

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, November 2, 2016
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Slade Elkins
Christina Kelley
Christine Roberts
Robert Adams
Kelly Mechling
Margaret Miller
John von Senden, Chair

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Preservation Planner

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes from the **October 19, 2016** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes from the October 19, 2016 OHAD BAR hearing. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0. Mr. Elkins arrived after approval of the minutes.

II. NEW BUSINESS

1. CASE BAR #2016-00340

Request for partial demolition at **422 S Fairfax Street**
Applicant: Neal and Florence Cohen

Items #1 & #2 were combined for discussion purposes.

2. CASE BAR #2016-00341

Request for an addition at **422 S Fairfax Street**
Applicant: Neal and Florence Cohen

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0

On a motion by Ms. Kelley, seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00340 and 00341, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That the applicant work with staff to determine whether historic siding exists under the Masonite siding on the front façade and, if so, whether it can be reasonably repaired and restored, according to the BAR's adopted policy.
2. The following statements shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all construction documents that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
3. The height of the light fixture shall be restudied to be more proportional with the entry, with final approval by staff as part of the building permit process.

REASON

The Board supported the proposal for partial demolition and an addition, finding the project to be appropriate and compatible with the Design Guidelines.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board's discussion focused on the proposed light fixtures at the front door with general consensus that the two proposed fixtures seemed too tall for the space although they supported the design of the fixture. There was also a question of whether two was necessary and the project architect explained the goal was symmetry and balance at the entry. Overall, the Board was extremely supportive of the proposal.

SPEAKERS

Patrick Camus, project architect, spoke in support and responded to questions. He clarified that the proposed light fixtures would be electric and not gas.

3. CASE BAR #2016-00342

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **317 S Lee Street**
Applicant: Robert Bentley Adams & Associates

Items #3 & #4 were combined for discussion purposes.

4. CASE BAR #2016-00343

Request for alterations and an addition at **317 S Lee Street**
Applicant: Robert Bentley Adams & Associates

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 6-0

On a motion by Ms. Roberts, seconded by Ms. Mechling, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to defer BAR Case #2016-00342 & 00343 for further study and clarification of zoning compliance regarding open space. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0. Mr. Adams recused himself.

REASON

The Board expressed concern that the open space was not accurately represented based on testimony made at the hearing and recommended deferral to clarify zoning requirements.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was concerned about the zoning compliance related to open space and wanted that resolved before discussing the design as the proposal may require restudy to be in compliance with zoning requirements. There was a comment that the height of the addition and attic space should be studied to see whether it can be lowered. The Board also noted that, although drawings must be submitted at 11"x17", all plans must be clearly legible when reproduced and photographs must be color.

SPEAKERS

Scot McBroom, project architect, spoke in support of the application and responded to questions.

Beal Lowen, 321 South Lee Street, expressed concern with the project and commented that he did not believe the plans were accurate, specifically with respect to the height of the existing deck and its effect on the required open space.

Mary Palmer, 315 South Lee Street, spoke in opposition to the project due to significant adverse impacts the mass of the addition would have on her adjacent property.

5. CASE BAR #2016-00333

Request for waiver of HVAC screening at **301 S Washington St.**

Applicant: 301 S Washington, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Ms. Kelley, seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2016-00333 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

REASON

The Board agreed with the staff analysis that the proposed rooftop HVAC would be minimally visible and therefore a waiver of the screening requirement was preferable to any rooftop screening.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board had minimal discussion on this item, agreeing with the staff analysis.

SPEAKERS

Steve Kulinski, project architect, was available to respond to questions.

6. CASE BAR #2016-00344

Request to partially demolish and capsulate at **703 S Lee Street**

Applicant: Norma and Kevin Kuntz

Items #6 & #7 were combined for discussion purposes.

7. CASE BAR #2016-00345

Request for an addition at **703 S Lee Street**

Applicant: Norma and Kevin Kuntz

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 5-2

On a motion by Ms. Mechling, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to defer BAR Case #2016-00344 and 00345 for restudy. The motion carried on a vote of 5-2 with Ms. Roberts & Ms. Miller voting against the deferral.

REASON

The Board generally agreed with the staff recommendation that the dormers on the north elevation needed further study. The Board supported the overall concept of the rear addition.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board found that the existing dormers and proposed new dormer on the north elevation were not architecturally compatible and suggested options for improving the fenestration. The Board described the proposed dormer pattern as A-A-B and wanted to see both A-B-A or A-A-A schemes, with conceptual support for both approaches. The Board also discussed the need for a roof plan to better understand how the addition, particularly the dormers, would integrate with the existing house and requested that a roof plan be supplied with the next submission. It was also noted that this was an opportunity to improve the window configuration from the 1993 addition and to improve the proportions and details of the existing front porch. Ms. Dimond noted those elements were not within the scope of the current project but she would relay the comments to the owners. The Board also noted they appreciated hearing the neighbor support.

SPEAKERS

Stephanie Dimond, project architect, spoke in support of the project and provided a number of letters of neighbor support to be entered in to the record.

Ethan Cooper, 633 South Fairfax Street, spoke in support.

III. ADJOURNMENT

The OHAD Board of Architectural Review hearing was adjourned at 8:40pm.

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR #2016-00349

Request to install exhaust vent at **800 S Washington St, BLDG**

Applicant: Scott Management

CASE BAR #2016-00348

Request to install exhaust vent at **800 S Washington St, BLDG**

Applicant: Scott Management

CASE BAR #2016-00347

Request for door and window replacement at **1250 S Washington St**

Applicant: J Canny

CASE BAR #2016-00339

Request for in kind front door replacement at **813 Duke Street**

Applicant: Brian Harrington

CASE BAR #2016-00337

Request for door replacement at **607 Princess Street**

Applicant: Courtney Fones

CASE BAR #2016-00334

Request for window repair at **203 S Lee Street**

Applicant: Brad Berkley

CASE BAR #2016-00335

Request for HVAC unit replacement at **301 S Washington Street**

Applicant: 301 S Washington St., LLC

CASE BAR 2016-00331

Request for window repair at **120 N Payne Street**

Applicant: Lisa Belasco

CASE BAR #2016-00330

Request for Chimney repair at **303 N Washington Street**

Applicant: T.D. Fraley & Sons

CASE BAR #2016-00328

Request for signage at **821 S Washington Street**

Applicant: The Mattress Firm

CASE BAR #2016-00326

Request for window replacement at **305 Charles Alexander Court**

Applicant: Maria Smith

CASE BAR #2016-00350

Request for alterations at **321 S Pitt Street**

Applicant: David & Rebekah Young