Docket Item # 1 & 2 BAR CASE # 2014-0427 & 2014-0428

BAR Meeting January 21, 2015

ISSUE:	Permit to Demolish/Capsulate and Certificate of Appropriateness for an Addition/Alterations
APPLICANT:	Jennifer Shoup by Stephen Kulinski, Architect
LOCATION:	418 Gibbon Street
ZONE:	RM / Residential Zone

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish and Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and alterations, as submitted with the following archaeology conditions:

- 1. Include the following statements on all construction documents involving any ground disturbing activities, so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/contractor shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703.746.4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/contractor shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

**EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

**BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

**APPEAL OF DECISION: In accordance with the Zoning Ordinance, if the Board of Architectural Review denies or approves an application in whole or in part, the applicant or opponent may appeal the Board's decision to City Council on or before 14 days after the decision of the Board.



*<u>Note</u>: Staff coupled BAR #2014-0427 (Permit to Demolish/Capsulate) and BAR #2014-0428 (Certificate of Appropriateness) for clarity and brevity. This item requires a roll call vote.

I. <u>ISSUE</u>

The applicant is requesting approval of a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate and Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new, rear addition at 418 Gibbon Street.

The *Permit to Demolish/Capsulate* consists of:

- Demolition of the existing rear wall on the 1963 two, story rear addition.
- Capsulation of the existing 1963 exterior brick chimney/flue located on the rear wall.



Figure 1: Areas to be Demolished/Capsulated

The *Certificate of Appropriateness* consists of:

- Expansion of the existing house by the addition of a two-story, 282 sq. ft. frame shed roof addition. The addition will contain HardiePlank lap fiber cement siding (5" exposure, smooth finish) with Azek trim, aluminum-clad wood 1/1 windows and single-light sliding doors, an EPDM membrane roofing, half-round painted-metal gutters, and a parged concrete foundation.
- Installation of a screened, AC condenser unit adjacent to the chimney/flue on the roof.

II. <u>HISTORY</u>

The two-story, late-Victorian period main block was constructed in **c1912** with a one-story shed roof addition. According to City Building Permit records in **1963**, the one-story addition was demolished and the current, two-story, shed roof, concrete block extension was added to the south (rear) elevation.

Today, the dwelling's main block is clad in aluminum siding and the openings for the windows and the front entry door are reduced in size and currently contain modern 1/1 sash and a six-panel wood door. It is believed that the projecting boxed cornice is enclosing a false mansard roof similar in form illustrated in the example photo below.



Figure 2: Possible configuration of historic roof structure.

The property is enclosed with a six-foot high wood fence along the east and south property lines and does not contain on-site parking.

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>

Staff has no objection to the proposed demolition of the south (rear) elevation of the extension (**1963**) and the capsulation of its chimney/flue (1963) and generally finds the proposed addition and alterations to be compatible with the existing building and surrounding area.

Permit to Demolish

In considering a Permit to Demolish, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, §10-105(B):

(1) Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical interest that its moving, removing, capsulating or razing would be to the detriment of the public interest?

(2) Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into a historic house?

(3) Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?

(4) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve the memorial character of the George Washington Memorial Parkway?

(5) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?

(6) Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?

The scope of the proposed demolition is to non-contributing elements which are located at the rear of the building, which are not of unusual or uncommon design, texture or material. Staff has no objections to the proposed demolition/capsulation, as these features do not contribute to the significance of the building or property and finds that none of the criteria for demolition/capsulation are met and the Permit to Demolish/Capsulate should be granted.

Certificate of Appropriateness

A design for any addition should respect the architectural heritage of the historic structure by creating subtle delineations between the historic house and the new additions. It should also not overwhelm the existing structure and must be sympathetic to the traditional street and building patterns within the district, including patterns of height, massing and roof pitch. The *Design Guidelines* also encourage designs for new additions that are "respectful of the existing structure and should seek to be background statements or echo the design elements of the existing structure."

The proposed addition is designed to accommodate a larger kitchen on the first story and an expansion of the master bedroom on the second. The addition will include HardiePlank lap siding with Azek trim and aluminum-clad, wood 1/1 windows and sliding doors in accordance with the Board's *Siding* and *Window/Door Policies*.

