*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Board of Architectural Review Old & Historic Alexandria District Wednesday, October 7, 2015

7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall 301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: John von Senden, Chairman

Chip Carlin, Vice Chairman

Margaret Miller Christine Roberts Wayne Neale Kelly Finnigan Christina Kelley

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager

Catherine Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm. All members present. Ms. Miller arrived during the discussion of items #13 & 14.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes from the **September 16, 2015** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Finnigan, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review, approved the minutes of September 16, 2015 as amended, 6-0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

1 CASE BAR2015-0303

Request for alterations at 630 S Pitt St.

Applicant: John Eisenhour

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Neale, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0303, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

2 CASE BAR2015-0243

Request for alterations at **201 S Lee St.** Applicant: Mark and Ann Kington

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Neale, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0243, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

3 CASE BAR2015-0304

Request for alterations at **1103 Powhatan St** Applicant: Aloysius and Colleen Boyle

This item was removed from the Consent Calendar.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 5-1

Chairman von Senden called the question, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0304, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5 to 1. Ms. Finnigan voted against.

SPEAKERS:

Colleen Boyle responded to questions.

REASON: The Board generally thought that it was acceptable to paint the masonry on the first floor of this townhouse because it was modern brick and originally had a whitewashed appearance.

4 CASE BAR2015-0305

Request for alterations at 611 Cameron St.

Applicant: Military Officers Association of America

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 5-0-1

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Neale, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0305, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0-1. Ms. Kelley recused herself.

5 CASE BAR2015-0273

Request for alterations at 201 N Columbus St.

Applicant: Robert and Constance Sprigg

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Neale, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0273, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

III. <u>NEW BUSINESS</u>

6 CASE BAR2015-0299

Request for alterations and signage at 111 N Pitt St.

Applicant: Burger Fi

SPEAKERS

Adam Crane, the applicant's designer, responded to questions.

David Landry, the applicant and owner of Burger Fi, responded to questions.

Phillip Matyas, 221 North Pitt Street, had questions concerning the use (advised that use and operation were not before the BAR) and expressed concern about the awning functioning as a billboard.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 4-2

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0299, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 4 -2. Mr. Carlin and Ms. Roberts voted against.

CONDITION OF APPROVAL

The applicant shall work with staff on the final design details for the sign illumination on the frieze.

REASON

The Board discussed whether signage on awnings was appropriate or whether it would be considered a billboard. In light of the location of this particular retail space—set back from the sidewalk and raised by several steps—the majority of the Board found the text on the awning to be appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines. There was discussion about also including a blade sign but due to the location of the storefront set back from the sidewalk, it was not an approach the applicant wanted to pursue. The Board approved the application with the staff recommendation.

7 CASE BAR2015-0097

Request for alterations at 420 S Lee St.

Applicant: Thomas Byrne

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 6-0

The Board noted the deferment of case BAR2015-0097.

8 CASE BAR2015-0289

Request for revisions to previously approved permit to demolish at 700 S Pitt St.

Applicant: Tom Campbell

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0289, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

Item #8 & 9 were combined for discussion purposes.

9 CASE BAR2015-0290

Request for revisions to previously approved plans at 700 S Pitt St.

Applicant: Tom Campbell

SPEAKERS

Tom Campbell, project architect for the applicant, responded to questions.

Art Snow, 706 South Pitt Street, had questions regarding the changes to the garden and the patio. As the landscape architect was not present there were no definitive answers about what would happen but it was noted that any above grade structures, walls, gates and the like, would require BAR approval.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0290, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

- 1. The details of the proposed retractable doors be approved by staff; and
- 2. The following archaeology comments be included on all construction documents related to ground disturbance, so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or

- concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- b. No metal detection or artifact collection may be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

REASON

The Board supported the proposed modifications to the rear addition on the non-historic portion of the housing finding the changes appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines.

10 CASE BAR2015-0312

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **3640 Wheeler Ave**.

Applicant: Siena Corporation

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Finnigan, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0312, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

Item #10 & 11 were combined for discussion purposes.

11 CASE BAR2015-0313

Request for new construction, alterations and signage at 3640 Wheeler Ave.

Applicant: Siena Corporation

SPEAKERS

Cathy Puskar, representing the applicant, responded to questions and clarified that the applicant had only agreed to remove and restore the siding on the gable on the front, not the rear of the historic building.

