

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District
Wednesday, October 21, 2015
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: John von Senden, Chairman
Chip Carlin, Vice Chairman
Margaret Miller
Christine Roberts
Wayne Neale
Kelly Finnigan
Christina Kelley

Staff Present: Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager
Catherine Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was called to order at 7:30pm. All members present.

I. MINUTES

Consideration for the minutes from the **October 7, 2015** public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Ms. Miller, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review, approved the minutes of October 7, 2015 as submitted, 7-0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

1 CASE BAR2015-0320

Request for alterations at **403 Franklin St.**

Applicant: Mike and Sherri Jones

BOARD ACTION: The Board noted the withdrawal of BAR Case #2015-0320 prior to hearing.

2 CASE BAR2015-0322

Request for alterations at **108 Quay Street.**

Applicant: Martha Gabriel

This item was removed from the Consent Calendar.

SPEAKERS

Martha Gabriel, applicant, offered to answer questions.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-1.

On a motion by Ms. Finnigan, seconded by Ms. Miller, the OHAD Board of Architectural

Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0322, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 6 to 1. Ms. Roberts voted against.

CONDITIONS

Approval of the Craftsman style door without muntins. ~~and further recommends that the Board direct staff to amend the *Minor Architectural Elements Policy* to permit administrative approval of glazed fiberglass doors, without exterior exposed screw heads or buttons, on buildings or additions constructed after 1965.~~

REASON

The Board agreed that this particular glass panel fiberglass door design was appropriate for this 1970s townhouse but was not ready to change the Minor Architectural Elements policy to allow staff to administratively approve glass panels on fiberglass door at this time.

III. NEW BUSINESS

3 CASE BAR2015-0265

Request to partially demolish and capsule at **101 Quay St**

Applicant: Julie Wannamaker and Howard Bergman

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0265, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

Item #3 & 4 were combined for discussion purposes.

4 CASE BAR2015-0266

Request for alterations at **101 Quay St**

Applicant: Julie Wannamaker and Howard Bergman

SPEAKERS

Karen Conkey, AIA, represented the owners and offered to answer questions. She noted that the proposed Juliet balcony railings would only project 3" from the building face.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0266, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

CONDITIONS

Approval of the application, as submitted

REASON

The Board found that the proposed alterations would improve the appearance of the existing building. The Board noted the high quality decorative character of the Colonial Revival style Chippendale pattern metal railings and believed the renovation would be a positive addition to this neighborhood.

5 CASE BAR2015-0328

Request for revisions to previously approved permit to demolish at **207 Prince St.**

Applicant: Robert Montague, IV

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0328, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

Item #5 & 6 were combined for discussion purposes.

6 CASE BAR2015-0329

Request for revisions to previously approved plans at **207 Prince St.**

Applicant: Robert Montague, IV

SPEAKERS

Stephanie Dimond, project designer, described the revisions to the previous BAR approval and offered to answer questions.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Ms. Roberts, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0329, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7 to 0.

CONDITIONS

Approval of the application, as submitted, with continuation of the archaeological conditions previously approved.

REASON

The Board noted their support because the present proposal allows more of the historic fabric to be preserved, including the underground ice well and the original chimney hearth and foundations. The Board confirmed that the separate VDHR and HAF easement conditions were being met and did not have an issue with capsulation of the window in the south wall of the “little house.”

IV. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

7 CASE BAR2015-0097

Request for alterations at **420 S Lee St.**

Applicant: Thomas Byrne

BOARD ACTION: The Board noted that BAR Case #2015-0097 was improperly noticed.

8 CASE BAR2015-0268

Request for new construction (townhouses) at **2 Duke St.**

Applicant: RTS Associates, LLC

SPEAKERS

Jonathan Rak, attorney representing the applicant, introduced the case.

Patrick Burkhart, project architect for the applicant, made a brief presentation and responded to issues raised in the staff report.

Greg Shron, the applicant, stated that EYA agreed with the staff recommendations and responded to questions.

Susan Savitch, 128 Waterford Place, expressed concern about the mass and parking.

Hank Savitch, 128 Waterford Place, expressed concern about the setback on building #3.

Cheryl Lavoie, 1608 W. Abington Drive, was in full support of renovation of the long neglected waterfront but suggested gable shapes over the window bays facing the river.

John Sullivan, 323 Kentucky Ave., supported the project and said the buildings would look spectacular from the river.