As the attached drawings illustrate, although set back almost 37' feet from the front property line, it is possible that the new addition will be partially visible from the horse alley along the east (side) property line. Staff finds that this small amount of visible area does not compete with the historic structure, that the proposed addition's mass and scale are compatible with the existing Victorian style of the house, and the addition to the rear of this historic structure is sympathetic with the existing development patterns along the street.

Staff supports the location of the HVAC on the rooftop and its proposed screening, as it is to be sited downslope and adjacent to the existing chimney/flue and will not be visible from the public ROW.

Finally, the proposed four inch (4") offset of the new addition's west and east (side) elevations will clearly distinguish the new addition from the existing historic structure. The change in siding material from wood to fiber cement along with this proposed offset is sufficient for this simple, Victorian dwelling.

In Staff's opinion, the proposed addition is appropriate and compatible with the main historic house in terms of mass, scale, and height and does not negatively impact the integrity of the historic resource or its adjacent historic resources. Staff recommends approval of the Permit to

Demolish/Capsulate and the Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and alterations, as submitted.

As a side note, although the applicant does not propose to make any alterations to the front elevation at this time, staff encourages restoration of the historic material and features on this prominent façade and notes that the much of the future rehabilitation work for the front elevation can be reviewed and approved through the BAR's administrative approval process. This includes removal of the non-historic aluminum-siding and the repair or replacement in-kind of the historic wood siding, and the installation of historically appropriate wood windows and entry door. As always, it is recommended that the applicant contact BAR staff when they are ready to commence with these or any exterior renovation project for assistance.

STAFF

Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner, Planning & Zoning Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager, Planning & Zoning

IV. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C- code requirement R- recommendation S- suggestion F- finding

Zoning Comments

- F-1 Correct the following errors on the FAR sheet prior to the submission of a building permit:
 - Required open space is 296.45 square feet, not 300 square feet as indicted on the FAR sheet.
 - Subject property is not subject to the infill regulations. References to deductions for attic areas less than 5' in height should be removed and changed to areas less than 7'-6".
 - Addition measures 8.3' by 11.58', a total of 96.11 square feet, not 94 square feet as indicated.
- C-1 Proposed two-story addition and screened roof top unit comply with zoning.

Code Administration

No comments received.

Transportation and Environmental Services

- R-1 Applicant shall be responsible for repairs to the adjacent city right-of-way if damaged during construction activity. (T&ES)
- R-2 No permanent structure may be constructed over any existing private and/or public utility easements. It is the responsibility of the applicant to identify any and all existing easements on the plan. (T&ES)
- F-1 After review of the information provided, an approved grading plan is not required at this time. Please note that if any changes are made to the plan it is suggested that T&ES be included in the review. (T&ES)
- C-1 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Solid Waste Control, Title 5, Chapter 1, which sets forth the requirements for the recycling of materials (Sec. 5-1-99). (T&ES)
- C-2 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Noise Control Code, Title 11, Chapter 5, which sets the maximum permissible noise level as measured at the property line. (T&ES)
- C-3 Roof, surface and sub-surface drains be connected to the public storm sewer system, if available, by continuous underground pipe. Where storm sewer is not available applicant must provide a design to mitigate impact of stormwater drainage onto

adjacent properties and to the satisfaction of the Director of Transportation & Environmental Services. (Sec.5-6-224) (T&ES)

- C-4 All secondary utilities serving this site shall be placed underground. (Sec. 5-3-3) (T&ES)
- C-5 Any work within the right-of-way requires a separate permit from T&ES. (Sec. 5-2) (T&ES)

Alexandria Archaeology

- F-1 Tax records indicate that the block bounded by Gibbon, Royal, Franklin and Pitts streets was owned by Stephen Shinn in 1850 and contained a stable. Houses were present on the 400 block of Gibbon by 1877 according to the G.M. Hopkins insurance map. The property therefore has the potential to yield archaeological resources that could provide insight into life in 19th-century Alexandria.
- R-1 The statements below shall appear on final site plan sheets involving any ground disturbing activities so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/contractor shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703.746.4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/contractor shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
 - c. All required preservation measures shall be completed in compliance with Section 11-411 of the Alexandria Zoning Ordinance.

