

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, May 4, 2016
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: John von Senden, Chair
Chip Carlin, Vice Chair
Christina Kelley
Kelly Finnigan Mechling
Margaret Miller
Wayne Neale
Christine Roberts

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner

Jack Browand, Division Chief, Division Chief, Dept. of Recreation, Parks &
Cultural Activities
Anthony Gammon, Acting Deputy Director, Dept. of Project Implementation
Matthew Landes, Principal Landscape Architect, Dept. of Project Implementation

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes from the **April 20, 2016** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Mechling, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review, approved the minutes of April 20, 2016, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

1 CASE BAR2016-0100

Request for alterations at **121 S Union Street.**

APPLICANT: Union Street Public House

This item was removed from the consent calendar.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-0100, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The railing shall be black.

REASON

The Board found the proposed alterations to be appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines but noted that a black railing was more traditional and likely to visually recede.

SPEAKERS

Catherine Pili, owner at 105 Prince Street, expressed concern about noise and disruption coming from the rooftop dining area. It was explained that these important issues are not within the purview of the BAR but will be addressed during the Special Use Permit review (SUP).

2 CASE BAR2016-0110

Request for alterations at **928 S Fairfax St**

APPLICANT: Jennifer Trotsko

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Ms. Mechling, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-0040, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

3 CASE BAR2016-0063

Request for alterations at 808 King St.

APPLICANT: Don Taco

This item was removed from the consent calendar.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

Without objection, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-0063 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

REASON

The Board found the after-the-fact window alteration to be appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines.

SPEAKERS

Thuy Le, applicant, responded to questions.

III. NEW BUSINESS

4 CASE BAR2016-0102

Request to partially demolish at 508 Queen Street.

APPLICANT: Jack Shoptaw & Bob Venezia

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neal, seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case 2016-0102 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

Item #4 & #5 were combined for discussion purposes.

5 CASE BAR2016-0103

Request for new garage at 508 Queen Street

APPLICANT: Jack Shoptaw & Bob Venezia

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case 2016-00103 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. All materials specified must be in conformance with the BAR's adopted policies with final approval by staff as part of the building permit review process.
2. The statements in the archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board generally agreed that the proposed garage was consistent with the Design Guidelines and appropriately sized for this particular context. They found the architectural design to be appropriate and compatible with other rear garages and accessory buildings on this block, noting that there was a "culture of garages" in this area. It was also noted that historic Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps indicated there had previously been a two-story dwelling on this site.

SPEAKERS

Patrick Camus, project architect, spoke in support and responded to questions.

Jonathan Wallman, 510 Queen Street, expressed concern about the height of the garage and its impact on the other properties.

Nancy Macklin, 512 Queen Street, stated that Hammonds Court was a busy alley already. She also expressed concern about loss of privacy in the rear yards.

6 CASE BAR2016-0104

Request for demolition and capsulation at 603 S Fairfax Street.

APPLICANT: Oscar & Kristen Grajales

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case 2016-0104 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

Item #6 & #7 were combined for discussion purposes.

7 CASE BAR2016-0105

Request for alterations and addition at 603 S Fairfax St.

APPLICANT: Oscar & Kristen Grajales

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case 2016-0105, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

REASON

The Board had minimal discussion on the proposed rear addition, finding it to be appropriate and compatible with the Design Guidelines. The Board strongly encouraged the applicant to correct the inoperable front shutters.

SPEAKERS

Bud Adams, architect, spoke in support of the project.

Scot McBroom, project architect, spoke in support of the project and answered questions.

8 **CASE BAR2016-0106**

Request for alterations at 908 King St

APPLICANT: Curtis Property Management

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case 2016-0106 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The final shop drawings for the new windows, including the color selection and sheen, shall be approved by BAR staff.
2. Staff must verify the age of the transom windows above the storefront awnings to determine whether they are original and if they are, whether they are able to be repaired. If they are not salvageable or original, the applicant shall work with staff for final approval of replacement transom windows.
3. The applicant is encouraged to clean the stone façade as part of the overall improvements.

REASON

The Board generally supported the replacement of the existing replacement windows with new aluminum windows to match the historic light configuration. It was noted that color selection and sheen should be reviewed by staff to make sure the new windows would be historically accurate. There was discussion about whether there would be any changes to the existing storefront; the property manager responded there would not be. It was noted that on many buildings on King Street the storefronts had different windows than the upper stories. There was also discussion as to whether the existing transom windows above the awnings were original and concern about the removal of original transom windows. Therefore, the BAR included a condition requesting the applicant to work with staff to determine whether the transoms were original and what condition they were in before approval of replacement of these elements.

