ISSUE:	Permit to Demolish (after the fact) and Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations (after the fact)
APPLICANT:	Old Town #1 LLC
LOCATION:	Old and Historic Alexandria District 111 South Alfred Street
ZONE:	CD/Commercial Downtown

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Board deny the request for after the fact approval of the Permit to Demolish for the removal of the existing siding and Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of wood grained patterned fiber cement siding on the east and south elevations of the property at 111 South Alfred Street. In order to remedy these actions staff recommends the following:

- 1. The BAR endorses the Department's direction to the applicant to remedy the removal of the existing siding and installation of fiber cement siding on the east elevation by removing the fiber cement siding and replacing it with wood siding in a size and profile similar to the previously removed siding.
- 2. The BAR endorses the Department's direction to the applicant to remedy the removal of the existing siding and installation of fiber cement siding on the south elevation by removing the fiber cement siding and having new siding milled and planed from old growth wood to match the original historic siding in dimension and style with final details to be approved by staff.

GENERAL NOTES TO THE APPLICANT

- 1. APPEAL OF DECISION: In accordance with the Zoning Ordinance, if the Board of Architectural Review denies or approves an application in whole or in part, the applicant or opponent may appeal the Board's decision to City Council on or before 14 days after the decision of the Board.
- 2. COMPLIANCE WITH BAR POLICIES: All materials must comply with the BAR's adopted policies unless otherwise specifically approved.
- 3. BUILDING PERMITS: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Department of Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-746-4200 for further information.
- 4. ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND PERMITS TO DEMOLISH: Applicants must obtain a copy of the Certificate of Appropriateness or Permit to Demolish PRIOR to applying for a building permit. Contact BAR Staff, Room 2100, City Hall, 703-746-3833, or preservation@alexandriava.gov for further information.
- EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B), 10-206(B) and 10-307 of the Zoning Ordinance, any Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.
- HISTORIC PROPERTY TAX CREDITS: Applicants performing extensive, certified rehabilitations of historic properties may separately be eligible for state and/or federal tax credits. Consult with the <u>Virginia</u> <u>Department of Historic Resources (VDHR)</u> prior to initiating any work to determine whether the proposed project may qualify for such credits.



I. <u>APPLICANT'S PROPOSAL</u>

The applicant is requesting after the fact approval for the demolition of the existing siding on the east and south elevations and a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of fiber cement siding with a wood grain texture on each of these elevations.

On October 18, 2021, staff received a comment via the Alex 311 portal regarding the removal of existing siding at 111 South Alfred Street. A Zoning Inspector visited the property at that time and found that most of the existing siding had been removed from the east elevation and a portion of the siding had been removed from the south elevation. There were no contractors on site at the time of the site visit. After verifying that the proper approvals had not been granted, the inspector issued a Stop Work order regarding all work on the exterior of the property. The order was affixed to the front door of the property in plain view of the adjacent sidewalk (Figure 1).



Figure 1: East elevation after removal of existing siding with Stop Work order affixed to the entry door

On October 21, 2021, staff was made aware of additional work that had been performed on the exterior of the property. Upon visiting the site, it was determined that the remainder of the existing siding had been removed and fiber cement siding with a wood grain texture had been installed on the east and south elevations. A violation was issued to the property owner on October 25, 2021.

On November 5, 2021, staff received an application for administrative approval for the installation of the fiber cement siding that was completed on the subject property. Staff notified the applicant that this work could not be approved administratively and that they would need to apply for a Board review of the completed work. The applicant is now requesting after the fact approval for the demolition of the existing siding and a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of the fiber cement siding with a wood grain texture. The south and east elevations of the property are visible from the adjacent sidewalk on South Alfred Street.

II. <u>HISTORY</u>

111 South Alfred Street is a three bay two story frame structure located on the middle of the west side of the 100 block of South Alfred Street. According to *Historic Alexandria Virginia Street by Street* by Ethelyn Cox, 111 South Alfred Street is "clapboard, 2 stories, gable roof, probably mid 19th century, Victorianized." The east elevation of the structure features a decorative cornice with brackets and dentil molding, characteristic of this modification. The building appears on the 1877 Hopkins Map with a smaller footprint than the current structure.

