ISSUE:	Permit to Demolish/Capsulate (partial), Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations, and Waiver of Fence Height
APPLICANT:	Leslie and William Golden
LOCATION:	Old and Historic Alexandria District 426 South Lee Street
ZONE:	RM/Residential Townhouse Zone

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish/Capsulate (partial), Certificate of Appropriateness and Waiver of Fence Height with the condition that the pergola remain 80 percent open and uncovered by any material other than plantings.

GENERAL NOTES TO THE APPLICANT

- 1. APPEAL OF DECISION: In accordance with the Zoning Ordinance, if the Board of Architectural Review denies or approves an application in whole or in part, the applicant or opponent may appeal the Board's decision to City Council on or before 14 days after the decision of the Board.
- 2. COMPLIANCE WITH BAR POLICIES: All materials must comply with the BAR's adopted policies unless otherwise specifically approved.
- 3. BUILDING PERMITS: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Department of Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-746-4200 for further information.
- 4. ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND PERMITS TO DEMOLISH: Applicants must obtain a copy of the Certificate of Appropriateness or Permit to Demolish PRIOR to applying for a building permit. Contact BAR Staff, Room 2100, City Hall, 703-746-3833, or preservation@alexandriava.gov for further information.
- 5. EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B), 10-206(B) and 10-307 of the Zoning Ordinance, any Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.
- HISTORIC PROPERTY TAX CREDITS: Applicants performing extensive, certified rehabilitations of historic properties may separately be eligible for state and/or federal tax credits. Consult with the <u>Virginia</u> <u>Department of Historic Resources (VDHR)</u> prior to initiating any work to determine whether the proposed project may qualify for such credits.

Docket #16 & 17 BAR2022-00059 & 2022-00060 Old and Historic Alexandria District March 16, 2022



Note: Staff coupled the applications for a Permit to Demolish (BAR2022-00060) and Certificate of Appropriateness (BAR2022-0059) for clarity and brevity. The Permit to Demolish requires a roll call vote.

I. <u>APPLICANT'S PROPOSAL</u>

The applicant requests a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate (partial) and Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a gate with brick piers and a pergola, at **426 South Lee Street**. The proposal requires partial demolition of the east garden wall (40 square feet) to accommodate the wood gate and brick piers. The bricks removed during demolition will be salvaged and used for the new piers. The proposed wood pergola and lattice panels will be 9'-8" in height and requires a waiver of fence height.

Site context

The east (rear) elevation is minimally visible from S. Union Street due to the open space at Windmill Hill Park.

II. <u>HISTORY</u>

The four-bay, two-story Italianate style house consists of a wood clapboard siding main block with a one-story enclosed porch and brick addition at the rear. The single-family house was constructed **between 1877**, when the G.M. Hopkins Atlas of Alexandria, VA shows this parcel vacant, **and 1902**, when it appears on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. Based on Sanborn Map research a one-story structure was located on the rear (east) property line until at least 1931. It was demolished by 1941 and the garden wall was constructed after its removal.

Previous BAR Approvals

- 1953: BAR approved wood siding.
- 1960: BAR approved aluminum siding on the south wall.
- 1988: BAR approved enclosure of porch and a rear (brick) addition.
- 3/4/2020: BAR approved alterations (windows replacement). (BAR2020-00045/46)
- 11/3/2021: BAR approved alterations (painting unpainted masonry) (BAR2021-00560)

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>

Permit to Demolish/Capsulate

In considering a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, §10-105(B), which relate only to the subject property and not to neighboring properties. The Board has purview of the proposed demolition/capsulation regardless of visibility.

Standard	Description of Standard	Standard Met?
(1)	Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical	No
	interest that its moving, removing, capsulating or razing would	
	be to the detriment of the public interest?	

(2)	Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into a historic shrine?	No
(3)	Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?	No
(4)	Would retention of the building or structure help preserve the memorial character of the George Washington Memorial Parkway?	N/A
(5)	Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?	No
(6)	Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?	No

The analysis of the standards indicated above relates only to the proposed partial demolition/capsulation of the rear brick garden wall, not the residential building.