Charles Ablard, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in support.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Finnigan, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0313, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

- 1. The applicant consult with Staff after the removal of the aluminum siding on the *front* gambrel end of the mill to determine if any historic fabric remains and whether it is salvageable, with final approval by Staff;
- 2. The applicant shall consult with staff to study whether any historic openings exist in the attic level of the gable of the gambrel and determine an appropriate way to retain ghost marks or document the openings;
- 3. The applicant consult with Staff on the appropriate wood siding to be installed on the gambrel ends of the historic mill, if historic siding does not exist or cannot be salvaged;
- 4. The applicant work with Staff to ensure that the brick cleaning and repointing methods are consistent with current conservation practices;
- 5. The applicant work with Staff on the selection of an appropriate front door and any proposed light fixtures, if applicable, on the historic building;
- 6. That the arched windows remain on the third floor of the new building, as shown on the submitted plans; and,

7. The applicant work with P&Z and Alexandria Archaeology staff for final review of the graphics and text for any interpretive panels, consistent with the City's Wayfinding Program.

REASON

The Board enthusiastically supported restoration of the historic mill and an appropriately designed new building for the storage facility. The Board expressed interest in also having the aluminum siding removed on the rear elevation but did not require that at this time. Based on a historic photograph, the Board was interested in determining whether ghost marks or other evidence of original window openings at the attic level existed. Staff said that these were not evident from preliminary examination of the interior but would work with the applicant to identify and document these. It was also noted that the Historic Structure Report for this was still in progress and would be provided at a later date.

12 CASE BAR2015-0311

Request for new construction (site elements) at 2 Duke St

Applicant: RTS Associates, LLC.

SPEAKERS

Jonathan Rak, representing the applicant, responded to questions.

Rick Parisi, landscape architect for the applicant, responded to questions.

Greg Shron, the applicant, responded to questions.

Ted Pulliam, 2506 Sanford Street, spoke in support.

Charles Ablard, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in support of the project and noted that the Waterfront Commission was very receptive of the proposal.

Cheryl Lavoie, 1608 West Abingdon Drive, spoke in support of the entire RTS redevelopment project.

Greg Hudgins, 1120 Colonial Avenue, was highly supportive of the entire project.

Dennis Auld, 215 Park Road, speaking for all RTS items, spoke in support.

Corinne Marlowe, 619 North Columbus Street, spoke in support for all the RTS items.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0311, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

- 1. All paving, walls, lighting and similar elements within the public way or in areas with public-access easements shall conform to the Common Elements palette for the waterfront area currently being developed by OLIN and to be approved by the City. Final approval of the materials will be confirmed with a mock-up in the field.
- 2. The rails in the sidewalk on South Union Street should be metal and representative of the width of standard gauge rails and placement found historically in Alexandria.
- 3. The new north-south street/walkway through the site should have a common and continuous paving pattern consistent with the paving approved for The Strand to the north to enhance this

- connection. The Strand shall have light brick paving. The new east-west street named Pioneer Mill shall not have light brick paving.
- 4. The applicant shall add a third interpretive panel for the site, similar to the two proposed on the promenade, near the intersection of The Strand and Pioneer Mill. The interpretive panels shall be consistent with the City's adopted Wayfinding Program and final text and graphics shall be reviewed and approved by Alexandria Archaeology and Planning & Zoning staff in consultation with the applicant's history consultant.

REASON

The Board enthusiastically supported the historic interpretation plan, noting that it was one of the most extensive and thoughtful interpretation plans ever reviewed by the Board. The Board supported the various elements and thought that a plaque on 2 Duke Street was useful for understanding the history of the site. There was discussion that the chaise lounges proposed for the pier not recline too much and not provide areas for trash to collect. The Board found the site elements and historic interpretation to be appropriate and consistent with the Design Guidelines.

IV. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

13 CASE BAR2015-0189

Request for new construction (building #1) at 2 Duke St.

Applicant: RTS Associates, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 4-3

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0189, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 4 to 3. Ms. Finnigan, Mr. Neale and Ms. Miller voted against.

Item #13 & 14 were combined for discussion purposes.

14 CASE BAR2015-0190

Request for new construction (building #2) at 2 Duke St.

Applicant: RTS Associates, LLC

SPEAKERS

Jonathan Rak, representing the applicant, responded to questions.

Patrick Burkhart, project architect for the applicant, responded to questions.

Greg Shron, the applicant, responded to questions.

Gina Baum, 203 South Fairfax Street and member of the Parks and Recreation Commission, spoke in support of the project and the overall waterfront plan.

