

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, January 6, 2016
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: John von Senden, Chairman
Chip Carlin, Vice Chairman
Christina Kelley
Kelly Finnigan
Wayne Neale
Christine Roberts

Members Excused: Margaret Miller

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm. Ms. Miller was excused.

I. MINUTES

Consideration for the minutes from the **December 2, 2015** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Finnigan, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review, approved the minutes of December 2, 2015 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

Consideration of the minutes from the **December 16, 2015** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review, approved the minutes of December 16, 2015 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

1 CASE BAR2015-0384

Request for signage at **121 S. Union St.**
Applicant: Union Street Public House

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Ms. Finnigan, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0384, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

2 CASE BAR2015-0385

Request for alterations at **323 N Washington St.**

Applicant: William and Sharon Hix

This item was removed from the Consent Calendar.

SPEAKERS

Sharon Hix, the applicant, summarized the scope of the project and answered the Board's questions.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0385, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

CONDITION OF APPROVAL

The guardrail will be no greater than 24" in height and the vertical spacing of the posts will align with the posts on the historic fence.

REASON

The Board found that the proposed guard rail height of 30" was excessive, as the owner's objective was to prevent car and truck bumpers from hitting the existing fence, and reduced the height of the guard rail to 24". Otherwise, they supported the application which was proposed to protect the historic fence from further damage.

III. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

3 CASE BAR2015-0323

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **111 S Payne St.**

Applicant: Casa Rosada Artisan Gelato

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0323, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

Item #3 & 4 were combined for discussion purposes

4 CASE BAR2015-0324

Request for an addition at **111 S Payne St.**

Applicant: Casa Rosada Artisan Gelato

SPEAKERS

David Umansky, the applicant, spoke in support of the project and answered questions.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0324, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The new siding on the north elevation of the existing one-story building is installed such that the wall appears as if it was clad at one time;
2. That the paired windows on the new addition may be constructed of a modern material, such as aluminum clad wood or fiberglass, provided that they are consistent with the Board's Window Policy;
3. The reconstruction and repointing of the chimney utilize the historic bricks to the extent possible, and that any new materials match appropriate size, color, and texture of the historic material; and the size of the chimney shall remain the same.
4. The BAR staff will be notified a minimum of 24 hours prior to the demolition and reconstruction of the chimney, so that they may be on site to ensure that the original bricks are carefully dismantled and reused to the maximum extent possible.
4. The applicant/contractor shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds; and,
5. The applicant/contractor shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board found that the new addition is consistent with the *Design Guidelines* as it will help frame the existing rear patio and its materials and orientation will further help to differentiate it from the historic main block of the building.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

5 **CASE BAR2015-0390**

Request to partially demolish and capsule at **115 N Fairfax St.**

Applicant: 115, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 6-0.

Without objection, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review noted the deferral of BAR Case #2015-0390, at the applicant's request.

Item #5 & 6 were combined for discussion purposes

6 **CASE BAR2015-0391**

Request for alterations and an addition at **115 N Fairfax St.**

Applicant: 115, LLC

SPEAKERS

Bert Ely, expressed his opposition to the new dormer windows on the front and rear elevations. He stated that the age and location of the building were too important and that the Board must draw the line at changes to truly historic buildings. He supported the staff recommendation.

Gail Rothrock, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, stated the Foundation's opposition to the proposal and testified that, in addition to the Staff's findings in the report, the proposal did not meet Criteria #6 under the Permit to Demolish Criteria. The Foundation supported the staff recommendation.

Yvonne Callahan, President of Old Town Civic Association, noted that the building's rear elevation is very visible from Ramsey Alley, a very prominent historic alley in Alexandria that is often visited by tourists and the Mercy Street visitors may be arriving soon. She expressed concerns that alterations to this rear façade will negatively impact the historic integrity of the alley.

Michael Hobbs, owner at 419 Cameron Street and on the Board of the Carlyle House museum, expressed opposition to the proposal, noting that this building is one of the most visible and important structures in this portion of Old Town. He stated that, given its age and history, the building should be held to the highest of scrutiny and the Board must preserve its historic fabric. He also stated that he felt that the proposed dormers would make the building appear "top heavy" and changes to these buildings should be undertaken with "the greatest standard of care" due to its age and location.

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 6-0.

Without objection, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review noted the deferral of BAR Case #2015-0391 for restudy, at the applicant's request.

REASON

The majority of the Board expressed strong opposition to the construction of dormers because it would alter the historic appearance of the building and because historic roof framing would be lost to construct the dormers. The Board recommended that the applicant defer the case in order to re-study design alternatives that either eliminated or greatly minimized the size and number of dormers.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2015-0395

Request for reroofing at **205 S Patrick St.**

Applicant: VA Tech Foundation

CASE BAR2015-0393

Request for roof replacement at **505 S Lee St.**

Applicant: Lisa Collis

CASE BAR2015-0392

Request for roof replacement at **114 Waterford Place**

Applicant: Robert Fogarty

CASE BAR2015-0388

Request for cell antenna replacement at **1202 S Washington St.**

Applicant: AT&T

CASE BAR2015-0389

Request for cell antenna replacement at **501 Slaters Lane.**

Applicant: AT&T

CASE BAR2015-0404

Request for signage at **111 S Columbus St.**

Applicant: Elizabeth Mason

CASE BAR2015-0405

Request for window replacement at **106 N Columbus St.**

Applicant: The Twig

V. ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was adjourned at 8:30pm.