SPEAKERS

Jeremy Horsemen, property manager, responded to questions and explained the project.

Nick Kalivretenos, from The Window Man, responded to questions about the replacement windows.

9 **CASE BAR2016-0108**

Request to partially demolish at 208 N Royal Street.

APPLICANT: Cynthia Mercer

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case 2016-0108 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

Item #9 & #10 were combined for discussion purposes.

10 **CASE BAR2016-0109**

Request for alterations at 208 N Royal

APPLICANT: Cynthia Mercer

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case 2016-0109 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The statements in the archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - c. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - d. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board had no objection to the demolition of a non-historic rear porch and found the proposed pergola to be appropriate, after some questions to clarify the materials.

SPEAKERS

James Cottrell and Cynthia Mercer, owners, responded to questions.

11 **CASE BAR2016-0114**

Request for alterations at 500A S Union Street, Windmill Hill Park

APPLICANT: City of Alexandria, Department of Project Implementation

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 7-0.

The Old and Historic Alexandria District Board of Architectural Review noted the deferral of the request.

REASON

The Board had many questions regarding the proposed park improvements and found that the application needed significant changes to be approved. Therefore, the applicant, the City's Dept. of Project Implementation, requested a deferral. While the Board thought that some of the items were headed in the right direction, many expressed concern about the conceptual nature of the proposal. There was strong support for the shoreline restoration and for many of the improvements. The BAR made the following comments:

- Provide information on the overall park plan improvements, including the west side, specifically the playground. Consider the east and west sides as one park.
- Base plan is generally successful in concept.

- Incorporate the stone walls and irregular flagstone pavers from the west side into the design on the east side to enhance the connection between the two areas.
- Remove the proposed gateway arches. While an entry feature in some form may be appropriate, the arches as designed are not appropriate/necessary.
- Prefer to see wood decking for the pier rather than concrete but concrete may be acceptable if color/treatment is improved.
- Pursue a wood bridge option but the bridge should not be same design as that used in the west end of the City.
- Support for raised intersection and granite mounting blocks.

SPEAKERS

Anthony Gammon, Acting Deputy Director, and Matthew Landes, Principal Landscape Architect, Dept. of Project Implementation, gave a presentation on the proposed improvements to the east side of Windmill Hill Park.

Jack Browand, Division Chief, Dept. of Recreation, Parks & Cultural Activities, responded to questions and provided background on the overall park improvement plan for Windmill Hill Park.

Joe Oliva, 11 Keith's Lane, stated that Ford's Landing residents had concerns about the process for this park plan.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

- 12** A work session to discuss the proposed **Potomac Yard Metro project**.

BOARD ACTION: The Old and Historic Alexandria District Board of Architectural Review noted the deferral of the worksession.

- 13** Reports from the By-Laws Committee and the Design Guidelines Committee of the Old and Historic District BAR.

BOARD ACTION: The Board received reports from the By-Laws Committee and the Design Guidelines Committee of the Old and Historic District Board of Architectural Review.

V. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was adjourned at 10:05pm.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2016-00141

Request for fence repair at **226 S West St.**
Applicant: Alfred St. Baptist Church

CASE BAR2016-00137

Request for window replacement at **428 N Union St.**
Applicant: Elizabeth Baldwin

CASE BAR2016-00136

Request for roof repair at **107 Wolfe St.**
Applicant: John & Bernice Ryan

CASE BAR2016-00085

Request for roof repair at **6 Potomac Ct.**
Applicant: K. Moore

CASE BAR2016-00123

Request for signage at **119 King St**
Applicant: Potomac Restaurants

CASE BAR2016-00116

Request for roof repair at **210 N Pitt St.**
Applicant: Margaret Borujaily

CASE BAR2016-00121

Request for wall repair at **1310 Michigan Ave**
Applicant: D. Manna

CASE BAR2016-00120

Request for window replacement at **306 N Columbus St.**
Applicant: R. Fulwiler

CASE BAR2016-00124

Request for door replacement at **101 N Union St.**
Applicant: ARP Waterfront, LLC

CASE BAR2016-00122

Request for window and Door replacement at **210 S Fayette.**
Applicant: S. Avery

CASE BAR2016-00118

Request for fence Repair at **117 Prince St**
Applicant: S Joseph

CASE BAR2016-00125

Request for window replacement at **333 N Patrick St.**
Applicant: H. Norcross

CASE BAR2016-00126

Request for repointing at **606 Queen St.**
Applicant: Jessica Finnefrock

CASE BAR2016-00127

Request for vent replacement at **720 S Fairfax St.**
Applicant: Ronald Jerdonek