Previous BAR Approvals:

September 9, 1959: BAR Approval of installation of display window

Permit # 29593, 1972 (Figure 2): Window modifications and **replacement of existing siding on the east elevation with new 8'' Masonite siding**

BAR #94-156, 1994: **Replacement of Masonite siding on the east elevation with redwood siding** and install a standing seam metal roof.

BAR #2002-00227: Commercial signage

BAR #2003-00061: Commercial signage

BAR #2005- 00040: Awning over window

BAR #2006-00294: Commercial signage



Figure 2: Permit #29593, replacement of existing siding with Masonite siding

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>

As noted above, staff first became aware of the work on the exterior of the property on October 18, 2021, when staff visited the site and issued a Stop Work Order for all work on the exterior of the property. At that time, most of the siding had been removed from the east elevation and a portion of the siding on the south elevation had been removed (Figure 3). The siding which was removed had different profiles on the east elevation and the south elevation. The siding on the east elevation included a bead at the bottom of each board, where the siding on the south elevation was a more simple beveled siding. This type of hierarchy is not uncommon on buildings in the historic district. BLDC 2021-00225 was issued to the property owner on June 4, 2021, this permit included the reconfiguration of interior spaces throughout the property but did not include any reference to work on the building exterior. Approval of this permit specifically indicates that it is for interior work only and that "Existing main façade and exterior walls to remain as is (no alterations)."



Figure 3: Condition of siding on October 18, 2021, at time of Stop Work Order

The Stop Work Order directs the owner to contact Historic Preservation to determine an appropriate path to address work that has been completed without the proper approvals. Staff did not immediately receive correspondence from the applicant. On October 21, 2021, it was brought to the attention of staff that work had continued on the property, staff observed that the remainder of the siding had been removed and that fiber cement siding with a wood grain pattern had been installed on the east and south elevations (Figure 4). A violation was issued to the property owner on October 25, 2021. Per Section 11-207 of the City of Alexandria Zoning Ordinance, fines in the amount of \$2,000 have been associated with this violation.



Figure 4: View of 111 S Alfred after removal of existing siding and installation of fiber cement siding

The *Design Guidelines* state "Siding is one of the principal character defining elements of a building." They further state, "A central tenet of the philosophy of historic preservation is that original historic materials should be retained and repaired rather than replaced. An informed and careful analysis of the existing condition should be made before any decision to replace historic materials is made." The BAR Policies for Administrative Approval outlines the steps that are to be taken when considering the replacement of existing siding:

Siding and trim	For buildings or additions constructed prior to 1932, the applicant must, working with staff, undertake the following steps:
	• If multiple layers of siding exist, remove at least one test patch a minimum size of 2 feet by 2 feet on each elevation in order to reveal the first layer of siding
	 BAR staff must visit the site to determine whether any extant historic siding can be retained and be reasonably repaired and patched
	• If staff finds that the existing historic siding is beyond reasonable repair, new siding must match the profile, exposure and design of the original. If historic siding is not present, historically appropriate wood siding must be used.

The goal of both of these documents is to prevent the loss of potentially historic material from structures in the historic district. On numerous occasions, BAR staff has worked with property owners to identify historic siding that can be removed from the building to allow for repairs to the underlying structure and the installation of weatherproofing components. Once this work is completed, the historic siding can be repaired and reinstalled, creating a stable, historic building that retains its historic material. In this case, the applicant did not notify staff prior to the removal of the existing siding, hence there was no opportunity to determine the age or condition of the siding. On the east elevation, staff has documentation of the replacement of the original siding in 1972 with Masonite siding and the replacement of that siding on the south elevation. From photographs of the building prior to the removal of the siding and from when the Stop Work order was issued, it is clear that the siding on this elevation was older than the siding on the east elevation but it is impossible to make a determination regarding its overall condition or age, as required by the Administrative Approval Policy.