In the opinion of staff, none of the criteria for demolition and capsulation are met and the Permit to Demolish/Capsulate should be granted. The proposed amount of demolition is limited to 40 square feet of the east garden wall. The brick wall is minimally visible, and not of unusual or uncommon design. The removed bricks will be salvaged and used to construct brick piers for the new gate opening in the same location.

Certificate of Appropriateness

Staff has not objection to the proposed alterations. The *Design Guidelines* states that fences, garden walls, and gates are an important visual feature of the historic districts. Additionally, garden walls provide a sense of privacy and enclosure for property owners. The proposed modifications to the garden wall and installation of the new painted wood gate are appropriate in material, design and scale to the period and character of the property it surrounds.

Section [7-202 (A)(5)] of the Zoning Ordinance permits arbors, trellises and pergolas when located in a required yard and placed so as not to obstruct light and ventilation. It also requires the pergola to remain 80% percent open and uncovered by any material other than plantings. The proposed pergola is at least 80% percent open and therefore it complies with zoning requirements. The design of the pergola is a traditional design with Doric columns that will enhance the rear yard space while not detracting from the early property on the site. The

installation of lattice panels adjacent to the garden wall is appropriate for a rear yard. Based on the submitted application, the fixed lattice panels will adhere to the ground and will not affect the existing garden wall. The proposed pergola and lattice panels will be constructed of wood, which is an appropriate material.

A waiver of fence height is required because portions of the pergola is attached to the garden wall, increasing the height of the existing wall beyond the permitted six feet. The waiver should be granted because the proposed alterations are architecturally appropriate and consistent with the character of the district. Additionally, the proposed alterations will minimally be visible from the public right-of-way.

Staff believes that the proposed alterations are architecturally appropriate for the site and recommends approval with the condition noted above.

STAFF

Amirah Lane, Historic Preservation Planner, Planning & Zoning Tony LaColla, AICP, Land Use Services Division Chief, Planning & Zoning

IV. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C- code requirement R- recommendation S- suggestion F- finding

Zoning

- F-1 A small portion of the proposed gate and brick piers and the majority of the proposed trellis attached to the existing brick wall exceed 6 feet in height. Per section 7-202(D), the fence height restrictions may be waived or modified by the Board of Architectural Review where the board finds that a proposed fence would be architecturally appropriate and consistent with the character of the district.
- F-2 If the BAR waives the restriction for fence heights, the proposed fence, gate, and trellis will comply with zoning.
- F-3 A portion of the rear pergola exceeds 10 feet in height; however, the south side yard does not have any side yard setback requirements, therefore, the pergola complies with zoning.

Code Administration

No Code comments.

Transportation and Environmental Services

- R-1 The building permit must be approved and issued prior to the issuance of any permit for demolition if a separate demolition permit is required. (T&ES)
- R-2 Applicant shall be responsible for repairs to the adjacent city right-of-way if damaged during construction activity. (T&ES)

- R-3 No permanent structure may be constructed over any existing private and/or public utility easements. It is the responsibility of the applicant to identify any and all existing easements on the plan. (T&ES)
- F-1 Previously reviewed under [BAR2020-00045 & 00046] (T&ES)
- F-2 After a review of the information provided, an approved grading plan is not required at this time. Please note that if any changes are made to the plan it is suggested that T&ES be included in the review. (T&ES)
- F-3 If the alley located at the rear of the parcel is to be used at any point of the construction process the following will be required:
 <u>For a Public Alley -</u> The applicant shall contact T&ES, Construction Permitting & Inspections at (703) 746-4035 to discuss any permits and accommodation requirements that will be required.

<u>For a Private Alley</u> - The applicant must provide proof, in the form of an affidavit at a minimum, from the owner of the alley granting permission of use. (T&ES)

- C-1 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Solid Waste Control, Title 5, Chapter 1, which sets forth the requirements for the recycling of materials (Sec. 5-1-99). (T&ES)
- C-2 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Noise Control Code, Title 11, Chapter 5, which sets the maximum permissible noise level as measured at the property line. (T&ES)
- C-3 Roof, surface and sub-surface drains be connected to the public storm sewer system, if available, by continuous underground pipe. Where storm sewer is not available applicant must provide a design to mitigate impact of stormwater drainage onto adjacent properties and to the satisfaction of the Director of Transportation & Environmental Services. (Sec.5-6-224) (T&ES)
- C-4 All secondary utilities serving this site shall be placed underground. (Sec. 5-3-3) (T&ES)
- C-5 Any work within the right-of-way requires a separate permit from T&ES. (Sec. 5-2) (T&ES)
- C-6 All improvements to the city right-of-way such as curbing, sidewalk, driveway aprons, etc. must be city standard design. (Sec. 5-2-1) (T&ES)

Alexandria Archaeology

No archaeology oversight necessary for this undertaking.

