*****DRAFT MINUTES***** Board of Architectural Review Thursday, March 16, 2023 7:00 p.m., City Council Chamber City Hall

Members Present:

Christine Sennott Andrew Scott Michael Lyons Bud Adams Theresa del Ninno James Spencer

Members Absent: Margaret Miller

Secretary: Bill Conkey, AIA, Historic Preservation Architect

Staff Present: Susan Hellman, Historic Preservation Principal Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. MINUTES

Consideration of minutes from the March 2, 2023 meeting.

BOARD ACTION:

On a motion by Mr. Lyons, and seconded by Ms. del Ninno, the Board of Architectural Review approved the March 2, 2023 meeting minutes, as submitted.

III. <u>CONSENT CALENDAR</u>

3 BAR#2023-00078 OHAD

Request for alterations at 418 S Washington Street Applicant: Tammy Mann, The Campagna Center Inc.

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Ms. Sennott, and seconded by Mr. Lyons, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2023-00078 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

REASON

The Board was comfortable with staff working with the applicant regarding the height of the mounting brackets.

SPEAKERS

Lisa McCabe Hobbs represented the applicant and answered questions.

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Spencer noted that he felt that the location of the proposed mounting brackets looked high and should be lowered somewhat. Ms. Hobbs explained that the brackets were located at floor level, but was willing to lower them with staff's direction.

4 BAR#2023-00055 OHAD

Request for alterations at 610 Montgomery Street Applicant: Light Properties LLC

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Ms. Sennott, and seconded by Ms. del Ninno, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2023-00055. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

NEW BUSINESS

5&6 BAR#2023-00058 OHAD

Request for alterations and addition at 320 S Fairfax Street Applicant: Sam and Ashley Chamberlain

BAR#2023-00059 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/encapsulation at 320 S Fairfax Street Applicant: Sam and Ashley Chamberlain

<u>BOARD ACTION</u>: On a motion by Ms. Sennott, and seconded by Mr. Scott, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR #2023-00058 and BAR #2023-00059 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of <u>6</u>-0.

REASON

The agreed with staff's recommendation.

SPEAKERS

Mr. Patrick Camus, the project architect, was available to answer any questions.

DISCUSSION:

Ms. del Nino complemented the project. There was no further discussion.

7&8 BAR#2023-00074 OHAD

Request for alterations and addition at 333 Green Street Applicant: Paul O'Sullivan

BAR#2023-00083 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/encapsulation at 333 Green Applicant: Paul O'Sullivan

BOARD ACTION: By unanimous consent, the Board of Architectural Review accepted the request for the deferral of BAR #2023-00074 and BAR #2023-00083.

REASON

The Board felt that the proposed addition was too tall and did not harmonize with the existing

structure.

SPEAKERS

Paul O'Sullivan, architect/owner, presented the project and was available for questions.

Teft Smith, 870 S. Royal St., was concerned with the proposed design and supported the request for deferral.

Elaine Johnston, 831 S. Fairfax St., spoke in opposition and stated that the addition will deter from the historic surrounding.

Gail Rothrock, Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in opposition and stated that the addition was incompatible.

Yvonne Callahan, 735 S. Lee St., spoke in opposition and stated that addition is too tall and detracts from original portion.

Steve Milone, Old Town Civic Association, spoke in opposition and stated that that addition isn't compatible with section 10-105 of the zoning ordinance.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Spencer requested verification that Zoning had approved the proposal.

Mr. Scott noted that the proposed height is too tall and stated that modern additions could be effective. He also questioned if the existing and proposed addition could become harmonious.

Mr. Adams agreed with previous comments and the original portion should stand as dominant feature. He also stated that shading devices are not appropriate.

Ms. del Ninno stated that the massing should be pushed back, and the addition should be integrated into the other additions.

Ms. Sennott would like an additional study.

Mr. Spencer stated that the entire addition should be holistic, and the proposed addition detracts from the original portion of the house.

9&10 BAR#2023-00075 OHAD

Request for alterations and addition at 104 Prince Street Applicant: Keith Harmon

BAR#2023-00076 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/encapsulation at 104 Prince Street Applicant: Keith Harmon

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Mr. Scott, and seconded by Ms. Sennott, the Board of Architectural voted to approve BAR #2023-00075 and BAR #2023-00076 as amended. The motion

carried on a vote of 6-0.