The BAR's determination for Permit to Demolish must consider the six criteria regarding demolition. For reference, staff has included the criteria for a Permit to Demolish with a brief discussion with respect to this case.

Standard	Description of Standard	Standard Met?
(1)	Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical interest that its moving, removing, capsulating or razing would be to the detriment of the public interest?	Yes, the removal of historic siding, the only remaining historic fabric extant on the exterior visible from the public way, is a detriment to the public interest as it represents the unnecessary loss of authentic material that contributes to the overall character and integrity of the historic district.
(2)	Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into a historic shrine?	No
(3)	Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?	Yes, the historic siding on the south elevation was plainly visible from the public way and surviving mid-19th- century historic clapboards are extremely unique in Alexandria and feature old- growth wood. It will require finding reclaimed old-growth lumber as well as specialized milling tools and processes to recreate the mid-19th-c. siding.

In considering a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, §10-105(B), which relate only to the subject property and not to neighboring properties. The Board has purview of the proposed demolition regardless of visibility.

(4)	Would retention of the building or structure help preserve the memorial character of the George Washington Memorial Parkway?	N/A
(5)	Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?	Yes, Alexandria is defined in large part by its historic resources and character, creating an authentic setting for residents and visitors alike. While the subject building itself may not attract visitors, it contributes to the overall character of the historic district. The historic district is multi-faceted and attracts a range of people for different reasons. When circumstances such as this arise where there has been a removal of historic material appropriate repairs and replacement materials are encouraged; however, the unnecessary removal of historic fabric at individual properties threatens the overall integrity of the historic districts. Alexandria prides itself on being an authentic place and preventing inappropriate alterations without approval is at the heart of maintaining its authenticity.
(6)	Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?	Yes, retention of the original historic siding contributes to the character of this neighborhood with its mid-19th-c. collection of frame dwellings. In addition, the structure is two properties south of the Friendship Firehouse, a popular tourist destination. The loss of authentic historic fabric in this proximity to the firehouse detracts from the character of that historic building.

The challenge for the BAR at this time is that once historic fabric has been demolished without approval, it is difficult, if not impossible, to restore the original material. In the case of the siding, while the original material is no longer existing, it is possible to return this elevation to its prior condition by acquiring old-growth reclaimed wood and having it milled and planed to match the original material.

The BAR Policies for Administrative Approval require that on buildings constructed before 1932, if staff finds that the existing siding is beyond reasonable repair, new siding must be wood and must match the existing siding in profile, exposure, and design. As noted above, the structure was originally built prior to 1877, making it an early building. Upon removal of the existing siding, the applicant installed fiber cement siding with a wood grain texture on both elevations directly adjacent to the public right of way. The use of this type of siding cannot be approved administratively and the Board has consistently not allowed its use on buildings that are visible from a public right of way in the OHAD.

Staff recommends that the Board deny the request for after the fact approval of the Permit to Demolish for the removal of the existing siding and Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of wood grained patterned fiber cement siding on the east and south elevations of the property at 111 South Alfred Street.

Staff has found documentary evidence that the original siding on the east elevation was previously removed and that the siding on this elevation that was removed by the applicant dates from 1994. Since the siding that was removed on the east elevation was not historic, staff recommends that the BAR endorse the Department's direction to the applicant to remedy the removal of the existing siding and installation of fiber cement siding on the east elevation by removing the fiber cement siding and replacing it with wood siding in a size and profile similar to the previously removed siding.

Lacking any ability to determine the age of the siding that was removed on the south elevation, staff is treating this area as if the removed siding was original to the structure and recommends that the BAR endorse the Department's direction to the applicant to remedy the removal of the existing siding and installation of fiber cement siding on the south elevation by removing the fiber cement siding and having new siding milled and planed from old growth wood to match the original historic siding in dimension and style with final details to be approved by staff.