V. <u>ATTACHMENTS</u>

- 1 Application Materials
- 2 Supplemental Materials

BA	AR Case #
ADDRESS OF PROJECT: 426 5 LEE ST	
DISTRICT: XOId & Historic Alexandria Darker - Gray 1	00 Year Old Building
TAX MAP AND PARCEL: 075.03-08-26	_ZONING:
APPLICATION FOR: (Please check all that apply)	
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS	
PERMIT TO MOVE, REMOVE, ENCAPSULATE OR DEMOLISH (Required if more than 25 square feet of a structure is to be demolished/impacted	ł d)
WAIVER OF VISION CLEARANCE REQUIREMENT and/or YAR CLEARANCE AREA (Section 7-802, Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)	D REQUIREMENTS IN A VISION
WAIVER OF ROOFTOP HVAC SCREENING REQUIREMENT (Section 6-403(B)(3), Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)	
Applicant: X Property Owner Dusiness (Please provide busine	iss name & contact person)
Name: LEGHE S WILLIAM GOLDEN	
Address 426 5 LEE ST	
City: ALEXANDELA State VA Zip 22:	314
	als equail.com
Authorized Agent (if applicable): Attorney	
Name: LYNNETTE CAMUS	Phone: 703 989 3777
E-mail: studiocamus@comcast.n.	et
Legal Property Owner:	
Name: LESLIE & WILLIAM GOLDEN	1
Address: 426 5 LEE ST	
City ALEXANDELA State: VA Zip: 223	314
Phone: E-mail: leslieseale	
Yes No Is there an historic preservation easement on this prop Yes No If yes, has the easement holder agreed to the proposed Yes No Is there a homeowner's association for this property? Yes No If yes, has the homeowner's association approved the	d alterations?

If you answered yes to any of the above, please attach a copy of the letter approving the project.

BAR Case #

NATURE OF PROPOSED WORK: Please check all that apply

	NEW CONSTRUCTION EXTERIOR ALTERATION awning doors lighting	DN TION: Please check all that app fence, gate or garden wall windows pergola/trellis		☐ shutters ☐ shed
	Demolition/Encapsi SIGNAGE	JLATION GAPDEN	NALL	
be att	achedi	GATE AND BE	APDEN WALL	

SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS:

Items listed below comprise the **minimum supporting materials** for BAR applications. Staff may request additional information during application review. Please refer to the relevant section of the *Design Guidelines* for further information on appropriate treatments.

Applicants must use the checklist below to ensure the application is complete. Include all information and material that are necessary to thoroughly describe the project. Incomplete applications will delay the docketing of the application for review. Pre-application meetings are required for all proposed additions. All applicants are encouraged to meet with staff prior to submission of a completed application.

Demolition/Encapsulation : All applicants requesting 25 square feet or more of demolition/encapsulation must complete this section. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

1	N//
Π	Γ
П	Ē
	Ē

Survey plat showing the extent of the proposed demolition/encapsulation.

Existing elevation drawings clearly showing all elements proposed for demolition/encapsulation.

Clear and labeled photographs of all elevations of the building if the entire structure is proposed to be demolished.

Description of the reason for demolition/encapsulation.

Description of the alternatives to demolition/encapsulation and why such alternatives are not considered feasible.

