 0.

SPEAKERS

Philip Matyas, 219 North Pitt Street, requested the item be removed from the Consent Calendar and expressed concern about the awnings.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board had minimal discussion.

REASON

As one Board member had not received this item in her packet and felt unprepared to discuss the case, the applicant agreed to defer the item.

III. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

2 CASE BAR2016-00114

Request for alterations at **421, 500A, abutting parcel south of 500A, 501, & 600 S Union; 500 & 520 S Lee St (Windmill Hill Park)**

Applicant: City of Alexandria, Department of Project Implementation

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 5-0

SPEAKERS

Anthony Gammon, Acting Deputy Director, Department of Project Implementation

Matt Landes, Principal Planner, Department of Project Implementation

Jack Browand, Division Chief, Department of Recreation, Parks and Cultural Activities

Mr. Gammon, Mr. Landes and Mr. Browand, gave a presentation on the revised proposal and responded to questions throughout the discussion period.

Robert Odle, 476 South Union Street, read a letter from 1999 about the parking planning and advised that it was time to complete the park improvements.

Joseph Oliva, 11 Keith's Lane, expressed concern about the tree plan and the scope of the BAR's review.

Philip Matyas, 219 North Pitt Street, expressed concerns and advocated for a circular gazebo at the end of the piers.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board found some of the revisions to be improvements but had suggestions for additional refinement. All the Board members supported the removal of the entry arches. Several noted that the piers felt too utilitarian and suggested that a gazebo or more interesting end element should be studied. It was also suggested that the pedestrian bridge be more visually interesting and have an arched form. They were also support of the use of irregular stone pavers on the seat walls and noted the stone should be below grade so that CMU block would not show. One member asked whether this park should conform to the Common Elements or be its own distinct park. In summary, the Board supported the general direction of the revisions but found that additional work was warranted. The Board advised that the following should be studied for the next submission:

- Study an arched bridge option for the pedestrian bridge that is less utilitarian
- Lighten the posts on the piers and submit a sample of the proposed mesh guard

- Extend the stone veneer to sufficiently cover the internal CMU below grade (4-8”) to avoid exposing the CMU at the base of the seat walls
- Consider a gazebo or feature element at the end of the north pier
- Provide plans of the proposed landscape plant materials for informational context

Some members of the Board also raised the question as to whether the Board should be reviewing landscape design in addition to the permanent structures and related elements. There was some discussion amongst the Board members that despite it being longstanding policy of the BAR for many decades to not review vegetation or landscape design, that the BAR should revisit the policy in the coming months. Chairman von Senden directed staff to prepare a presentation in September to discuss the BAR’s past policies regarding this matter as well as practices regarding landscape review in other jurisdictions.

REASON FOR DEFERALL

In summary, the Board supported the general direction of the revisions but found that additional work was warranted.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

3 CASE BAR 2016-000160

Request for alterations at **420 S Lee St.**

Applicant: Thomas Byrne

BOARD ACTION: Deferred prior to the hearing due to lack of proper notice by staff.

The Board noted the deferral of the case.

4 CASE BAR2016-00172

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **317 S Saint Asaph St. (Parcel Address: 315 S Saint Asaph St.)**

Applicant: Ronald Birch

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 5-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Ms. Mechling, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00172, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5 to 0.

Item #4 and #5 were combined for discussion purposes.

5 CASE BAR #2016-00173

Request for alterations and an addition at **305 S Saint Asaph St.**

Applicant: Ronald Birch

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 5-0.

SPEAKERS

Ronald Birch, applicant, supported the staff recommendation and was available for questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board had no discussion on this item.

REASON

The Board agreed with the staff analysis.

V. DEFERRED BEFORE HEARING

6 CASE BAR #2016-00178

Request for Common Elements within the Waterfront Small Area Plan. The subject area is generally bounded by Oronoco Street on the north, Wilkes Street to the South, North and South Union Street to the West and the Potomac River on the East.

Applicant: City of Alexandria, Department of Project Implementation

This case was deferred by the applicant prior to the hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Deferred

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review noted the deferral of BAR case #2016-00178.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

7 An informational update from VRE on the status of the pedestrian concourse at **110 Callahan Drive, Alexandria Union Station.**

SPEAKERS

Norine Walker and Martha Averso, both representing VRE, gave a brief presentation on the status of the improvements at Alexandria Union Station and requested feedback on the roof form of the pedestrian structure.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The BAR appreciated the update on the project. Three BAR members favored the shed roof while others found that the truss and roof drainage required by this form to be distracting. Two members preferred the inverted shed form or “Y” form, noting that it appeared cleaner and clearly was not an attempt to reconstruct the historic form, though there was historic precedent for this platform canopy at the DC Union Station. Several BAR members suggested consideration of a translucent material for the entire roof area in order to make the structures appear visually lighter. It was also noted that the concrete plinth element on the columns could incorporate seating or a small shelf for resting bags to be more functional and intentional.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was adjourned at 9:35pm.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR #2016-00200

Request for chimney replacement at **212 Royal St.**

Applicant: Linda Banton

CASE BAR #2016-00199

Request for cornice, masonry, trim, and gutter/downspout repair at **301 King St.**
Applicant: City of Alexandria

CASE BAR #2016-00198

Request for window replacement at **320 King St.**
Applicant: 320 King Street, LLC

CASE BAR #2016-00190

Request for roof replacement at **326 A Commerce St.**
Applicant: Galvin Realty, Co by Springfield Roofing

CASE BAR #2016-00197

Request for repair-relocate existing vent at **213 Green St.**
Applicant: Steve and Claudia Fitzgerald by Navarro Construction Services

CASE BAR #2016-00179

Request for Chimney Repair at **310 S Saint Asaph St.**
Applicant: Charles Hall/Winston's Chimney Service

CASE BAR #2016-00181

Request for shutter replacement at **816 Green St.**
Applicant: Todd Matson

CASE BAR #2016-00182

Request for window and door replacement at **600 S Fairfax St.**
Applicant: Bob & Kelly Moore

CASE BAR #2016-00183

Request for window and door replacement at **608 Cameron St.**
Applicant: Susquehanna Antique Co.

CASE BAR #2016-00184

Request for chimney repair at **600 S Fairfax St.**
Applicant: Bob & Kelly Moore

CASE BAR #2016-00182

Request for window and door replacement at **220 Green St.**
Applicant: Louise Massaud