<u>STAFF</u>

Bill Conkey, AIA, Historic Preservation Architect, Planning & Zoning Tony LaColla, AICP, Land Use Services Division Chief, Planning & Zoning

IV. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C- code requirement R- recommendation S- suggestion F- finding

<u>Zoning</u>

F-1 The applicant is requesting after-the-fact approval from the BAR for new siding. The new siding complies with zoning.

Code Administration

F-1 A building permit and plan review are required

Transportation and Environmental Services

- F-1 The building permit must be approved and issued prior to the issuance of any permit for demolition, if a separate demolition permit is required. (T&ES)
- F-2 Applicant shall be responsible for repairs to the adjacent city right-of-way if damaged during construction activity. (T&ES)
- F-3 No permanent structure may be constructed over any existing private and/or public utility easements. It is the responsibility of the applicant to identify any and all existing easements on the plan. (T&ES)
- F-4 After review of the information provided, an approved grading plan is not required at this time. Please note that if any changes are made to the plan it is suggested that T&ES be included in the review. (T&ES)
- F-5 If the alley located at the rear of the parcel is to be used at any point of the construction process the following will be required:

For a Public Alley - The applicant shall contact T&ES, Construction Permitting & Inspections at (703) 746-4035 to discuss any permits and accommodation requirements that will be required.

For a Private Alley - The applicant must provide proof, in the form of an affidavit at a minimum, from owner of the alley granting permission of use. (T&ES)

- C-1 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Solid Waste Control, Title 5, Chapter 1, which sets forth the requirements for the recycling of materials (Sec. 5-1-99). (T&ES)
- C-2 The applicant shall comply with the City of Alexandria's Noise Control Code, Title 11, Chapter 5, which sets the maximum permissible noise level as measured at the property line. (T&ES)
- C-3 Roof, surface and sub-surface drains be connected to the public storm sewer system, if available, by continuous underground pipe. Where storm sewer is not available applicant must provide a design to mitigate impact of stormwater drainage onto adjacent properties and to the satisfaction of the Director of Transportation & Environmental Services. (Sec.5-6-224) (T&ES)
- C-4 All secondary utilities serving this site shall be placed underground. (Sec. 5-3-3) (T&ES)
- C-5 Any work within the right-of-way requires a separate permit from T&ES. (Sec. 5-2) (T&ES)
- C-6 All improvements to the city right-of-way such as curbing, sidewalk, driveway aprons, etc. must be city standard design. (Sec. 5-2-1) (T&ES)

Alexandria Archaeology

F-1 No archaeological oversight necessary for this undertaking

v. **ATTACHMENTS**

1 – Application Materials 2 – Supplemental Materials

	BAR Case #		
ADDRESS OF PROJECT: <u>111 S. Alfred St.</u>			
DISTRICT: Old & Historic Alexandria \Box Parker – Gray TAX MAP AND PARCEL: $074.01-06-12$	☐ 100 Year Old Building ZONING:		
APPLICATION FOR: (Please check all that apply)			
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS			
PERMIT TO MOVE, REMOVE, ENCAPSULATE OR DEMO (Required if more than 25 square feet of a structure is to be demolished/im			
WAIVER OF VISION CLEARANCE REQUIREMENT and/or CLEARANCE AREA (Section 7-802, Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordina			
WAIVER OF ROOFTOP HVAC SCREENING REQUIREME (Section 6-403(B)(3), Alexandria 1992 Zoning Ordinance)	NT		
Applicant: Property Owner Image: Business (Please provide business name & contact person) Name: Step 1 Real Estate Services / Chris Smith Address: PO Box 10651			
City: Burke State: VA Zip: 2	22009		
	ith@step1enter.com		
Authorized Agent (if applicable): Attorney	ct 🗌		
Name:	Phone:		
E-mail:			
Legal Property Owner: _{Name:} Old Town #1 LLC			
Address: 1616 Camden Rd, Suite 210	_		
City State Zip	28203		
Phone: 703-206-6214 E-mail: serena.brown@transv	wetern.com		
Yes X No Is there an historic preservation easement on this Yes X No Is there an historic preservation easement on this Yes X No If yes, has the easement holder agreed to the pro- Yes X No Is there a homeowner's association for this proper Yes X No If yes, has the homeowner's association approve	oposed alterations? erty?		