BAR Case

Additions & New Construction: Drawings must be to scale and should not exceed 11" x 17" unless approved by staff. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

╡	N/A	Scaled survey plat showing dimensions of lot and location of existing building and other structures on the lot, location of proposed structure or addition, dimensions of existing structure(s), proposed addition or new construction, and all exterior, ground and roof mounted
Н		equipment. FAR & Open Space calculation form.
Φ		Clear and labeled photographs of the site, surrounding properties and existing structures, if applicable.
由		Existing elevations must be scaled and include dimensions.
Ψ		Proposed elevations must be scaled and include dimensions. Include the relationship to adjacent structures in plan and elevations.
φ		Materials and colors to be used must be specified and delineated on the drawings. Actual samples may be provided or required.
ф		Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows
ф		doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls. For development site plan projects, a model showing mass relationships to adjacent properties and structures.

Signs & Awnings: One sign per building under one square foot does not require BAR approval unless illuminated. All other signs including window signs require BAR approval. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

fixtures and information detailing how it will be attached to the building's facade.

Alterations: Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

	N/A	
φ		Clear and labeled photographs of the site, especially the area being impacted by the alterations,
		all sides of the building and any pertinent details.
Φ		Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows,
1		doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.
\square		Drawings accurately representing the changes to the proposed structure, including materials and
		overall dimensions. Drawings must be to scale.
		An official survey plat showing the proposed locations of HVAC units, fences, and sheds
		Historic elevations or photographs should accompany any request to return a structure to an
۱.		earlier appearance

earlier appearance.

....

BAR Case

ALL APPLICATIONS: Please read and check that you have read and understand the following items:

- I have submitted a filing fee with this application. (Checks should be made payable to the City of Alexandria. Please contact staff for assistance in determining the appropriate fee.)
- I understand the notice requirements and will return a copy of the three respective notice forms to BAR staff at least five days prior to the hearing. If I am unsure to whom I should send notice I will contact Planning and Zoning staff for assistance in identifying adjacent parcels.
- I, the applicant, or an authorized representative will be present at the public hearing.
- I understand that any revisions to this initial application submission (including applications deferred for restudy) must be accompanied by the BAR Supplemental form and revised materials.

The undersigned hereby attests that all of the information herein provided including the site plan, building elevations, prospective drawings of the project, and written descriptive information are true, correct and accurate. The undersigned further understands that, should such information be found incorrect, any action taken by the Board based on such information may be invalidated. The undersigned also hereby grants the City of Alexandria permission to post placard notice as required by Article XI, Division A, Section 11-301(B) of the 1992 Alexandria City Zoning Ordinance, on the property which is the subject of this application. The undersigned also hereby authorizes the City staff and members of the BAR to inspect this site as necessary in the course of research and evaluating the application. The applicant, if other than the property owner, also attests that he/she has obtained permission from the property owner to make this application.

APPLICANT OR AUTHORIZED AGENT:

Signature:	ynormus
Printed Name	LYNNETTE CAMUS
Date: 10	FEB 22

OWNERSHIP AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT Use additional sheets if necessary

<u>1. Applicant.</u> State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the applicant, unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than three percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership
1. LESLIE SWILLIAM GOLDEN	4265 LEEST	100%
2.		
3.		

2. <u>Property.</u> State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the property located at <u>426 S LEE ST</u> (address), unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than three percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership	
1. LESLIE SWILLIAM GOLDEN	426 SLEE ST	100%	
2.			
3.			

3. <u>Business or Financial Relationships.</u> Each person or entity listed above (1 and 2), with an ownership interest in the applicant or in the subject property is required to disclose **any** business or financial relationship, as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance, existing at the time of this application, or within the12-month period prior to the submission of this application with any member of the Alexandria City Council, Planning Commission, Board of Zoning Appeals or either Boards of Architectural Review.

Name of person or entity	Relationship as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance	Member of the Approving Body (i.e. City Council, Planning Commission, etc.)
1.		
2.		
3.		

NOTE: Business or financial relationships of the type described in Sec. 11-350 that arise after the filing of this application and before each public hearing must be disclosed prior to the public hearings.

As the applicant or the applicant's authorized agent, I hereby attest to the best of my ability that the information provided above is true and correct.

10 FEB 22 Date rinted Name



View from Windmill Hill Park Play Equipment Area



View from Sidewalk/Path Leading into Wilkes Street Tunnel



GOLDEN RESIDEN 426 South Lee Street Alexan



Rear Brick Garden Wall from Private Alley

		SHEET
ICE	DATE 10 Feb 22	
ndria VA	SCALE No Scale	L5











