

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, April 17, 2013
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Oscar Fitzgerald, Vice Chairman
Chip Carlin
John von Senden
Peter Smeallie
Art Keleher

Members Absent: Wayne Neale

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of April 4, 2013.

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 6-0.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

1. CASE BAR2013-0075

Request for alteration and signage at **326 King St.**

APPLICANT: Steve Ryan, Sur La Table by Jessica Harvey, SKB

BOARD ACTION: Removed from Consent Calendar and moved to end of docket.

On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the Board voted to remove this item from the consent calendar and place at the end of the docket due to lack of representation for the case.

III. NEW BUSINESS

2. CASE BAR2013-0076

Request for alterations at **634 South Pitt St.**

APPLICANT: George E. and Maria M. Charuhas by Stephanie R. Dimond, Dimond Adams Design Architecture

BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 6-0.

BOARD DISCUSSION

After assessing there was no public testimony or Board discussion, the Chairman called the question for the case and the Board voted to approve the application, as submitted, 6-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposed fence to be architecturally appropriate and in compliance with the *Design Guidelines*.

3. CASE BAR2012-0399

Request for alterations at **1103 Powhatan St.**

APPLICANT: Aloysius & Colleen Boyle

BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, 6-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. That the final SDL Fibrex or similar BAR approved material, *Full-Frame* window specifications will be approved by BAR staff in the field, to insure that they are made as large as practical, and that the windows still meet all other applicable requirements of the Board's *Window Policy* and the Alexandria Replacement Window Performance Specifications.
2. That the applicant permanently apply a wood or wood composite grid on the existing multi-light picture window or install a new Fibrex, SDL multi-light picture window, or another window approved by the BAR, will replace the existing interior muntin window installed on the first floor of the front elevation. If the picture window is not corrected by July 1, 2013, then the owner will not be in compliance with their Certificate of Appropriateness and fines may be assessed, as defined in the zoning ordinance.
3. That the new windows will match the existing window operation and configuration (ie. Double-Hung Sash, Casement, Fixed Sash, etc. will be replaced in-kind)

BOARD DISCUSSION

After a brief discussion by the Board clarifying the revised staff recommendations and assessing that there was no public testimony, Mr. von Senden made a motion to approve the case per staff's revised recommendations. Mr. Smeallie seconded the motion and the Board voted to approve the application, as amended, 6-0.

REASON

The Board concurred with Staff's findings that the subject building lacks architectural or historical significance to the district and primarily serves as a background building to the George Washington Parkway. They found the use of stylistically appropriate, high quality modern

materials building to be appropriate for this c1940s, in this location, and in compliance with the *Design Guidelines*.

4. CASE BAR2013-0077

Request for partially demolish & capsule at **418 S Pitt St.**

APPLICANT: Kevin T. & Halley M. Coyne by Stephen Kulinski, AIA

BOARD ACTION: Docket #4 and #5 were combined.

5. CASE BAR2013-0078

Request for addition & alterations at **418 S Pitt St.**

APPLICANT: Kevin T. & Halley M. Coyne by Stephen Kulinski, AIA

BOARD ACTION: Deferred to research age of addition, 6-0.

SPEAKERS

Steve Kulinski, Architect for the applicant, presented the case.

Mr. Coyne, owner and licensed structural engineer, described the structural condition of the ell and its history, noting that the ell's brick foundation does not contain footers. He provided the Board with copies of the Sanborn Fire Insurance Map research he had done on the property. Based on his findings, he concluded the age of the ell to be late 1930s to early 1940s.

John Hynan, representative of Historic Alexandria Foundation, requested a deferral in order to research the age of the ell and restudy the design. He expressed that it was the Foundation's desire to keep all three walls. Mr. Hynan concluded his testimony with offering the Foundation's services to help staff with research.

Gayle Rothrock, 209 Duke Street, expressed concern about language in the staff report on page 5 which states "Staff recommends that the applicant retain and preserve, at a minimum, the entire north wall as much of the remaining exterior walls and materials as possible." She noted that she would like to see the applicant save all portions of the ell which are over 50 years old.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. von Senden noted that even if the ell was constructed in the 1930s, it was still over 50 years old and could potentially be considered historic. He also stated that foundation spread footings are 20th century not 19th century and, in his mind, Sanborn maps are useful tools to assist in dating a structure, but they are not infallible.

Mr. Carlin recalled that cutting the rot off the bottom of the structural members of the ell to replace the sill plate and sister the studs and to install a new footing was common practice in the 1960's in Alexandria and could be appropriate here, as well. He stated that he supports staff recommendation.

Mr. Kulinski responded by expressing that there was very little historic material left in the walls of the ell.

Mr. Fitzgerald questioned staff's opinion about the percentage of original fabric remaining on the ell.

