

***** **DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Parker-Gray District

Wednesday, September 27, 2017

7:30pm, Sister Cities Conference Room, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Theresa del Ninno, Chair
Purvi Irwin, Vice Chair
Bill Conkey
Matthew Slowik
James Spencer
Robert Duffy

Members Absent: Aaron Karty

Staff Present: Department of Planning & Zoning
Al cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Principal Planner

1. The Board of Architectural Review Parker-Gray District public hearing was called to order at 7:32pm. All members were present.

I. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the July 26, 2017 public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

By unanimous consent, the Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes from the July 26, 2017 meeting as submitted.

II. NEW BUSINESS

3. **CASE BAR #2016-00406**

Request for final review and approval of conditions and details, including signage, for the original Certificate of Appropriateness (approved 12/14/2016) at 699 North Patrick Street.

Applicant: Alexandria Redevelopment & Housing Authority.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0

On a motion by Mr. Irwin, and seconded by Mr. Conkey, the PG Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case # 2016-00406, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. Preference for the Trex samples for the pergola material
2. Applicant must work with staff to add brick detailing to façade.

REASON

The Board noted that the applicant had successfully addressed the conditions of approval though wanted the applicant to work with staff to pursue additional brick detailing. The Board also noted a preference for the Trex material noting that its coloration was through the entire material rather than just the exterior, which would allow it to weather better over time.

SPEAKERS

Patricia Booker, KTGy, project architect, reviewed the final details and how the applicant was meeting the approved conditions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board appreciated the applicant's efforts to continue to refine the project based on the conditions of approval and noted that the design had improved yet again. While the majority of Board members found that both samples for the pergola (Trex and Azex) were acceptable, there was a preference for the Trex due to the color being present throughout the entire material since the proposed color is a charcoal grey. The Board also found that the brick detailing was limited and requested that the applicant continue to work with staff to identify ways to increase the brick detailing, similar to the brickwork on the West Street elevation of the new Jefferson-Houston Elementary School.

Separately, the Board also reviewed the contemporary sample for the window provided by the project architect and found that from a design perspective, it offered clean contemporary lines appropriate on new construction, such as the new Ramsey Homes. While there was some concern about the use of vinyl, as it is only present on the interior, the overall window construction is quite durable. The Board found that the Jeld-Wen DF Hybrid was consistent with the adopted Window Policy as it was considered an aluminum-clad product acceptable for Later buildings and new construction in Parker-Gray.

4. **CASE BAR #2017-00306**
Request for alterations at 1109 Queen Street.
Applicant: Elitee Enterprises Inc.

Cases #4 & #5 were combined for discussion purposes

5. **CASE BAR #2017-00332**
Request for partial demolition/capsulation at 1109 Queen Street.
Applicant: Elitee Enterprises Inc.

BOARD ACTION: Denied, 6-0

On a motion by Mr. Conkey, and seconded by Mr. Duffy, the PG Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the staff recommendation for denial of BAR Case # 2016-00306 and 2016-00332. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

CONDITIONS OF DENIAL

The applicant must remedy the violation by acquiring reclaimed old-growth wood and have siding milled and planed to match the historic siding, with final details to be approved by staff. The siding shall be installed using reproduction cut nails. The work shall be completed within six months.

REASON

The Board concurred with the staff analysis and recommendation, noting that it was unacceptable to demolish, or approve a request for after-the-fact demolition, of historic siding that was determined to be in good condition and reasonably salvageable. The Board noted that the policies and guidelines should be uniformly applied and upheld.

SPEAKERS

Amir Radfar, property owner and applicant, spoke on behalf of the request to demolish historic material.

Danny Smith, 401 South Lee Street and co-Chair of the Historic Alexandria Resources Commission, spoke in support of the staff recommendation to deny the request.

Elizabeth McCall, President of the Old Town Civic Association and Chair of the Alexandria Archaeology Commission, 537 South Fairfax Street, expressed concern about the increasing pattern of after-the-fact requests for approval and concern for the ongoing loss of historic fabric in Old Town.

Charles Ablard, 803 Hall Place and member of the Historic Alexandria Foundation Board, also spoke against the application and in support of the staff recommendation.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board asked several questions about how the demolition occurred and the applicant's interactions with BAR staff. The Board discussed the policies and procedures that have been in place and generally followed and adhered to. The Board also discussed the correction of the violation with reclaimed wood and it was noted that within Virginia there are a number of places to obtain reclaimed wood.

6. **CASE BAR #2017-00307**

Request for alterations at 206 North Fayette Street.
Applicants: George and Agnes Spicer

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Duffy, and seconded by Mr. Spencer, the PG Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case # 2017-00307, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposed alterations to be acceptable despite the after-the-fact request for approval. They noted that the work did not involve the loss of any historic building fabric and that the applicant ceased work immediately upon being notified that BAR would be necessary.

SPEAKERS

Sebell Uncil, contractor, spoke in support and responded to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board had no objection to the proposed alterations but had questions regarding how the applicant came to undertake the work without approval.

III. OTHER BUSINESS

The Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review discussed the following items:

1. Election of Board of Architectural Review Parker-Gray Officials

BOARD ACTION: Nominations

On a motion by Mr. Conkey, and seconded by Mr. Duffy, the PG Board of Architectural Review voted to nominate Ms. Irwin as Chair. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0-1, with Ms. Irwin abstaining. On a motion by Ms. del Ninno, and seconded by Ms. Irwin, the PG Board of Architectural Review voted to nominate Mr. Spencer as Vice-Chair. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

The Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review meeting was adjourned at 8:48pm.

V. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR Case # 2017-00281

Request for replacement windows to correct existing violation at 1109 Queen St.

Applicant: Elitee Enterprises Inc.

BAR Case # 2017-00293

Request for In-kind fence repair at 1310 Queen St.

Applicant: Jean Hollis

BAR Case # 2017-00277
Request for siding replacement on south elevations at 323 N. Henry St.
Applicant: MSI. Investments

BAR Case # 2017-00298
Request for exterior alterations at 323 N. Henry St.
Applicant: MSI Investments

BAR Case # 2017-00303
Request for siding repair at 1022 Oronoco St.
Applicant: Heidi Ford

BAR Case # 2017-00323
Request for In-kind replacement of an existing HVA Unit at 631 N. Alfred St.
Applicant: Chang ki Hong

BAR Case # 2017-00331
Request for replace inappropriate asphalt shingle roof on front gable with new cedar shingle roof and asphalt siding on rear slope at 112 S Fayette St.
Applicant: Lyons Contracting, Inc.

BAR Case # 2017-00349
Request for window replacement per prior BAR approval (2016-00309); replace siding on rear all, remove non-historic siding on south alley side and repair historic at 211 N. Payne St.
Applicant: Wendy Lereah