V. ATTACHMENTS

I – *Supplemental Materials*

2 – Application for BAR2014-0427 & 0428: 418 Gibbon Street



ATTACHMENT #1

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND ZONING FLOOR AREA RATIO AND OPEN SPACE CALCULATIONS

A. Property Information 418 GIBBON STREET

RM Zone

Maximum Allowable Floor Area

1270

A2. Total Lot Area

Floor Area Ratio Allowed by Zone

B. Existing Gross Floor Area

Existing Gross Area*		Allowable Exclusions	
Basement		Basement**	
First Floor	457	Stairways**	56
Second Floor	457	Mechanical**	5
Third Floor	457	Other** attic <5'	457
Porches/ Other		Total Exclusions .	518
Total Gross *	1371		

B1. Existing Gross Floor Area * [37] Sq. Ft. B2. Allowable Floor Exclusions** 5[8] Sq. Ft. B3. Existing Floor Area minus Exclusions 053 Sq. Ft. (subtract B2 from B1)

C. Proposed Gross Floor Area (does not include existing area)

Proposed Gross Area*		Allowable Exclusions	
Basement		Basement**	· <u>·</u>
First Floor	94	Stairways**	
Second Floor	94	Mechanical**	
Third Floor	94	Other** Ottlc<51	94
Porches/ Other		Total Exclusions	94
Total Gross *	282		

1041

C1, Proposed Gross Floor Area * <u>292</u> Sq. Ft. C2, Allowable Floor Exclusions** <u>94</u> Sq. Ft. C3. Proposed Floor Area minus Exclusions <u>108</u> Sq. Ft. (subtract C2 from C1)

*Gross floor area is the sum of all gross horizontal areas under roof, measured from the face of exterior walls, including basements, garages, sheds, gazebos, guest buildings and other accessory buildings.

** Refer to the zoning ordinance (Section2-145(B)) and consult with zoning staff for information regarding allowable exclusions.

If taking exclusions other than basements, floor plans with excluded areas must be submitted for review. Sections may also be required for some exclusions.

F. Open Space Calculations

D. Existing + Proposed Floor Area

D2. Total Floor Area Allowed by Zone (A2)

D1. Total Floor Area (add B3 and C3)

Existing Open Space	400
Required Open Space	300
Proposed Open Space	300

The undersigned hereby certifies and attests that, to the best of his/her knowledge, the above computations are true and correct.

Sq. Ft.

Sq. Ft.

Signature

Date: 12 - 12

Updated July 10, 2008



KULINSKIGROUP.COM

Kulinski Group Architects P.C. 104 N. West Street Alexandria, Va 22314

418 Gibbon Street – Board of Architectural Review Old and Historic District Materials Specification List

Siding:	Hardie Plank Lap Siding (Smooth Texture)
	5" Exposure
	Color – Primed; Painted w/ Sherwin Williams #SW6693 Lily
Gutters / Downspouts	s:Metal 6" Diameter half round gutters w/ 4" diameter round downspouts
	Color – Match windows (Brilliant White)
Rear Exterior Light:	Kichler – Seaside Collection Outdoor Wall Fixture (Model 9023BK)
	Color – Black (Painted)



Windows:	Jeld-wen – Siteline EX Wood Double Hung Windows
	Color – Brilliant White
	Simulated Divided Lite
	One over One
Sythetic Wood Trim:	Azek (smooth texture)
	Color - Painted w/ Sherwin Williams #SW7029 Agreeable Gray
Roofing:	EPDM Self-Adhering Roofing Membrane
Rear Entry Door:	Jeldwen – Siteline EX- Wood Sliding Patio Door
	Color – Brilliant White
	Narrow Stile (No grille)
	Hardware – Oil rubbed bronze



THE INFORMATION CONTAINED ON THIS DOCUMENT MAY NOT BE COPIED, REPRODUCED OR ALTERED IN ANY FORM WITHOUT PERMISSION IN WRITING FROM THE COPYRIGHT OWNER

INC.

DOMINION SURVEYORS,

AH AH

CHORNED T



CITY OF ALEXANDRIA - BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW OLD & HISTORIC DISTRICT - PLAN SUBMITTAL









CITY OF ALEXANDRIA - BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW OLD & HISTORIC DISTRICT - PLAN SUBMITTAL









2 418 GIBBON STREET - FRONT A3 SCALE: N.T.S.



