

***** **DRAFT MINUTES*******

Board of Architectural Review
Parker-Gray District

Wednesday, July 26, 2017

7:30pm, Sister Cities Conference Room, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Theresa del Ninno, Chair
Purvi Irwin, Vice Chair
Aaron Karty
Bill Conkey
Matthew Slowik
James Spencer
Robert Duffy

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Department of Planning & Zoning
Catherine Miliaras, Principal Planner
Stephanie Sample, Urban Planner

1. The Board of Architectural Review Parker-Gray District public hearing was called to order at 7:40pm. All members were present.

I. MINUTES

2. Consideration of the minutes from the June 28, 2017 public hearing.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0-1

On a motion by Mr. Conkey, seconded by Mr. Spencer, the Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review voted to approve the minutes of the June 28, 2017 hearing as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 6-0-1. Mr. Duffy abstained, as he was absent for the June 28, 2017 meeting.

II. NEW BUSINESS

3. **CASE BAR #2017-00246**
Request for partial demolition & capsulation at 317 North Patrick Street
Applicants: Doris Sokoloff & Mimi Konoza

Cases #3 & #4 were combined for discussion purposes

4. **CASE BAR #2017-00247**
Request for alterations at 317 North Patrick Street
Applicants: Doris Sokoloff & Mimi Konoza

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 7-0

On a motion by Mr. Slowik, seconded by Mr. Duffy, the Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2017-00246 and BAR Case #2017-00247 as amended. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. That the applicant coordinate with staff on the condition of the historic siding after the removal of the vinyl siding so that as much of the historic fabric can be maintained and preserved as possible;
2. That the trim over the windows on the first floor be simplified, or modified in the field if there is evidence of a different trim profile; and,
3. That the applicant have the option to work with staff on the final roof shingle color.

SPEAKERS

Steve Kulinski, project architect, spoke in support of the project and responded to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Slowik inquired as to whether the applicant preferred to use the weathered wood color architectural shingle or would whether they would prefer another color. The applicant noted it was selected to be in conformance with the BAR's adopted Roof Policy but appreciated the opportunity to work out the final color selection with staff.

REASON

The Board agreed with the staff analysis and recommendations, noting that the applicant was improving the house and making appropriate alterations consistent with the Design Guidelines.

5. CASE BAR #2017-00211

Request for complete demolition at 603 North Alfred Street
Applicant: 603 North Alfred Street, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 7-0

On a motion by Mr. Duffy, seconded by Ms. Irwin, the Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review voted to approve BAR Case #2017-00211 as submitted. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The following conditions above shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - a. Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-746-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of

artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

- b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

SPEAKERS

Kahan Dhillon, applicant, explained the project and responded to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

None of the BAR members expressed concern regarding the demolition of the existing house noting that it was not of uncommon design, material or craftsmanship and did not contribute greatly to the architectural or cultural significance of the Parker-Gray District.

REASON

The BAR found that none of the criteria to consider when evaluating a Permit to Demolish were met and therefore had no objection to the demolition of this unremarkable mid-20th-century freestanding house.

6. CASE BAR #2017-00212

Request for new construction at 601 North Alfred Street
Applicant: 601 North Alfred Street, LLC

Cases #6 & #7 were combined for discussion purposes

7. CASE BAR #2017-00213

Request for new construction at 603 North Alfred Street
Applicant: 603 North Alfred Street, LLC

BOARD ACTION: Deferred, 7-0

On a motion by Mr. Spencer, seconded by Mr. Conkey, the Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review voted to defer BAR Case #2017-00212 and BAR Case #2017-00213. The motion carried on a vote of 7-0.

SPEAKERS

Kahan Dhillon, applicant, spoke in support of the project and responded to questions.

Bill Lieu, project architect, gave a brief overview of the proposed project and responded to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board had extensive discussion regarding the proposed construction of two semi-detached townhouses. The Board inquired as to how the overall character of the project had been selected and it was noted that several Board members found that a building should be of its own time rather than a historicist reproduction. There are examples around the world of how new construction and historic buildings can coexist compatibly

and in harmony. However, it was noted that the proportions of the building did not successfully align with the historic Queen Anne-style townhouses to the south that inspired that particular design approach. It was stated that there was more flexibility in new construction with the detailing but they advised that the detailing should be more contextual.

Regarding, third-story partial additions or “pop-ups”, the Board noted that there have been more requests recently for this type of addition and it is time to have a work session on the topic and develop a policy. Until now, the approach has been to try to hide them and limit the visibility since the designs have not always been quite right. At this corner site, the top floor will be visible from many vantage points so there was uniform concern regarding the visibility of the third floor “pop-ups.” The Board did not have any concerns about the roof decks themselves.

The Board noted that there was general support for the proposed siting and the necessary waivers of the vision clearance and the setback requirements, consistent with the development of the block and neighborhood.

In summary, the following concerns and suggestions to incorporate for restudy were identified:

- Character
- Overall height
- Proportions
- Less historicist character but derive rhythm from block face and historic district
- Third-floor element – how to incorporate and design well (603 N Alfred unit is less successful because of L-shaped top)
- Rear elevations read as flat and need more articulation/to read as a volume
- Provide two fronts for the corner townhouse (Alfred St and Pendleton Street)

REASON

The Board expressed a number of concerns and deferred it for further study, though they noted that the project had the potential to be successful.

III. OTHER BUSINESS

The Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review discussed the following items:

1. BAR staff will schedule a work session regarding pop-ups with the entire Board of Architectural Review. BAR members should submit images of both successful and unsuccessful examples. After a work session with the entire BAR, it will be decided whether a sub-committee should be formed.
2. BAR staff circulated a sample of aluminum clad vinyl windows to be used at Ramsey Homes and asked the Board if this type of product could be considered as a viable option with the possibility of appending to an existing window policy. The BAR requested

additional information and did express some concerns, particularly regarding its life-span and how it would weather.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

The Parker-Gray Board of Architectural Review meeting was adjourned at 9:00pm.

V. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

BAR Case #2017-00219

Request for fence relocation at 624 N. Patrick St

Applicant: Jamie Fillmore

BAR Case #2017-00202

Request for stoop replacement at 334 N. West St

Applicant: Alexandria Housing and Redevelopment Authority

BAR Case #2017-00201

Request for stoop replacement at 332 N. West St

Applicant: Alexandria Housing and Redevelopment Authority

BAR Case #2017-00188

Request for a new fence at 408 N. Fayette St

Applicant: Kiersten Jensen

BAR Case #2017-00187

Request for fence replacement at 410 N. Fayette St

Applicant: Stacy Balk

BAR Case #2017-00184

Request for fence repair/replacement at 435 N. Fayette St

Applicant: Robert & Jennifer Palute

BAR Case #2017-00172 & #2016-00447

Request for window and siding replacement at 710 N. Patrick St

Applicant: Patricia Turner

BAR Case #2017-00173

Request for fence replacement and new deck at 1616 Boyle St

Applicant: Brian Lekander

BAR Case #2017-00220

Request for alterations at 410 N. Union St

Applicant: Stacy Carlson