

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, May 1, 2013
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Chip Carlin
Wayne Neale
Art Keleher

Members Absent: John von Senden
Oscar Fitzgerald
Peter Smeallie

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Mary Catherine Collins, Historic Preservation Planner

The meeting was called to order at 7:33 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of April 17, 2013.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 4-0.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Mr. Keleher, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 4-0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. Neal, the Consent Calendar was approved, 4-0.

1. CASE BAR2013-0092

Request for alterations at **203 Cameron St.**

APPLICANT: John R. Tyler & Karen K. Richardson

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 4-0.

2. CASE BAR2013-0096

Request for alterations at **524 Pitt St.**

APPLICANT: Sherry Schiller

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, on the Consent Calendar, 4-0.

3. CASE BAR2013-0098

Request for alterations at **739 Bernard St.**

APPLICANT: John Stanley by Warren L. Almquist, AIA

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 4-0

III. UNFINISHED BUSINESS AND ITEMS PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED

4. CASE BAR2013-0077

Request to partially demolish & capsulate at **418 S Pitt St.**

APPLICANT: Kevin T. & Halley M. Coyne by Stephen Kulinski, AIA

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 4-0**

Items 4 and 5 were combined for discussion purposes.

5. CASE BAR2013-0077

Request for addition & alterations at **418 S Pitt St.**

APPLICANT: Kevin T. & Halley M. Coyne by Stephen Kulinski, AIA

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, by a roll call vote, 4-0.**

SPEAKERS

Stephen Kulinski, architect for the applicant, presented the application as revised in response to the Board's comments at the previous hearing of April 17, 2013.

Hugh Van Horn, a resident of 416 S Pitt and neighbor immediately north of the applicant provided images of the view of the proposed addition from their rear yard. Mr. Van Horn said he was generally very supportive of the applicant's efforts to improve the property, but had reservations regarding the impact that the addition would have on the view from his property. He requested consideration of the Board and applicant to modify plans to lessen the impact of the "massive addition".

John Hynan, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation (HAF), acknowledged that there was now more information on the integrity and condition of the historic ell. HAF prefers the preservation of all three walls of the historic ell, but suggested that the existing roof be retained and play into the three-part segmented roof encouraged by Staff, at a minimum. He also said that HAF prefers a wood fence in the front, rather than metal.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Carlin stated that he supported Mr. Hynan's recommendations regarding the roofline and thought that the flounder form could be retained in some manner, adding that the wood fence is typical of the block and should be replaced in kind.

Mr. Keleher noted that the applicant has gone the extra mile to design a proposal that retains a significant amount of historic material, but asked why it was necessary to replace two of the three walls. Mr Kulinski replied that the floor of the ell did not align with the main body of the house and the ell had very low ceilings. However, he believed the shed roof of the proposed ell respected the existing ell form.

Mr. Neal, noting that he was absent at the previous meeting, posed questions regarding the roofline, clerestory windows, and retention of original material, adding that the he too would prefer a wood front fence.

On a motion by Mr. Neal, seconded by Mr. Keleher, the Board approved the application, 4-0 and deferred approval of the fence, which can be approved administratively by Staff as a replacement in kind.

REASON

The Board found that the applicant's proposal responded to preservation concerns raised at the previous hearing, retained sufficient historic material, and found the new shed roof ell form appropriate and consistent with the *Design Guidelines*.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

6. CASE BAR2013-0090

Request to partially demolish at **1 Prince St.**

APPLICANT: American Medical Group by John Fisher, Fisher Architects, PA

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as submitted, by a roll call vote, 4-0.**

Items 6 & 7 were combined for discussion purposes.

7. CASE BAR2013-0091

Request to for alterations at **1 Prince St.**

APPLICANT: American Medical Group by John Fisher, Fisher Architects, PA

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as submitted, by a roll call vote, 4-0.**

SPEAKERS

Chairman Hulfish stated that he was involved in the sale of the building and placement of the tenant, but that he no longer has any fiduciary interest in the building and would be voting on this case.

John Fisher, Fisher Architects, PA, supplied an updated image that showed the details and relationship of the proposed balcony and façade elements. He responded to Staff's recommendation by demonstrating that the proposed balcony size related to a garage opening on the ground level.

John Hynan, representing HAF, inquired as to whether or not the applicant agreed with the Staff recommendation. Mr. Fisher replied that they felt strongly the applicant's proposed design was the better option. Mr. Hynan stated that HAF supported Staff's recommendation.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Neale recalled that he previously worked on the project during its original construction and generally supported the application.

Mr. Keleher and Mr. Carlin voiced support of the proposal.

On a motion by Mr. Carlin, seconded by Mr. Keleher, the Board approved the application, as submitted, 4-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposal to be appropriate and consistent with the *Design Guidelines*.

8. **CASE BAR2013-0093**
Request to for alterations at **101 Princess St.**
APPLICANT: Allen E. Weh
BOARD ACTION: *Deferred prior to the hearing at the applicant's request*
9. **CASE BAR2013-0097**
Request to for signage at **277 S Washington St.**
APPLICANT: Daniel Isaac, Pompanoosuc Mills
BOARD ACTION: **Portions approved as amended and portions deferred for further study, 4-0.**

SPEAKERS

Daniel Isaac, Showroom Manager for Pompanoosuc Mills, spoke in support of the application and agreed with Staff's recommendations, but requested an additional vinyl decal sign on the second arched window bay on S. Columbus Street.

John Hynan, representing HAF, agreed with all recommendations of the Staff report and deferred comments to Staff regarding the applicant's proposed amendment to the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Carlin, seconded by Mr. Keleher, made a motion to approve the application, as amended, with deferral of sign master plan, 4-0.

REASON

The Board had minimal discussion on the application finding it to be appropriate and consistent with the *Design Guidelines*.

10. **CASE BAR2013-0094**
Request to partially demolish at **539 S Fairfax St.**
APPLICANT: Shirley Gustafson by Andrew Sheldon
BOARD ACTION: *Deferred prior to hearing at the applicant's request.*
11. **CASE BAR2013-0095**
Request for alterations at **539 S Fairfax St.**
APPLICANT: Shirley Gustafson by Andrew Sheldon
BOARD ACTION: *Deferred prior to hearing at the applicant's request.*

III. OTHER BUSINESS

The Board recognized Al Cox, Historic Preservation Manager, for his contributions to historic preservation in Alexandria and his recent receipt of a Special Merit Award presented by the Alexandria Historical Society.

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2013-0101

Request for a porch reconstruction at **1409 King St.**

APPLICANT: Katherine B. Edwards, KBE Holdings by H. Maginniss, Maginniss + del Ninno Architects, pc.

CASE BAR2013-0120

Request for signage at **103 S Union St.**

APPLICANT: Jennifer Hoang, NJI Media

CASE BAR2013-0127

Request for shutter replacement at **505 S Saint Asaph St.**

APPLICANT: Leonard & Casey Evans

CASE BAR2013-0130

Request for HVAC replacement at **708 Kahn Pl.**

APPLICANT: Marcus Nolden, Project Trade Services

CASE BAR2013-0132

Request for signage at **422 S Washington St.**

APPLICANT: Storie Olsen, Fountains Day Spa

CASE BAR2013-0138

Request for window replacement at **421 S Lee St.**

APPLICANT: Tricia Holley by TJ Moon, Old Town Windows & Doors

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:20pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Mary Catherine Collins, Historic Preservation Planner
Alexandria Boards of Architectural Review