Randy Randol, 3 Franklin Street in Ford's Landing, asked where the height was measured and what impact filling the land here would have on flooding the property of others.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 5-2.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Finnigan, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0268, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 5 to 2. Ms. Miller and Mr. Neale voted against.

CONDITIONS

That the applicant work with staff on the material transition at the rear of the fourth story loft at Buildings 4 and 5 and with a lighter colored slate on the east end of these buildings to be different from the color of the roof at the historic warehouse at 2 Duke Street, with final approval by staff as part of the building permit review process.

REASON

The majority of the Board was supportive of the design evolution of the townhouses and believed they were now well composed clusters of townhouses with sufficient variety and architectural character to reflect the authentic commercial Alexandria waterfront yet still recall local historic residential detailing. The Board members complimented the high quality materials and the use of lighter color brick on the interior of the project.

9 CASE BAR2015-0269

Request for new construction (Building #3) at **2 Duke St.**

Applicant: RTS Associates, LLC

SPEAKERS

Patrick Burkhart and Joohan Kim, project architects for the applicant, made a brief presentation and responded to issues raised in the staff report.

Danny Smith, 401 South Lee Street, stated that this had been an amazing process and that much progress had been made. However, he felt the Wolfe St. façade was still a bit harsh and was concerned about the view of rooftop mechanical equipment from higher elevations.

Joan Huffer, 10 Wolfe Street, asked for additional setbacks, with more differentiation between bays and within the hyphen recesses. She noted that much of this had already been addressed by the applicant and encouraged the process to keep moving forward. She stated that it was a wonderful, exciting project, though it will be hard to deal with the construction.

Hank Savich, 128 Waterford Place, repeated that the more shallow setbacks on the fourth and fifth floors of the Union Street elevation of Building #3 were not fairly proportional to the deeper setbacks on the wider Wolfe Street.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 4-3.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Ms. Kelley, the OHAD Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2015-0269, as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 4 to 3. Ms. Miller, Ms. Finnigan and Mr. Neale voted against.

CONDITIONS

1. Work with staff to relieve the monochromatic red brick at the southwest corner of Building #3, using either a clearly differentiated brick color or metal panels.
2. Make all of Building #3A a single red brick color, to create a distinctly different appearance from Building #3, while retaining the layered brick effect and an accent brick color at the windows on the east side.

REASON

The majority of the BAR found the fourth and fifth floor setbacks to be successful and believed that the bays and hyphens effectively created a townhouse scale rhythm, although some members felt the building should be broken down further with more variety in the brick color and fenestration. The Board also found that Building #3A was sufficiently distinct from Building #3 to effectively reduce the visual scale of the building on Wolfe Street façade. The majority of the Board agreed with the analysis in the staff report that this building was in compliance with the Zoning Ordinance, Waterfront Design Guidelines, and the Additional Standards -- Potomac River Vicinity.

V. OTHER BUSINESS

The Board discussed the appeal of BAR Case #2015-0189 and 2015-0190 to City Council on December 12, 2015. Mr. Carlin agreed to represent the BAR at the appeal.

Staff noted City Council's unanimous approval of the Robinson Terminal North development project.

DEFERRED PRIOR TO HEARING

CASE BAR2015-0323

Request to partially demolish and capulate at **111 S Payne St.**

Applicant: Casa Rosada Artisan Gelato

CASE BAR2015-0324

Request for an addition at **111 S Payne St.**

Applicant: Casa Rosada Artisan Gelato

WITHDRAWN PRIOR TO HEARING

CASE BAR2015-0321

Request for alterations at **401 Franklin St.**

Applicant: Mike and Sherri Jones

ADJOURNMENT

The Board of Architectural Review, Old and Historic Alexandria District, hearing was adjourned at 10:25pm.

ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

CASE BAR2015-0321

Request for window replacement at **401 Franklin St.**

Applicant: Mike and Sherri Jones

CASE BAR2015-0333

Request for window replacement at **719 S Union St.**

Applicant: David Millard

CASE BAR2015-0334

Request for window replacement and pointing at **1014 Prince St.**

Applicant: Varies

CASE BAR2015-0335

Request for chimney repair and roof replacement at **215 N Columbus St.**

Applicant: Rhoda Geasland

CASE BAR2015-0336

Request for window and door replacement at **1250 S Washington St., # 508 & 510**

Applicant: Charlotte Forster

CASE BAR2015-0342

Request for shutter replacement at **1006-1016 Prince St.**

Applicant: The Courts Condominium

CASE BAR2015-0344

Request for signage at **219 S Payne St.**

Applicant: NHM, INC