

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Wednesday, January 17, 2024
7:00 p.m., City Council Chamber
City Hall

Members Present:

James Spencer
Michael Lyons
Andrew Scott
Bud Adams
Theresa del Ninno
Nastaran Zandian

Members Absent: Margaret Miller

Secretary: Bill Conkey, Historic Preservation Architect

Staff Present: Marina Novaes, Historic Preservation Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER

The Board of Architectural Review Public Hearing was called to order at 7:03 p.m. Ms. Miller was absent. All other members were present.

II. MINUTES

Consideration of minutes from the January 3, 2024 meeting.

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Mr. Lyons, and seconded by Ms. Zandian, the Board of Architectural Review approved the January 3, 2024 Meeting minutes, as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

Consent Calendar

3 BAR#2023-00531 OHAD
Request for alterations at 210 Duke Street
Applicant: Jelks H. Cabaniss III

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Mr. Scott, and seconded by Ms. del Ninno, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR#2023-00531 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

4 BAR#2023-00534 PG
Request for alterations at 215 N Payne Street
Applicant: 215 NP SPE LLC

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Mr. Scott, and seconded by Ms. del Ninno, the Board of

Architectural Review voted to approve BAR#2023-00534 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 5-0.

CONDITION OF APPROVAL:

- 1- That the awning brackets be installed through the mortar joints.

Items Previously Deferred

5 BAR#2023-00371 OHAD

Request for alterations at 329 N Washington Street
Applicant: Hershel Kleinberg, Lisa Cohen

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Ms. Zandian, and seconded by Mr. Scott, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR#2023-00371 as amended, to accept the staff recommendation to remove the freestanding pergola. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

REASON

The Board found the westernmost pergola to be too intrusive into the North Washington Street streetscape.

SPEAKERS

Teri MacKeever, project architect, represented the applicant, gave a brief summary of the changes made to the project since the prior hearing, and was available to answer questions.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Spencer and Ms. Zandian requested clarification as to the proposed materials, and Ms. del Ninno asked for an explanation of the lighting scheme.

Mr. Adams mentioned prior alterations to the house and previous BAR reviews. He felt that the changes had stretched the limit of what could be done on North Washington Street and does not approve of some changes, referring to the new addition as a “fist to the eye.” He did not like that the applicant had come to the BAR numerous times and did not approve of having a spa in the yard or adding so many modern elements to a historic house.

Mr. Scott asked for information regarding the freestanding pergola, its purpose and its screening materials. Ms. MacKeever explained that it will provide roofing to a spa and described the screening. Mr. Scott agreed with staff recommendations and noted that he respects Mr. Adams’ comments. He found the easternmost pergola suitable, but not the freestanding western one. He does not find it appropriate for the location. He supported staff recommendations.

Ms. del Ninno found the current proposal to be an improvement over the former one. She felt that the new addition detracts from the historic part of the house and agreed with staff recommendations to remove the westernmost pergola from the plan.

Mr. Lyons felt that the addition looks odd in such a prominent location. He supported staff recommendations to remove the westernmost pergola from the plan.

Ms.Zandian agreed with the other Board members and the staff recommendations to remove the unattached pergola.

Mr. Spencer agreed with staff recommendations.

New Business

6&7 BAR#2023-00527 OHAD

Request for reapproval of a previously approved application for alterations at 115 S Union Street
Applicant: Jeremy Morrison

BAR#2023-00528 OHAD

Request for reapproval of a previously approved application for partial demolition/encapsulation at 115 S Union Street
Applicant: Jeremy Morrison

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Mr. Scott, and seconded by Mr. Lyons, the Board of Architectural Review voted to accept the request for deferral of BAR#2023-00527 and BAR#2023-00528. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0.

REASON

The Board felt that lowering the proposed windows to align with the other windows would lead to necessary changes in design which they would like to review at a later hearing.

SPEAKERS

Laura Escobar, project architect, represented the applicant and was available to answer questions.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Scott asked why the architect didn't replicate the storefront windows on the primary elevation instead of replicating the upper floor windows. Ms. Escobar noted that they were making the proportions correct and adding sufficient lighting.

Mr. Spencer felt that the first-floor windows on the first level of the north elevation should be aligned at the top.

Ms. Zandian agreed with Mr. Spencer regarding the window heights on the north elevation.

Mr. Scott also agreed with that suggestion and felt that the fenestration/pattern of the glass should be altered to better go with the storefront windows on the east elevation. In general he supported the application to add windows.

Mr. Adams agreed with the comment about alignment, felt the proposed windows weren't cohesive. He preferred that they match the eight windows above. He suggested a restudy.

Ms. del Ninno agreed that lowering the head would change the window configuration and that it would be a good move to look at the first-floor storefront and tie the first floor together.

Mr. Lyons did not have an issue with the appearance but respected his colleagues' input. He could support the application if the windows were lowered.

8&9 BAR#2023-00529 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/encapsulation at 221 S West Street
Applicant: Moore Construction Group, LLC

BAR#2023-00530 OHAD

Request for alterations at 221 S West Street
Applicant: Moore Construction Group, LLC

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Mr. Scott, and seconded by Mr. Lyons, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR#2023-00529 and BAR#2023-00530 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-1.

REASON

The Board supported the dormer but added the condition to work with Staff to come up with more appropriate portions for the dormer roofline and windows.

SPEAKERS

Anthony Moore, the contractor, presented the project.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Spencer expressed concern about the dormer proportions and asked if other roof options were explored. Scott Brown responded that the applicant prefers the gable style to the shed style roof.

Ms. Zandian asked what color the siding would be. Mr. Brown responded that it will match the existing house siding.

Mr. Spencer said he would support a gable style roof if it had a simpler design, secondary to the house.

Mr. Spencer said the massing on the sides of the window is too thick and it would look better to add a window.

Ms. Del Ninno said that a wider window with less wall would look better, as would a shed style dormer roof.

Mr. Lyons said he would support the project with an additional window.

Mr. Scott said a shed style dormer would be more appropriate, and adding an additional window would help.

Ms. Zandian expressed support for the shed dormer and additional window.

10&11 BAR#2023-00532 OHAD

Request for alterations at 923 S Alfred Street

Applicant: Erick Min

BAR#2023-00533 OHAD

Request for partial demolition/encapsulation at 923 S Alfred Street

Applicant: Erick Min

BOARD ACTION: On a motion by Mr. Lyons, and seconded by Mr. Scott, the Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR#2023-00532 and BAR#2023-00533 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of _6-0.

CONDITION OF APPROVAL:

1- That the railing material be wood or metal.

REASON

The Board agreed with staff's recommendation and found the project appropriate.

SPEAKERS

Erick Min, the property owner, was available to answer any questions.

DISCUSSION

There was no discussion.

Other Business

10 Legal Training for BAR Members

ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review adjourned at 8:27 pm.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR2023-00513 OHAD

Request for window and door replacements at 100 Cameron Mews

Applicant: Todd Sheringer

BAR2023-00522 OHAD

Request for window replacements at 709 B Massey Lane

Applicant: Brenda Quiroz Maday

BAR2024-00001 OHAD

Request for small cell antenna installation at 201 N Washington Street

Applicant: Crown Castle