Docket Item # 14 & 15 BAR CASE # 2015-00019 & 2015-00020

BAR Meeting February 18, 2015

ISSUE:	Permit to Demolish and Certificate of Appropriateness
APPLICANT:	Monarch Row LLC
LOCATION:	116 King Street
ZONE:	KR/King Street Retail

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish and Certificate of Appropriateness with the two conditions listed below. Further, staff suggests, but does not condition as part of this approval, that the center window on the front (north) elevation be returned to the original dimensions based on the 1936 photo and install either a replica wood shutter/door over a single glass pane or a multi-light window with jib panel below.

- 1. The windows on the east (side) elevation be replaced with six-over-six, simulated divided light, wood windows that meet all criteria in the *BAR Window Policy*, and;
- 2. The remaining windows on the front (north) elevation be replaced with six-over-six, single-glazed wood windows that are consistent with the *BAR Window Policy*.

\*\*EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

\*\*BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

\*\*APPEAL OF DECISION: In accordance with the Zoning Ordinance, if the Board of Architectural Review denies or approves an application in whole or in part, the applicant or opponent may appeal the Board's decision to City Council on or before 14 days after the decision of the Board.



# BAR2015-00019 & BAR2015-00020

**<u>Note</u>**: In the interest of clarity and brevity, staff has coupled the reports for the Permit to Demolish/Capsulate (BAR 2015-00019) and the Certificate of Appropriateness (BAR 2015-00020).

# I. <u>ISSUE</u>

The applicant is returning to the BAR for approval of a Permit to Demolish and Certificate of Appropriateness in order to complete the following renovations as part of an office expansion at the abutting property at 118 King Street. The offices currently located at 118 King Street plan to occupy the second floor at 116 King Street, above the retail space for Decorium. The Board should note that the two buildings have different floor height, necessitating a small amount of interior demolition for a doorway (not within the BAR purview) and a stair to connect the two spaces, which will require a portion of the roof be demolished for a roof gable. In total, the applicant requests approval for the following:

- 1. Enlarge two skylights, previously approved by the BAR on September 3, 2014.
- 2. Demolish a portion of the roof's west slope roof to construct a gable dormer that will accommodate a stair into the adjacent building at 118 King Street. The dormer and roof will be covered with standing seam metal.
- 3. Replace the existing windows on the north and east elevation with Marvin Ultimate wood, simulated divided light windows in a two-over-two configuration.

#### II. <u>HISTORY</u>

Brothers John and Harry Aitechson constructed the two-story brick building at 116 King Street in 1885 as a machine shop and storage for their business. The Aitchesons were Scottish immigrants that specialized in farm equipment and boat engine repair. The company expanded into the plumbing supply business after World War II and currently operates on South Dove Street in Alexandria. The subject property on King Street remained in the family until sold in 2000.

The one-story cinder block addition to the south was constructed between 1902-07. Staff believes the roof framing and masonry are original features of the property. The first floor storefront present today was likely added around 1962. By 1975, new second floor windows were installed and the property became part of the former Small Mall. Over the years, the BAR has approved numerous applications, mostly for signage.

The Board most recently approved demolition/capsulation in September 2014 for new skylights, vestibule, and roof deck on the rear of the property (BAR2014-00249). Additionally, the BAR approved a waiver of the rooftop mechanical screening requirement on November 5, 2014 (BAR2014-00337).

### III. ANALYSIS

#### Permit to Demolish/Capsulate

In considering a Permit to Demolish, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, §10-105(B):

- (1) Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical interest that its moving, removing, capsulating or razing would be to the detriment of the public interest?
- (2) Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into a historic house?
- (3) Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?
- (4) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve the memorial character of the George Washington Memorial Parkway?
- (5) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?
- (6) Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?

The applicant has represented to staff that the existing, and likely original, roof trusses will **not** be demolished as part of the demolition required for the proposed dormer or skylights. Due to the fact that the requested area of demolition is limited, does not impact any unusual or uncommon features, and will likely not be visible from a public way, staff finds that none of the above criteria are met and that a Permit to Demolish should be approved.