REASON

The Board felt that the proposed railing should be less visible from the street.

SPEAKERS

Keith Harmon gave a brief introduction and was available to answer questions. He explained that the existing roof hatch is unsafe and does not meet Code.

Gail Rothrock, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, recommended a deferral for further study, noting that this is an iconic block in Old Town.

David Olinger stated that this is a tourist block and that visibility of the deck from Prince and Union streets would detract from the streetscape.

Yvonne Callahan noted that this is the most photographed street in Old Town and recommended a mock up to better show the railing's potential visibility. She recommended moving it back and constructing it with a material other than cable, like a widow's walk.

Steve Milone, representing Old Town Civic Association, requested denying or deferring the case. He said that this is already a tall house and the deck would make it taller. He recommended a roof hatch instead of a stair enclosure.

Ray Novitske, project architect, noted that the cable railing, like that on a nearby property on South Union Street, would make the railing less visible and noticeable. He explained that the stair enclosure would not be visible from a public right of way.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Lyons did not think that tourist photographs were an issue. Adding a roof deck to this house would not affect the quaintness of the street. He supported the application.

Mr. Adams suggested that the applicant work with staff on whether or not to use a hatch. He noted that this is not an old building.

Ms. Sennott felt that the cable railing was a nice solution to minimize the appearance; it would not obscure an historic roofline. She suggested working with staff on other options, such as a hatch or moving the railing.

Mr. Scott stated that he would support moving the railing back from the front and sides. He recommended that the applicant work with staff to do so.

Ms. del Ninno asked if the roof could structurally support a roof deck. She also suggested bringing the railing back from the front of the house and noted that black cable rail disappears from view. She preferred at hatch to a stair.

Mr. Spencer recommended that the applicant create a mock up for staff, so that staff can determine how far back to move the railing. He advised staff to stand directly across the street and identify the location where only half of the railing would be visible. He also directed staff to work with the applicant to explore alternates to the stair enclosure and ensure that all changes meet with zoning requirements.

WITHDRAWN

11&12 BAR#2023-00011 OHAD

Request for alterations and addition at 631 N Columbus Street Applicant: Sherri Crane

BAR#2023-00012 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/encapsulation at 631 N Columbus Street Applicant: Sherri Crane

ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review adjourned at 8:50 pm.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR#2023-00066 OHAD Request for window replacements at 201 Gibbon Street Applicant: Nick Kalivretenos c/o The Window Man

BAR#2023-00072 100YOB Request for window replacements at 1020 Duke Street Applicant: Marc Greenberg

BAR#2023-00084 OHAD Request for window replacements at 1318 Prince Street Applicant: Stacey Kerans

BAR#2023-00086 OHAD Request for roof re-shingling at 511 S St Asaph Street Applicant: Sun Design Remodeling Specialists

BAR#2023-00087 OHAD Request for siding replacement at 400 Wolfe Street Applicant: Elizabeth Gorman

BAR#2023-00088 OHAD Request for roof replacement at 207 Wolfe Street Applicant: Rachel Fitzmaurice

BAR#2023-00089 OHAD Request for window and door replacements at 28 Alexander Street Applicant: Joe and Sara Baroudi

BAR#2023-00092 PG Request for window frame replacement and front steps replacement at 708 N Patrick Street Applicant: Alexandra Zolnowski

BAR#2023-00093 OHAD

Request for deck floorboards replacement at 602 Battery Place Applicant: Rory McCall

BAR#2023-00094 OHAD Request for signage at 806 King Street Applicant: Zen Press LLC/Ju Ann Wong

BAR#2023-00095 OHAD Request for siding replacement at 415 S Lee Street Applicant: McEneamey Property Management

BAR#2023-00096 OHAD Request for mortar replacement at 305 Duke Street Applicant: Todd Pickell, Vaughan Restoration Masonry

BAR#2023-00097 OHAD Request for mortar replacement at 117 S Alfred Street Applicant: Peter Sumner

BAR#2023-00099 OHAD Request for exterior light replacements at 314 Commerce Street Applicant: John and Emily Galer