If you answered yes to any of the above, please attach a copy of the letter approving the project.

BAR	Case	#
-----	------	---

NATURE OF PROPOSED WORK: Please check all that apply

	NEW CONSTRUCTIO	DN		
x	EXTERIOR ALTERAT	ION: Please check all that ap	oly.	
	🗌 awning	fence, gate or garden wall	HVAC equipment	shutters
	doors	windows	🗖 siding	shed
	🗌 lighting	pergola/trellis	painting unpainted masonry	/
	other			
	ADDITION			
\square	DEMOLITION/ENCAPSU	JLATION		
	SIGNAGE			

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED WORK: Please describe the proposed work in detail (Additional pages may be attached).

We mistakenly assumed that with our approved building renovation drawings that we were approved to make repairs to the failing siding system at 111 S Alfred st. Water was leaking inside the building as well as allowing birds and rodents to take residence. The repeated water intrusion was causing the façade support to fail. As this building had been unoccupied for some time this condition had caused some very unsafe conditions on the interior of the space. All interior damage had been remediation with the approved construction plans sent to the city of Alexandria. Our superintendent mistakenly called the BAR and did not communicate correctly that our plans for construction did not include specifically mentioned siding replacement although looking at the situation replacement of the siding was mandatory. We replaced the damaged items with the same color siding as was originally installed on the building. Our intent was to remediation the situation not cause further issue. We would like to respectfully request consideration of the siding that was installed.

SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS:

Items listed below comprise the **minimum supporting materials** for BAR applications. Staff may request additional information during application review. Please refer to the relevant section of the *Design Guidelines* for further information on appropriate treatments.

Applicants must use the checklist below to ensure the application is complete. Include all information and material that are necessary to thoroughly describe the project. Incomplete applications will delay the docketing of the application for review. Pre-application meetings are required for all proposed additions. All applicants are encouraged to meet with staff prior to submission of a completed application.

Demolition/Encapsulation : All applicants requesting 25 square feet or more of demolition/encapsulation must complete this section. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

N//

Survey plat showing the extent of the proposed demolition/encapsulation.

Existing elevation drawings clearly showing all elements proposed for demolition/encapsulation.

Clear and labeled photographs of all elevations of the building if the entire structure is proposed to be demolished.

Description of the reason for demolition/encapsulation.

Description of the alternatives to demolition/encapsulation and why such alternatives are not considered feasible.

BAR Case

Additions & New Construction: Drawings must be to scale and should not exceed 11" x 17" unless approved by staff. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

N/A	Scaled survey plat showing dimensions of lot and location of existing building and other structures on the lot, location of proposed structure or addition, dimensions of existing structure(s), proposed addition or new construction, and all exterior, ground and roof mounted
	equipment. FAR & Open Space calculation form.
	Clear and labeled photographs of the site, surrounding properties and existing structures, if applicable.
	Existing elevations must be scaled and include dimensions.
	Proposed elevations must be scaled and include dimensions. Include the relationship to adjacent structures in plan and elevations.
	Materials and colors to be used must be specified and delineated on the drawings. Actual samples may be provided or required.
	Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows, doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.
	For development site plan projects, a model showing mass relationships to adjacent properties and structures.

Signs & Awnings: One sign per building under one square foot does not require BAR approval unless illuminated. All other signs including window signs require BAR approval. Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

N/A	
	Linear feet of building: Front:Secondary front (if corner lot):
	Square feet of existing signs to remain:
	Photograph of building showing existing conditions.
	Dimensioned drawings of proposed sign identifying materials, color, lettering style and text.
	Location of sign (show exact location on building including the height above sidewalk).
	Means of attachment (drawing or manufacturer's cut sheet of bracket if applicable).
	Description of lighting (if applicable). Include manufacturer's cut sheet for any new lighting

fixtures and information detailing how it will be attached to the building's facade.