### Certificate of Appropriateness

Staff recommends that the Board approve replacement windows consistent with the *BAR Window Policy*. The existing two-over-two windows on the front elevation are replacement windows from the late 1960's, which likely replaced the original six-over-six windows, as shown in the 1936 photograph below. Multi-light windows were very common on warehouses and industrial buildings, such as this one, because the smaller panes of glass were less expensive and staff finds that restoring the windows to their original configuration will more accurately reflect Alexandria's industrial and commercial past.

Staff has inspected the visible windows on the east elevation and determined that there is no remaining wavy or cylinder glass in these windows. The sashes are likely early 20<sup>th</sup> century replacements and the frames original, but staff found no unusual craftsmanship or materials that would warrant preservation of the frames. A few vinyl windows on the east elevation are minimally visible, which the applicant also intends to replace using wood.

Lastly, staff notes that historically there was not a center window on the second floor of the front façade, but a hoist beam and door. The original arched lintel for this door is still visible from King Street and staff believes that this feature could be easily restored (see figure 2). Although the Board's practice is not to require restoration of features not part of the application before them, staff strongly recommends that this original feature be restored now, while the interior is being completely renovated and there would be no disruption to tenants. After this renovation is

complete and the drywall and other finishes are applied to the interior, it is highly unlikely any owner would undertake this straightforward restoration to interpret the building's original appearance and use. While a replica warehouse door is one option for replacement, staff also supports a single pane of glass with operable interior wood shutters that mimic the historic appearance while still providing the occupants with light. A jib window or window with a solid panel at its base, such as on the north elevation of Fitzgerald's Warehouse at 100 King Street (Starbucks) or 106 S. Union St. (Figure 3: Virtue Feed & Grain), is a third option.



**Figure 1:** Photograph showing front of 116 King Street in **1936** with multi-pane windows on both the north and east elevations. (photo courtesy of Jim Chauncey). The oriel window was removed in 1962 (permit #18776). The casement window to the right of the entrance is not original to the first period of construction. Staff located no BAR approvals for either alteration.



Figure 2: View of the front windows showing the easily removable infill around the center window.



Figure 3: Example of one design solution for a former loading door on the west elevation of Virtue Feed & Grain.

<u>Summary</u>

Staff finds that the proposed extent of roof demolition fails to meet the criteria of §10-105(B) in the Zoning Ordinance and a Permit to Demolish should be granted. Select demolition, such as is proposed here, helps to provide viable uses and restoration of the often underused second floors in historic and commercial buildings. Staff supports window replacement, with the requirement that all replacement windows be six-over-six and in compliance with BAR's adopted *Window Policy*. Staff further recommends, but does not condition any recommendation for approval, that the center window on the front façade be returned to its original opening size and replaced with a replica door, jib window, or single-light window with interior shutters and hoist beam.

### **STAFF**

Mary Catherine Collins, Historic Preservation Planner, Planning & Zoning Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager, Planning & Zoning

# III. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C- code requirement R- recommendation S- suggestion F- finding

## Zoning Comments

- C-1 Proposed skylights and dormer connecting 116 and 118 King Street will comply with zoning.
- F-1 The area under the dormer will be occupied by stairs and can be excluded from the FAR.

### **Code Administration**

No comments provided

### **Transportation and Environmental Services**

- C-1 This property is located within the 1%-chance per year floodplain. Therefore, the applicant must comply with Section 6-300 (FLOODPLAIN DISTRICT) of Article VI (SPECIAL AND OVERLAY ZONES) of the City of Alexandria Zoning Ordinance, Section 6-305 (D) All applications for new construction or substantial improvement within any floodplain district, and all building permits issued for the floodplain shall incorporate the following information:
  - (1) the base flood elevation at the site;
  - (2) the elevation of the lowest floor (including basement). (T&ES)
- C-2 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Noise Control Code, Title 11, Chapter 5, which sets the maximum permissible noise level as measured at the property line. (T&ES)
- C-3 Roof, surface and sub-surface drains be connected to the public storm sewer system, if available, by continuous underground pipe. Where storm sewer is not available applicant must provide a design to mitigate impact of storm water drainage onto adjacent properties

and to the satisfaction of the Director of Transportation & Environmental Services. (Sec.5-6-224) (T&ES)

