

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, February 3, 2016
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: John von Senden, Chairman
Chip Carlin, Vice Chairman
Christina Kelley
Kelly Finnigan
Wayne Neale
Christine Roberts

Members Excused: Margaret Miller

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner

Joanna Anderson, Assistant City Attorney
Alex Dambach, Land Use Services Division Chief

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm. Ms. Miller was excused.

I. MINUTES

Consideration for the minutes from the **January 20, 2016** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Ms. Finnigan, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review, approved the minutes of January 20, 2016. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

II. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

1 CASE BAR2015-0390

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **115 N Fairfax St.**
Applicant: 115, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Portions approved and portions denied, as amended, 5-1.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to deny portions and approve portions of BAR Case #2015-0390, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5 to 1. Mr. Neale voted against.

Item #1 & 2 were combined for discussion purposes

2 CASE BAR2015-0391

Request for alterations and an addition at **115 N Fairfax St.**

Applicant: 115, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Portions approved and portions denied, 5-1.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to deny portions and approve portions of BAR Case #2015-0391, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5 to 1. Mr. Neale voted against.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. **Denial** of the proposed Permit to Demolish/Capsulate.
2. **Denial** of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the following proposed alterations:
 - a. New dormers on the front and rear roof slope; and
 - b. ~~Replacement of the historic window on the first floor of the front façade.~~ (removed because not part of scope of work)
3. **Approval** of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following items:
 - a. Installation of new windows on the front, side and rear elevations which comply with the BAR's *Window Policy*;
 - b. Installation of a new 16" x 60" fixed glass skylight between the existing historic rafters;
 - c. Installation of a new window in the previously bricked-in door opening on the north (side) elevation. The new window will be a painted wood, simulated divided light window in conformance with the Board's *Window Policy*;
 - d. Restoration of the historic window on the first floor of the front elevation;
 - e. Removal of an existing coal chute on the basement level of the front elevation and the installation of a window below grade. The window will be capped with a metal grate flush with the sidewalk grade level, subject to T&ES approval;
 - f. Installation of a pair of gas coach lights at the main entrance;
 - g. Replacement of the existing fence at the rear of the property in-kind; and
 - h. Installation of an externally illuminated wall-mounted sign above the front door which complies with the *Sign Policy*.

REASON

The majority of the Board found that new dormers on the front and rear roof slopes of an 18th century building were not appropriate both due to the demolition of the historic roof framing as well as the false sense of the building's history that such dormers might convey, particularly in this highly visible location. While there was discussion over the possible visibility of an appropriately placed skylight(s) on the rear roof slope, the majority of the Board ultimately felt that it would be an acceptable amount of limited demolition and a reasonable alteration but wanted to see revision drawings at a subsequent hearing. Additionally, there was discussion regarding the removal of the existing coal chute and the loss of this type of feature on buildings throughout Old Town but the Board decided it was acceptable in this case. The minority opinion in opposition of the Board's action felt that most buildings should not be "frozen in time" and that buildings should be allowed to evolve as needs and uses changed.

SPEAKERS

Thomas French, representing the applicant, explained the revisions and responded to questions.

Gail Rothrock, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, supported the staff

recommendations and stated that there was no compelling reason to demolish historic fabric.

Yvonne Callahan, representing the Old Town Civic Association, supported the staff recommendation for denial of the dormers. She also expressed concern that minor, but important, elements such as coal chutes and the like were fast disappearing from the Alexandria streetscape.

Michael Hobbs, 419 Cameron Street, expressed concern about the demolition and recommended denial.

Bert Ely, 200 North Fairfax Street, agreed with the other speakers and opposed the demolition.

Landon Holden, the applicant, explained that her family had a long history with this building and the proposal was intended to respect the building.

III. NEW BUSINESS

3 CASE BAR2016-0008

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **828 S Royal St.**

Applicant: April Barbour

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Ms. Kelley, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-0008, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

REASON

The Board had limited discussion, finding no objection to the proposed limited demolition of this particular structure.

SPEAKERS

Brendan Schreiber, representing the applicant, was available for questions.

4 CASE BAR2016-0010

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **215 S Lee St**

Applicant: Pamela Tiemeyer

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neale seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-0010 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

See Item #5.

5 CASE BAR2016-0011

Request for alterations and an addition at **215 S Lee St**

Applicant: Pamela Tiemeyer

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neale seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-0011 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The fiber cement siding must be smooth, not wood-grained, per the Board's adopted policies.

2. The statements in the archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board found the demolition of the existing non-historic addition to be acceptable and found the new two-story rear addition to be appropriate. There was minimal discussion.

SPEAKERS

Gail Rothrock, 209 Duke Street, expressed concern with some of the detailing on the rear, finding that the columns supporting the building above the rear entry were too boxy.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Update on the status of the Ad Hoc Committee on Signage: Peter Smeallie

The Board received an update on the status of the Ad Hoc Committee on Signage. Peter Smeallie, Joanna Anderson and Alex Dambach gave a presentation and responded to questions.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2016-0013

Request for door replacement at **320 Commerce St.**

Applicant: Wayne Rosenkrans

V. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was adjourned at 9:08pm.