5 418 GIBBON STREET - ALLEY SIDE SCALE: N.T.S.



14

SCALE: N.T.S.

、A3 ∕





ATTACHMENT #2 BAR Case # 2014-00427/00428 ADDRESS OF PROJECT: 418 Gibbon Street TAX MAP AND PARCEL: 080.02-06-08 ZONING: RM APPLICATION FOR: (Please check all that apply) CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS PERMIT TO MOVE, REMOVE, ENCAPSULATE OR DEMOLISH (Required if more than 25 square feet of a structure is to be demolished/impacted) WAIVER OF VISION CLEARANCE REQUIREMENT and/or YARD REQUIREMENTS IN A VISION CLEARANCE AREA (Section 7-802, Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance) WAIVER OF ROOFTOP HVAC SCREENING REQUIREMENT (Section 6-403(B)(3), Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance) Applicant: Property Owner Business (Please provide business name & contact person) Name: Jennifer L Shoup Address: 418 Gibbon Street City: Alexandria State: VA 22314 Zip: Phone: (703) 519-3760 E-mail: Authorized Agent (if applicable): Attorney Architect Name: STEPHEN W. KULINSKI Phone: (703) 836-7243 E-mail: steve@kulinskigroup.com Legal Property Owner: Name: Jennifer L Shoup Address: 418 Gibbon Street Zip: 22314 City: Alexandria State: VA Phone: (703) 519-3760 E-mail: Yes No Is there an historic preservation easement on this property? Yes No If yes, has the easement holder agreed to the proposed alterations?

Yes No Is there a homeowner's association for this property?

Yes No If yes, has the homeowner's association approved the proposed alterations?

If you answered yes to any of the above, please attach a copy of the letter approving the project.

NATURE OF PROPOSED WORK: Please check all that apply

NEW CONSTRUC	TION		
EXTERIOR ALTER	RATION: Please check all that app	oly.	
awning	fence, gate or garden wall	HVAC equipment	shutters
🖾 doors	⊠ windows	siding	Shed
lighting	pergola/trellis	painting unpainted r	nasonry
other			
ADDITION			
DEMOLITION/ENC	APSULATION		
SIGNAGE			

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED WORK: Please describe the proposed work in detail (Additional pages maybe attached).

The work consists of demolition/encapsulation of the existing rear wall and addition to the rear of the house. The existing masonry chimney will be encapsulated within the addition. The existing AC condenser unit will be relocated to the roof and covered by a screen, and will not be visible from the front of the house. The two story addition will be slab-on-grade, with no basement or accessible attic space, maintaining the same first and second floor levels as the existing house.

SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS:

Items listed below comprise the **minimum supporting materials** for BAR applications. Staff may request additional information during application review. Please refer to the relevant section of the *Design Guidelines* for further information on appropriate treatments.

Applicants must use the checklist below to ensure the application is complete. Include all information and material that are necessary to thoroughly describe the project. Incomplete applications will delay the docketing of the application for review. Pre-application meetings are required for all proposed additions. All applicants are encouraged to meet with staff prior to submission of a completed application.

Electronic copies of submission materials should be submitted whenever possible

Demolition/Encapsulation: All applicants requesting 25 square feet or more of demolition/ encapsulation must complete this section. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

N	1	л
1.0	1	-

- Survey plat showing the extent of the proposed demolition/encapsulation.
- Existing elevation drawings clearly showing all elements proposed for demolition/ encapsulation.
- Clear and labeled photographs of all elevations of the building if the entire structure is proposed to be demolished.
- Description of the reason for demolition/encapsulation.
- Description of the alternatives to demolition/encapsulation and why such alternatives are not considered feasible.

BAR Case # 2014-00427/00428

Additions & New Construction: Drawings must be to scale and should not exceed 11" x 17" unless approved by staff. All plans must be folded and collated into 12 complete 8 1/2" x 11" sets. Additional copies may be requested by staff for large-scale development projects or projects fronting Washington Street. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

- N/A Scaled survey plat showing dimensions of lot and location of existing building and other structures on the lot, location of proposed structure or addition, dimensions of existing structure(s), proposed addition or new construction, and all exterior, ground and roof mounted equipment.
- FAR & Open Space calculation form.
- Clear and labeled photographs of the site, surrounding properties and existing structures, if applicable.
- Existing elevations must be scaled and include dimensions.
- Proposed elevations must be scaled and include dimensions. Include the relationship to structures in plan and elevations.
- Materials and colors to be used must be specified and delineated on the drawings. Actual samples may be provided or required.
- Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows, doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.
- For development site plan projects, a model showing mass relationships to adjacent properties and structures.