- C-4 All secondary utilities serving this site shall be placed underground. (Sec. 5-3-3) (T&ES)
- C-5 All improvements to the city right-of-way such as curbing, sidewalk, driveway aprons, etc. must be city standard design. (Sec. 5-2-1) (T&ES)
- R-1 Applicant shall be responsible for repairs to the adjacent city right-of-way if damaged during construction activity. (T&ES)
- R-2 No permanent structure may be constructed over any existing private and/or public utility easements. It is the responsibility of the applicant to identify any and all existing easements on the plan. (T&ES)
- F-1 Previously reviewed under BAR2014-000249 & BAR2014-00050. (TES)
- F-2 After review of the information provided, an approved grading plan is not required at this time. Please note that if any changes are made to the plan it is suggested that T&ES be included in the review. (T&ES)
- F-3 If the alley located at the rear of the parcel is to be used at any point of the construction process the following will be required:

<u>For a Public Alley -</u> The applicant shall contact T&ES, Construction Management & Inspections at (703) 746-4035 to discuss any permits and accommodation requirements that will be required. (T&ES)

#### Alexandria Archaeology

F-1 The proposed project will not cause any ground disturbance, and therefore there will be no impact to any potential archaeological resources.

# V. ATTACHMENTS

- 1 Historic photos
- 2 Supplemental Materials
- 3 Application for BAR2015-00019 & 2014-00020 : 116 King Street

# **ATTACHMENT 1**



Figure 4: Circa 1920; image from <u>A</u> Seaport Saga by Smith and Miller.



**Figure 6: 1936;** image from Jim Chauncey, a descendant of the Aitcheson bros.



**Figure 5: circa 1955;** image from the Tax Assessor's Handiwork at Special Collections



**Figure 7: Circa 1975;** image from Special Collections Photo Collection







2) EXISTING EXTERIOR - KING STREET VIEW



3) EXISTING EXTERIOR - VIEW OF ROOF FROM ADJACENT BUILDING ROOF



4) EXISTING EXTERIOR - VIEW FROM ALLEY IN REAR





1) EXISTING INTERIOR VIEW





3) EXISTING INTERIOR VIEW



the second se	ø
BA ABEAMINIA BEFEE	and the second state of th
Alexandria, Virginia 22314 ph: 571-327-1723 fx: 703-548-4305 PROJECT TITLE GOAL FINANCIAL OFFICE SUITE DEVICE SUITE	
RENOVATION 114 (116) King Street Alexandria, VA 22314 CONSULTANTS INTERIOR DESIGNER Blackborry Farm Design	
1471 West Miller's Cove Road Wailand, TN 37686 Attr. JII Röler 865.273.8508 MEP Potomac Energy Group 2901 Telestar Ct. Falls Church, VA 22042 703.683.5000 STREETMAN	
Unton Engineering LLC 46090 Lake Center Plaza Suite 309 Potomac Falls, VA 20165 571.323.0320	
ISSUED FOR B.A.R. OLD & HISTORIC ALEXANDRIA BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW	ALL
REVISIONS Bonala Gate Deservion	A REAL PROPERTY AND A REAL
POLICET NUMBER 14_002	THE PARTY OF THE P
MTE JANUARY 20TH, 2015	and a state of the
SHEATTING EXISTING INTERIOR PHOTOS	and the second se
A1.1	and the second se









