

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, January 16, 2013
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Oscar Fitzgerald, Vice Chairman
Chip Carlin
Wayne Neale
Peter Smeallie
John von Senden

Members Absent: Art Keleher

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner

The meeting was called to order at 7:36 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of December 19, 2012.
BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 6-0.

As there was no meeting on January 2, 2013, there were no minutes to approve from that date.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

1. CASE BAR2012-0404

Request for alterations at **217 N Saint Asaph St.**

APPLICANT: Michael A. Margiotta

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the Consent Calendar was approved, 6-0.

III. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

2. CASE BAR2012-0364

Request alterations at **516 N Columbus St.**

APPLICANT: Charles Kohler by Doug Bibb

BOARD ACTION: **Deferred due to lack of representation by owner, 6-0.**

SPEAKERS

Doug Bibb, landscape contractor for the applicant, spoke in support of the application by responding to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board had questions regarding replacement of the inappropriate transom above the front door that was a condition of BAR approval associated with a previous violation. Mr. Bibb was unable to answer the questions, as the scope of his contract was only the rear fence, deck, paving and landscaping.

On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the Board deferred the application in order to allow the applicant to appear before the Board to respond to questions about when the transom will be replaced, 6-0.

REASON

The Board declined to review a second application for after-the-fact construction at this property when the applicant's representative for the present case was unable to respond to questions about the previous, still unresolved transom violation. Therefore, the Board voted unanimously to defer action until the applicant or his representative could address the Board's questions regarding compliance with the previous condition to replace the transom.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

3. CASE BAR2012-0401

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **323 Duke Street.**

APPLICANT: 323 Duke St., LLC by Robert Bentley Adams & Associates, P.C.

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0.**

Items 3 and 4 were combined for discussion purposes.

4. CASE BAR2012-0402

Request for an addition and alterations at **323 Duke Street.**

APPLICANT: 323 Duke St., LLC by Robert Bentley Adams & Associates, P.C.

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0.**

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. That the rooftop HVAC units be painted to match the adjacent roof surface.

2. That the two historic windows on the rear (north) elevation be salvaged and reused on site, either in the new addition or for materials for necessary repairs for front windows.
3. That the applicant submit window and door specifications in conformance with the BAR Window Policy prior to approval of the building permit.
4. The statements in archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Demolition, Basement/Foundation Plans, Landscaping, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Utilities and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or other artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

SPEAKERS

Bud Adams and Scot McBroom, architects for the applicant, spoke in support of the application by giving an overview of the proposal and responding to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Chairman Hulfish noted that the proposal was very well designed and appropriate to the historic house.

Mr. Smeallie also noted that it was a well-done project and asked a question regarding the rooftop HVAC units.

Mr. Carlin commented that this house is one of a collection of well-preserved early houses and the rear elevations and rear gardens offer a vignette of Old Town. He inquired about the rooftop HVAC units and whether they will be new or existing. Scot McBroom responded that they will relocate the existing units to the roof. Mr. Carlin expressed concern regarding the visibility of the units and asked whether the units could be painted to match the adjacent roof surface. Mr. McBroom agreed to a condition to paint the units.

Mr. Neale supported the proposed addition and added the condition regarding painting the rooftop HVAC units.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Mr. Carlin, the Board approved the application, as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0.

REASON

The Board was in full support of the proposed partial demolition/capsulation and addition and found the addition to be architecturally compatible with the existing structure and in compliance with the Design Guidelines. The Board was concerned about the potential visibility of the rooftop HVAC units and added a condition that the units be painted to match the adjacent roof.

5. CASE BAR2012-0405

Request to partially demolish at **1107 Duke Street.**

APPLICANT: Brandon and Alice Patty by Katie Moore, Olios Design, LLC

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0.**

Items 5 and 6 were combined for discussion purposes.

6. CASE BAR2012-0406

Request for alterations at **1107 Duke Street.**

APPLICANT: Brandon and Alice Patty by Katie Moore, Olios Design, LLC

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-0.**

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. That the inappropriate storm door on the front elevation be removed;
2. That the applicant submit revised window specifications in conformance with the BAR's adopted *Window Policy* for the proposed windows on the south elevation prior to issuance of a building permit;
3. That the proposed railing for the front stoop be a simple metal railing with no pickets but with a simple lamb's tongue scroll; and
4. That final approval of the proposed metal grate be approved by BAR staff prior to issuance of a building permit.

SPEAKERS

Katie Moore, designer for the applicant, spoke in support of the application by giving an overview of the proposal and responding to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Dr. Fitzgerald supported the alterations and added a request that the inappropriate front storm door be removed.

Mr. von Senden inquired as to whether the front stoop railing would have a simple scroll detail or not, noting he preferred the lamb's tongue scroll detail.

Mr. Neale commented that the application was a very complete submission and a good example for other applications.

Mr. Carlin asked a question regarding the basement windows and noted that the alterations to this townhouse will set an example for the adjacent townhouse. He also stated a preference for the simple hand rail without pickets but with the lamb's tongue scroll, and revised the condition accordingly.

On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. Neale, the Board approved the application, as amended, 6-0.

REASON

The Board supported the alterations to the subject property finding them an improvement and consistent with the Design Guidelines.

V. OTHER BUSINESS

Staff alerted the Board that several large projects will likely be submitted over the next several months and also noted that the BAR Concept Review process for Development Special Use Permit cases will be clarified and refined this spring with input from the Boards.

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2012-0393

Request for window replacement at **411 S Columbus St.**

APPLICANT: Kenneth K. & Judith Sterne

CASE BAR2012-0398

Request for fence replacement at **310 S Royal St.**

APPLICANT: John D. Clayborne, Inc.

CASE BAR2012-0400

Request for roof replacement at **201 S Washington St.**

APPLICANT: City of Alexandria

CASE BAR2012-0403

Request for roof replacement at **105 King St.**

APPLICANT: Noe Landini

CASE BAR2012-0408

Request for window replacement at **116 S Alfred St.**

APPLICANT: Brian Zeigler

CASE BAR2012-0409

Request for door replacement at **200 N Alfred St.**

APPLICANT: Thomas & Kathleen Valentine

CASE BAR2012-0410

Request for light fixtures at **101 Quay St.**

APPLICANT: Cathleen Curtin

CASE BAR2012-0411

Request for signage at **1426 Prince St.**

APPLICANT: Public Safety Foundation of America by Mark Cannon

CASE BAR2013-0001

Request for roof replacement at **211 Wolfe St.**

APPLICANT: Harry Braswell, Inc.

CASE BAR2013-0002

Request for door replacement at **226 N Columbus St.**

APPLICANT: James Noble

CASE BAR2013-0003

Request for roof replacement at **419 S Saint Asaph St.**

APPLICANT: Alexandria Roofing

CASE BAR2013-0006

Request for alterations at **708 Wolfe St.**

APPLICANT: Paul & Alexandria Clement

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:12pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Catherine K. Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner
Boards of Architectural Review