Tim Morgan, 319 South Union Street and president of the Waterford Place HOA, spoke in favor of redevelopment of the site but requested a deferral for restudy.

Hal Hardaway, 311 South Union Street, questioned whether the project met the intent of the waterfront plan.

Robert Cvejanovich, 702 South Royal Street, had questions about average finished grade (it was noted that was not a BAR matter) and requested deferral.

Phillip Matyas, 221 North Pitt Street, wanted to make sure that the rooftop mechanical equipment would be screened and that no waivers would be granted. (The applicant has proposed screening and has not requested any waivers of the screening requirement for rooftop units).

Bert Ely, 200 South Pitt Street and member of Friends of the Alexandria Waterfront, spoke in opposition to the design.

Ann Shack, 501 Tobacco Quay and representing the Tobacco Quay HOA, spoke in opposition.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 4-3

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0190, as amended and presented at the hearing (plans dated 10/5/15). The motion carried on a vote of 4 to 3. Ms.Finnigan, Mr. Neale and Ms. Miller voted against.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The updated plans dated 10/5/15 were the plans that were approved, not the original submission.

REASON

The majority of the Board supported the final scheme that included a reduction in the projection and height of the rooftop overhang as well as a more clearly established setback above 30 feet on the waterfront and street elevations. The majority observed that all of the concerns raised throughout the process have been addressed and these two buildings reflected the direction for a more contemporary approach to the east elevations of these waterfront buildings as part of the traditional to contemporary architectural transition west-to-east across the site. The majority found the project met both the Standards and the Additional Standards-Potomac River Vicinity outlined in the zoning ordinance, as well as the Design Guidelines adopted by the BAR. There was discussion about how the rooftop mechanical equipment was screened and Mr. Burkhart explained that the parapet and roof overhang on the east elevation were part of an architecturally integrated screening design for rooftop equipment. Some Board members felt that the project did not reflect the grain of Old Town and that there should be greater differentiation between the two waterfront buildings.

V. WITHDRAWN PRIOR TO HEARING

CASE BAR2015-0242

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at 201 S Lee St.

Applicant: Mark and Ann Kington

BOARD ACTION: The Board noted the withdrawal

CASE BAR2015-0247

Request for a waiver of HVAC rooftop screening requirement at 113 S West St.

Applicant: 113 South West St. LLC

BOARD ACTION: The Board noted the withdrawal

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

15 Informational Presentation on VRE's proposed Pedestrian Tunnel at Union Station.

BOARD ACTION: The Board received an informational presentation on VRE's proposed Pedestrian Tunnel at Union Station.

Adjournment

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was adjourned at 10:35pm.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2015-0288

Request for window and door replacement at 220 S Payne St.

Applicant: Jeffrey Ferfolia

CASE BAR2015-0298

Request for window repair at 208 N Royal St.

Applicant: James Cohrell

CASE BAR2015-0300

Request for signage at 1600 King St.

Applicant: Cualtzin Salon

CASE BAR2015-0302

Request for window replacement at 425 Cameron St.

Applicant: Keith and Norell Anderson

CASE BAR2015-0306

Request for stoop and walkway alterations at **516 Cameron St**.

Applicant: David and Sue Wilkes

CASE BAR2015-0307

Request for repointing at 307 S St Asaph St.

Applicant: James McGonigle

CASE BAR2015-0308

Request for shutters and repointing at 516 Cameron St.

Applicant: David and Sue Wilkes

CASE BAR2015-0309

Request for signage at 317 S Washington St.

Applicant: Marcela Hughes

CASE BAR2015-0310

Request for trim repair at 107 Cameron Mews.

Applicant: Homework Remodeling, Inc.

CASE BAR2015-0314

Request for repointing at 422 Queen St.

Applicant: Charles Waterman

CASE BAR2015-0315

Request for HVAC replacement at 717 Queen St.

Applicant: Alexandria Library

CASE BAR2015-0317

Request for signage at 730 S Washington St.

Applicant: Andrea Spruch

CASE BAR2015-0318

Request for window installation at 604 N. Columbus St.

Applicant: Diane Ferrell

CASE BAR2015-0326

Request for signage at **1007 King St**. Applicant: Old Town Bookkeeping

CASE BAR2015-0327

Request for signage at 115 S Columbus St.

Applicant: Medspa

CASE BAR2015-0330

Request for signage and trim replacement at 1435 Duke St.

Applicant: Maeng Yi