ATTACHMENT #3 BAR Case # 2015-00019/0020
ADDRESS OF PROJECT: 16 KING STREET (ZND FLOOR)
TAX MAP AND PARCEL: 075.01-06-05 ZONING: KR
APPLICATION FOR: (Please check all that apply)
PERMIT TO MOVE, REMOVE, ENCAPSULATE OR DEMOLISH (Required if more than 25 square feet of a structure is to be demolished/impacted)
WAIVER OF VISION CLEARANCE REQUIREMENT and/or YARD REQUIREMENTS IN A VISION CLEARANCE AREA (Section 7-802, Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)
WAIVER OF ROOFTOP HVAC SCREENING REQUIREMENT (Section 6-403(B)(3), Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)
Applicant: X Property Owner Business (Please provide business name & contact person)
Name: MONARCH ROW LLC
Address: 118 KING STREAT
City: ALEXANURIA State: UA Zip: 22314
Phone: 703.299-6513 E-mail: ADMINE ROUTE GOVENTURES. Com
Authorized_Agent (if applicable):
Name: PAUL BECKMANN Phone: 571.297.1921
E-mail: PBECKMANN C BECK-ARCH. COM
Legal Property Owner:
Name: MONARCH ROW LLC
Address: 118 KING STREAT, 2ND FLOOR
City: ALEXANDRIA State: UA Zip: 22314
Phone: 703.299.6513 E-mail: ADMINC ROLIE 66 VENTURES. Com
<ul> <li>Yes X No</li> <li>Is there an historic preservation easement on this property?</li> <li>Yes X No</li> <li>If yes, has the easement holder agreed to the proposed alterations?</li> <li>Yes X No</li> <li>Is there a homeowner's association for this property?</li> <li>Yes X No</li> <li>If yes, has the homeowner's association approved the proposed alterations?</li> </ul>

If you answered yes to any of the above, please attach a copy of the letter approving the project.

BAR Case # 2015-00019/0020

NATURE OF PROPOSED WORK: Please check all that apply

	NEW CONSTI EXTERIOR AL awning doors lighting other	TERATIC		or garden wal	HVAC		🔲 sh	nutters ned
X	ADDITION							
XXX	DEMOLITION/	ENCAPS	ULATION					
	SIGNAGE							
ha at	SCRIPTION O							
Co	NSTRUCT	00 01	= New	COUNE	TNG	STARW	ing BI	ETWEEN
	6 KING							
γ	10DIFICAT	ous.	AOUIT	low of	NEL	1 skyc	161475	AT ROOF

RIDGE.

#### SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS:

Items listed below comprise the **minimum supporting materials** for BAR applications. Staff may request additional information during application review. Please refer to the relevant section of the *Design Guidelines* for further information on appropriate treatments.

Applicants must use the checklist below to ensure the application is complete. Include all information and material that are necessary to thoroughly describe the project. Incomplete applications will delay the docketing of the application for review. Pre-application meetings are required for all proposed additions. All applicants are encouraged to meet with staff prior to submission of a completed application.

Electronic copies of submission materials should be submitted whenever possible.

**Demolition/Encapsulation :** All applicants requesting 25 square feet or more of demolition/encapsulation must complete this section. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

	N/A
R	Г
R	Г

- Survey plat showing the extent of the proposed demolition/encapsulation.
- Existing elevation drawings clearly showing all elements proposed for demolition/encapsulation.

Clear and labeled photographs of all elevations of the building if the entire structure is proposed to be demolished.

Description of the reason for demolition/encapsulation.

Description of the alternatives to demolition/encapsulation and why such alternatives are not considered feasible.

Additions & New Construction: Drawings must be to scale and should not exceed 11" x 17" unless approved by staff. All plans must be folded and collated into 3 complete 8 1/2" x 11" sets. Additional copies may be requested by staff for large-scale development projects or projects fronting Washington Street. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

		Scaled survey plat showing dimensions of lot and location of existing building and other structures on the lot, location of proposed structure or addition, dimensions of existing structure(s), proposed addition or new construction, and all exterior, ground and roof mounted
		equipment.
		FAR & Open Space calculation form.
		Clear and labeled photographs of the site, surrounding properties and existing structures, if
		applicable.
Π		Existing elevations must be scaled and include dimensions.
Ħ	F	Proposed elevations must be scaled and include dimensions. Include the relationship to
		adjacent structures in plan and elevations.
		Materials and colors to be used must be specified and delineated on the drawings. Actual
Ц	, LLL,	
_	_	samples may be provided or required.
Ш	Ц	Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows,
		doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.