Mr. Cox stated that he had not personally been to the site, but, that Staff's site visits had found that the ell contained balloon framing, historic wood siding secured with cut nails and windows with cylinder glass, which dated the addition to at least the late 19th century.

Mr. Smeallie said that he would be flexible with the design of a new addition. However, felt more information on the existing ell's history was needed before proceeding with its review.

Mr. Keleher was concerned with the testimony provided regarding the accuracy of Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. He noted that there might not be much left on the ell to repair and made a motion to defer the application in order for the staff to research the history of the ell and for the design team to refine the design of the addition to be more compatible with the existing ell.

REASON

The Board deferred the application in order for BAR staff to research the history of the ell and for the design team to refine the design of the addition to be more compatible with the existing ell.

6. CASE BAR2013-0075

Request for alteration and signage at **326 King St.**

APPLICANT: Steve Ryan, Sur La Table by Jessica Harvey, SKB

BOARD ACTION: Approve, as amended, 6-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. That the master sign plan required by the BAR for this building include the following:
 - a. That when the existing second floor office tenant's lease expires in 2017, the only permitted signage for the second floor commercial space will be a wall plaque or hanging sign located on the west elevation, adjacent to the entrance to that commercial space, measuring no more than 7 square feet total. If the existing fire stair on the King Street elevation becomes an active entrance for a second commercial tenant on the second floor, a wall plaque or hanging sign, adjacent to that new entrance, measuring no more than 7 square feet total, is permitted.
 - b. The first floor retail tenant will be permitted (1) pin-mounted letters on the north elevation located between the stringcourse and second story windows, centered above the entrance; (2) pin-mounted letters on the west elevation located between the first and second stories;
 - c. (3) one hanging sign less than 7 square feet; and (4) a wall plaque of less than five square feet adjacent to the front entrance.
2. That once the Long and Foster Realtors sign on the north façade is removed, that "Sur La Table" pin-mounted letters be installed above the entrance between the stringcourse and second-story window sill and that the presently proposed sign over the entrance be removed.
3. That all signs and lettering be mounted through the mortar joints and not through the brick.
4. That the Sur La Table sign on the west end of the building must be white aluminum, reverse-channel letters measuring approximately 1'-6" tall by 8'-7" long, pin-mounted mounted to mortar joints in the brick wall and illuminated with mini bullet lights.

SPEAKERS

George Rizk, the agent for the applicant EastBank, spoke in support of the application and staff recommendations.

BOARD DISCUSSION

After a brief discussion by the Board found that the proposed wall sign on the west elevation was too large and they proposed that it be reduced to the same size and design as the future reverse-channel letter wall sign to be located over the entrance door on the King Street elevation. The Applicant's agent agreed to the change to the design.

Mr. Smeallie made a motion to approve the case per Staff's recommendations with the additional condition that the "Sur La Table sign on the west end of the building must be white aluminum, reverse-channel letters measuring approximately 1' - 6" tall by 8' - 7" long, pin-mounted mounted to mortar joints in the brick wall and illuminated with mini bullet lights." Mr. Fitzgerald seconded the motion and the Board voted to approve the application, as amended, 6-0.

REASON

The Board found that a conditional sign master plan was appropriate for this building.

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2013-0089

Request for fence replacement & a shed at **1 Potomac Ct.**

APPLICANT: Bob Steltenpohl & Christina Bembenek

CASE BAR2013-0099

Request for window replacement at **1212A King St.**

APPLICANT: Leona B. Lemeshewsky

CASE BAR2013-0100

Request for fence replacement at **916 Prince St.**

APPLICANT: Frankie Hughes

CASE BAR2013-0102

Request for signage at **1309 King St.**

APPLICANT: Aida Spa

CASE BAR2013-0106

Request for a storm door at **1316 Duke St.**

APPLICANT: Jonathan Brooks

CASE BAR2013-0107

Request for door and transom replacement at **100 Queen St.**

APPLICANT: Susan Howells by Old Town Windows & Doors

CASE BAR2013-0108

Request for roof replacement at **221 Jefferson St.**

APPLICANT: Thomas McIntyre by Paul Davis Restorations

CASE BAR2013-0109

Request for fence replacement at **422 Queen St.**

APPLICANT: Jean Waterman

CASE BAR2013-0111

Request for HVAC & screening replacement at **600 Ford's Landing Way.**

APPLICANT: Ellen Fu

CASE BAR2013-0112

Request for signage at **110 S Columbus St.**

APPLICANT: Salter Mitchell

CASE BAR2013-0115

Request for roof replacement at **223 Princess St.**

APPLICANT: Patrick Butler by David Cole, Cole Roofing

IV. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:35pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Boards of Architectural Review