Alterations: Check N/A if an item in this section does not apply to your project.

Clear and labeled photographs of the site, especially the area being impacted by the alterations, all sides of the building and any pertinent details.

	Manufacturer's specifications for materials to include, but not limited to: roofing, siding, windows
	doors, lighting, fencing, HVAC equipment and walls.

- Drawings accurately representing the changes to the proposed structure, including materials and overall dimensions. Drawings must be to scale.
 - An official survey plat showing the proposed locations of HVAC units, fences, and sheds.
 - Historic elevations or photographs should accompany any request to return a structure to an earlier appearance.

ALL APPLICATIONS: Please read and check that you have read and understand the following items:

- I have submitted a filing fee with this application. (Checks should be made payable to the City of Alexandria. Please contact staff for assistance in determining the appropriate fee.)
- I understand the notice requirements and will return a copy of the three respective notice forms to BAR staff at least five days prior to the hearing. If I am unsure to whom I should send notice I will contact Planning and Zoning staff for assistance in identifying adjacent parcels.
- I, the applicant, or an authorized representative will be present at the public hearing.
- I understand that any revisions to this initial application submission (including applications deferred for restudy) must be accompanied by the BAR Supplemental form and revised materials.

The undersigned hereby attests that all of the information herein provided including the site plan, building elevations, prospective drawings of the project, and written descriptive information are true, correct and accurate. The undersigned further understands that, should such information be found incorrect, any action taken by the Board based on such information may be invalidated. The undersigned also hereby grants the City of Alexandria permission to post placard notice as required by Article XI, Division A, Section 11-301(B) of the 1992 Alexandria City Zoning Ordinance, on the property which is the subject of this application. The undersigned also hereby authorizes the City staff and members of the BAR to inspect this site as necessary in the course of research and evaluating the application. The applicant, if other than the property owner, also attests that he/she has obtained permission from the property owner to make this application.

APPLICANT OR AUTHORIZED AGENT:

Signature: <u>Christopher Smith</u>

Printed Name: Christopher Smith

Date: <u>11/9/2021</u>

OWNERSHIP AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT Use additional sheets if necessary

<u>1. Applicant.</u> State the name, address and percent of ownership of any person or entity owning an interest in the applicant, unless the entity is a corporation or partnership, in which case identify each owner of more than three percent. The term ownership interest shall include any legal or equitable interest held at the time of the application in the real property which is the subject of the application.

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership
1. Old Town #1, LLC	Ible Canden Rel Ste 100 Charlotte. NC 28203	100%
2		
3.		

Name	Address	Percent of Ownership
1. Old Town #1, LLC	1616 Chanden Rd Sle 100 Charlotte, NC 28203	100%
2.		
3.		

<u>3. Business or Financial Relationships.</u> Each person or entity listed above (1 and 2), with an ownership interest in the applicant or in the subject property is required to disclose **any** business or financial relationship, as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance, existing at the time of this application, or within the12-month period prior to the submission of this application with any member of the Alexandria City Council, Planning Commission, Board of Zoning Appeals or either Boards of Architectural Review.

Name of person or entity	Relationship as defined by Section 11-350 of the Zoning Ordinance	Member of the Approving Body (i.e. City Council, Planning Commission, etc.)
1. N/A	NA	NA
2.		•
3.		

NOTE: Business or financial relationships of the type described in Sec. 11-350 that arise after the filing of this application and before each public hearing must be disclosed prior to the public hearings.

As the applicant or the applicant's authorized agent, I hereby attest to the best of my ability that the information provided above is true and correct.

11/10/21 Sevena Brown Lerenal. Date Printed Name

BEFORE