For development site plan projects, a model showing mass relationships to adjacent properties and structures.

**Signs & Awnings:** One sign per building under one square foot does not require BAR approval unless illuminated. All other signs including window signs require BAR approval. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

		Linear feet of building: Front: Secondary front (if corner lot): Square feet of existing signs to remain:
		Photograph of building showing existing conditions.
		Dimensioned drawings of proposed sign identifying materials, color, lettering style and text. Location of sign (show exact location on building including the height above sidewalk).
		Means of attachment (drawing or manufacturer's cut sheet of bracket if applicable).
Ц	Ц	Description of lighting (if applicable). Include manufacturer's cut sheet for any new lighting fixtures and information detailing how it will be attached to the building's facade.

Alterations: Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

	N/A	
X		Clear and labeled photographs of the site, especially the area being impacted by the alterations,
•		all sides of the building and any pertinent details.

	Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows,
	doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.

Drawings accurately representing the changes to the proposed structure, including materials and overall dimensions. Drawings must be to scale.

An official survey plat showing the proposed locations of HVAC units, fences, and sheds.

Historic elevations or photographs should accompany any request to return a structure to an earlier appearance.

ALL APPLICATIONS: Please read and check that you have read and understand the following items:

🗌 l ha Ale

I have submitted a filing fee with this application. (Checks should be made payable to the City of Alexandria. Please contact staff for assistance in determining the appropriate fee.)

- I understand the notice requirements and will return a copy of the three respective notice forms to BAR staff at least five days prior to the hearing. If I am unsure to whom I should send notice I will contact Planning and Zoning staff for assistance in identifying adjacent parcels.
- I, the applicant, or an authorized representative will be present at the public hearing.

I understand that any revisions to this initial application submission (including applications deferred for restudy) must be accompanied by the BAR Supplemental form and 3 sets of revised materials.

The undersigned hereby attests that all of the information herein provided including the site plan, building elevations, prospective drawings of the project, and written descriptive information are true, correct and accurate. The undersigned further understands that, should such information be found incorrect, any action taken by the Board based on such information may be invalidated. The undersigned also hereby grants the City of Alexandria permission to post placard notice as required by Article XI, Division A, Section 11-301(B) of the 1992 Alexandria City Zoning Ordinance, on the property which is the subject of this application. The undersigned also hereby authorizes the City staff and members of the BAR to inspect this site an necessary in the course of research and evaluating the application. The applicant, if other than the property owner, also attests that he/she has obtained permission from the property owner to make this application.

APPLICANT ØRIZED AGENT: Signature (cm.Ham) **Printed Narhe:** Date:

#### OWNERSHIP AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT Use additional sheets if necessary

<u>1. Applicant.</u> State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the applicant, unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership
1. RYAN KATZ	118 KING ST. ALEXANDRULINA 22314	100%
2.		
3.		

<u>2. Property.</u> State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the property located at <u>116 KIWG 51</u>. (address), unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Address	Percent of Ownership
118 KING ST. ALEXANDRIA, VA ZZZI4	100%
	118 KING ST.

<u>3. Business or Financial Relationships.</u> Each person or entity listed above (1 and 2), with an ownership interest in the applicant or in the subject property is required to disclose **any** business or financial relationship, as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance, existing at the time of this application, or within the12-month period prior to the submission of this application with any member of the Alexandria City Council, Planning Commission, Board of Zoning Appeals or either Boards of Architectural Review.

Name of person or entity	Relationship as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance	Member of the Approving Body (i.e. City Council, Planning Commission, etc.)
1	-	-
2	~	-
3	-	-

NOTE: Business or financial relationships of the type described in Sec. 11-350 that arise after the filing of this application and before each public hearing must be disclosed prior to the public hearings.

As the applicant or the applicant's authorized agent, I hereby attest to the best of my ability that the information provided above is true and correct.

Signature