Signs & Awnings: One sign per building under one square foot does not require BAR approval unless illuminated. All other signs including window signs require BAR approval. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

- N I	IA
1.1	IA
	11 1

Linear feet of building: Front:	Secondary front (if corner lot):	
Square feet of existing signs to remain:		
Photograph of building showing existing c	onditions.	

- Dimensioned drawings of proposed sign identifying materials, color, lettering style and text.
- Location of sign (show exact location on building including the height above sidewalk).
- Means of attachment (drawing or manufacturer's cut sheet of bracket if applicable).
- Description of lighting (if applicable). Include manufacturer's cut sheet for any new lighting fixtures and information detailing how it will be attached to the building's facade.

Alterations: Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

- N/A
- Clear and labeled photographs of the site, especially the area being impacted by the alterations, all sides of the building and any pertinent details.
- Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows, doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.
- Drawings accurately representing the changes to the proposed structure, including materials and overall dimensions. Drawings must be to scale.
 - An official survey plat showing the proposed locations of HVAC units, fences, and sheds.
 - Historic elevations or photographs should accompany any request to return a structure to an earlier appearance.

ALL APPLICATIONS: Please read and check that you have read and understand the following items:

- I have submitted a filing fee with this application. (Checks should be made payable to the City of X Alexandria. Please contact staff for assistance in determining the appropriate fee)
- \boxtimes I understand the notice requirements and will return a copy of the three respective notice forms to BAR staff at least five days prior to the hearing. If I am unsure to whom I should send notice I will contact Planning and Zoning staff for assistance in identifying adjacent parcels.
- \boxtimes I, the applicant, or an authorized representative will be present at the public hearing.
- \boxtimes I understand that any revisions to this initial application submission (including applications deferred for restudy) must be accompanied by the BAR Supplemental form and 12 sets of revised materials.

The undersigned hereby attests that all of the information herein provided including the site plan, building elevations, prospective drawings of the project, and written descriptive information are true. correct and accurate. The undersigned further understands that, should such information be found incorrect, any action taken by the Board based on such information may be invalidated. The undersigned also hereby grants the City of Alexandria permission to post placard notice as required by Article XI, Division A, Section 11-301(B) of the 1992 Alexandria City Zoning Ordinance, on the property which is the subject of this application. The undersigned also hereby authorizes the City staff and members of the BAR to inspect this site as necessary in the course of research and evaluating the application. The applicant, if other than the property owner, also attests that he/she has obtained permission from the property owner to make this application.

APPLICANT OR AUTHORIZED AGENT:

Signature: _______ Printed Name: STEPHEN W. KULINSKI

Date: 12/22/14-

2 8

OWNERSHIP AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT Use additional sheets if necessary

<u>1. Applicant</u>. State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the applicant, unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Address	Percent of Ownership
418 Gibbon Street Alexandria, VA 22314	100%
	418 Gibbon Street

2. Property. State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the property located at <u>418 Gibbon Street</u> (address), unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than ten percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership
1. Jennifer L Shoup	418 Gibbon Street Alexandria, VA 22314	100%
2.		
3.		

<u>3. Business or Financial Relationships</u>. Each person or entity listed above (1 and 2), with an ownership interest in the applicant or in the subject property is required to disclose **any** business or financial relationship, as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance, existing at the time of this application, or within the12-month period prior to the submission of this application with any member of the Alexandria City Council, Planning Commission, Board of Zoning Appeals or either Boards of Architectural Review.

Name of person or entity	Relationship as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance	Member of the Approving Body (i.e. City Council, Planning Commission, etc.)
1. N/A		
2.		
3.		
		1

NOTE: Business or financial relationships of the type described in Sec. 11-350 that arise after the filing of this application and before each public hearing must be disclosed prior to the public hearings.

As the applicant or the applicant's authorized agent, I hereby attest to the best of my ability that the information provided above is true and correct.

STEPHEN W KULINSKI

Signature

Date

Printed Name